1	JOHN D. JACOBS, Cal. Bar No. 134154
2	BARBARA CHUŃ, Cal. Bar No. 186907 Federal Trade Commission
3	10877 Wilshire Blvd., Ste. 700 Los Angeles, CA 90024
4	(310) 824-4343 (ph.) (310) 824-4380 (fax)
5	Attorneys for Plaintiff FTC
6	
7	
8	INITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
10	Federal Trade Commission,  Case No. SACV-06-701 DOC (RNBx)
11	Plaintiff,  STIPULATED FINAL ORDER AS TO DEFENDANTS FINANCIAL
12	) LIBERTY SERVICES, LLC,
13	V. ) HOMELAND FINANCIAL SERVICES, NATIONAL SUPPORT Dennis Connelly, et al., ) SERVICES, LLC, AND UNITED
14	Dennis Connelly, et al.,  Defendants.  Defendants.  Defendants.  Defendants.  Defendants.  Defendants.
15	)
16	
17	BACKGROUND
18	On August 3, 2006, Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission (FTC or
19	Commission), pursuant to Section 13(b) of the Federal Trade Commission Act (FTC
20	Act), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), filed a complaint against, inter alia, Defendants Homeland
21	Financial Services (Homeland), National Support Services, LLC (NSS), and United
22	Debt Recovery, LLC (UDR). On November 27, 2006, Plaintiff filed its First
23	Amended Complaint, which, inter alia, added Financial Liberty Services (FLS) as a
24	defendant.
25	Plaintiff FTC and Defendants FLS, Homeland, NSS and UDR (Defendants)
26	have agreed to entry of this Stipulated Final Order for Permanent Injunction and
27	Other Equitable Relief (Order) by the Court to resolve all charges against Defendants
28	set forth in the First Amended Complaint and all matters in dispute between Plaintiff

Case 8:06-cv-00701-DOC-RNB Document 431-2 Filed 09/15/2008 Page 1 of 15

# 7 8

9

11

10

12 13

14

16

15

17 18

19

20

21 22

23 24

25

26

28

27

and the Defendants in this action. Defendants have consented to entry of this Order without trial or adjudication of any issue of law or fact herein and have agreed that entry of this Order in the docket by the Court will constitute notice to them of the terms and conditions of the Order. Plaintiff and Defendants having requested the Court to enter this Order, the Court hereby finds and orders as follows:

## FINDINGS OF FACT

- Defendants were properly served with the Complaint, Summons, TRO 1. and First Amended Complaint in this matter.
- Defendants were properly served with the Preliminary Injunction in this 2. matter.
- This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the case and 3. personal jurisdiction over Defendants. Venue in the Central District of California is proper.
- 4. The alleged actions of Defendants are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. The allegations of the Complaint and the First Amended Complaint state a claim upon which relief can be granted against Defendants under Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).
- Plaintiff has the authority under Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 6. U.S.C. § 53(b), to seek the relief it has requested.
- 7. Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
- 8. Defendants waive any claim that they may hold against the Commission, its employees, representatives or agents.
- 9. Defendants waive any claim that they may hold under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412 (as amended), concerning the prosecution of this

///

- action to the date of this Order, and any rights to attorneys' fees that may arise under said provision of law.
  - 10. All parties shall bear their own costs and attorneys' fees.
- 11. This Order is remedial in nature and shall not be construed as the payment of a fine, penalty, punitive assessment, or forfeiture.
- 12. Entry of this Order is in the public interest and in the interest of the parties.

### **DEFINITIONS**

For purposes of this order, the following **Definitions** apply:

- 1. "**Document**" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of the term in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, audio and video recordings, electronic email, computer records, and other data compilations from which information can be obtained and translated, if necessary, through detection devices into reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate "document" within the meaning of the term.
  - 2. "Receiver" means Robb Evans & Associates, LLC.
- 3. "<u>Defendants</u>" means Defendants FINANCIAL LIBERTY SERVICES, LLC, HOMELAND FINANCIAL SERVICES, NATIONAL SUPPORT SERVICES, LLC, UNITED DEBT RECOVERY, LLC, their successors and assigns, and each of them.
- 4. "Receivership Defendants" means Defendants FINANCIAL LIBERTY SERVICES, LLC, HOMELAND FINANCIAL SERVICES, NATIONAL SUPPORT SERVICES, LLC, UNITED DEBT RECOVERY, LLC, as well as FEDERAL REVERSE MORTGAGE, and their successors and assigns, and each of them.

## 5. The term "debt negotiation" means

- a) the business or practice of receiving, in return for consideration, or the scheduled receipt, of an individual consumer's monies, or evidences thereof, for the purpose of distribution among certain specified creditors in payment, or partial payment, of the individual consumer's obligations; or
- b) the business or practice of acting or offering or attempting to act as an intermediary between an individual consumer and his creditors for the purpose of settling, negotiating, or in any way altering the terms of payment of any debt of an individual consumer.
- 6. "<u>Assisting others</u>" means providing any of the following goods or services to another person or entity:
  - a) performing customer service functions, including, but not limited to, receiving or responding to consumer complaints; or
  - b) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any telephone sales script or any other marketing material; or
  - c) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers; or
  - d) performing marketing services of any kind.

# **ORDER**

I.

## PROHIBITED BUSINESS ACTIVITIES

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Defendants, their agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities who are in active concert or

participation with any of the Defendants and who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promoting, offering for sale, or sale of any good or service, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from falsely representing, expressly or by implication, or from assisting others who are falsely representing, any of the following:

- A. That by enrolling in any debt-negotiation program, it is likely that consumers will be able to pay off their credit-card or other unsecured debts for a substantially reduced amount, such as 40 to 60 percent of the total amount owed to their creditors; or
- B. That consumers' creditors are likely to negotiate settlements under which the creditors will agree to accept substantially less than the amount the consumer owes on an account to settle the account; or
- C. That the Defendant or its representatives or any other person operating a debt-negotiation program is able to negotiate more favorable settlements with consumers' creditors than the consumer can negotiate himself; or
- D. That the Defendant or its representatives or any other person operating a debt-negotiation program has an established relationship with any creditor that gives the Defendant, representative, or person an advantage in negotiating favorable settlements with the creditor; or
- E. That any negative information that appears on a consumer's credit report as a result of participating in any debt-negotiation program will be removed upon completion of the program or shortly thereafter; or
- F. That any negative effect from participating in any debt-negotiation program on a consumer's credit rating, credit score or credit report is likely to be either minimal or short-term; or

- G. That creditors are unlikely to sue consumers who participate in any debt-negotiation program or who otherwise fail to make their minimum monthly payments to their creditors; or
- H. That participating in any debt-negotiation program is likely to end most or all harassment or contact from creditors; or
- I. That consumer's creditors will stop harassing consumers or will not harass consumers who participate in any debt-negotiation program; or
- J. That consumers' creditors will not contact the consumer after a
  consumer sends the creditor a notice to cease contacting the consumer;
  or
- K. That consumers who participate in any debt-negotiation program do not need to worry about balances on their credit accounts increasing while they are in the program; or
- L. That the Defendant or its representative or any other person will begin negotiating with all of a consumer's creditors immediately upon the consumer's enrollment in any debt-negotiation program; or
- M. Any other fact material to a consumer's decision to participate in any debt-negotiation, debt reduction or debt management program; or
- N. Any other fact material to a consumer's decision to purchase any good or service.

#### II.

### PROHIBITION AGAINST MATERIAL OMISSIONS

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendants, their agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities who are in active concert or participation with any of the Defendants and who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the advertising, promotion,

12

10

13 14

> 15 16

17

18

19 20

21 22

23 24

25

26

27

28

- offering for sale or sale of debt negotiation services or credit-related products, programs or services, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from failing to disclose, clearly and conspicuously, prior to the time when a consumer purchases such service or product, all information material to a consumer's decision to buy any debt negotiation services or credit-related products, programs, or services, including but not limited to the following information, where appropriate:
  - The possibility that, if consumers stop paying their creditors, one or A. more of their creditors may sue the consumer;
  - В. The fact that federal law prohibits creditors from misrepresenting a consumer's payment history to credit reporting agencies, and that creditors are permitted to report accurate negative information such as delinquencies and charge-offs for seven years; and
  - C. The fact that when consumers stop paying their creditors, the balances on their credit accounts will increase as a result of: interest accruing on their accounts; increases to their interest rate; and the imposition of late fees and other charges.

#### III.

#### RECEIVERSHIP

#### **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that:

- The Receiver shall continue serving as Receiver until further order of **A.** this Court, with all of the same rights, duties and powers as set forth in the October 13, 2006 Preliminary Injunction which appointed Robb Evans & Associates as Permanent Receiver over Defendants.
- The Receiver is expressly authorized and directed to engage in all В. reasonable means to collect any debts that are owed to any of the Receivership Defendants, including but not limited to any and all debts owed by Nationwide Support Services, LLC, or Joanne Garneau.

- C. The Receiver is further expressly authorized and directed to liquidate any and all remaining assets of the Receivership Defendants.
- D. In addition to liquidating assets and collecting debts owed to Defendants, the Receiver shall finalize the affairs of the receivership estate as expeditiously as possible.
- E. Upon finalization of all business of the receivership estate, including collection of all debts and liquidation of all assets, the Receiver shall submit a final report to the Court together with a request for termination of the receivership and discharge.
- F. Upon termination of the receivership, the Receiver may dispose of any remaining records and documents of the Receivership Defendants as the Receiver sees fit.

### IV.

### **MONETARY RELIEF**

### **IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that:

- A. Each of the Receivership Defendants, through the Receiver, shall pay to the FTC all funds that are in the Receivership Defendant's possession after payment of receivership fees and expenses approved by the Court;
- 1. Within five days after entry of this Order, the Receiver shall pay to the FTC all funds then in the Receivership Defendant's possession, less any funds that the Receiver deems necessary to hold in reserve for accrued but unpaid receivership fees and expenses, as well as anticipated future fees and expenses;
- 2. Within five days after entry of an order terminating the receivership (pursuant to Section III above), the Receiver shall pay to the FTC all remaining funds of the Receivership Defendants, less any fees and expenses that the Court has approved;

- B. All funds paid pursuant to this Paragraph shall be deposited into a fund administered by the Commission or its agent to be used for equitable relief, including but not limited to restitution and any attendant expenses for the administration of any restitution fund. In the event that direct restitution to consumers is wholly or partially impracticable or funds remain after restitution is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to the practices alleged in the Complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited to the Department of the Treasury as disgorgement and not as a fine or penalty. The Commission shall have full and sole discretion to:
  - Determine the criteria for participation by individual claimants in any consumer restitution program implemented pursuant to this Order;
  - 2. Determine the manner and timing of any notices to be given to consumers regarding the existence and terms of such programs, and
  - 3. Delegate any and all tasks connected with such restitution program to any individual, partnerships, or corporations; and pay reasonable fees, salaries, and expenses incurred thereby from the payments made pursuant to this Order;
- C. Defendants expressly waive any rights they may possess to litigate the issue of monetary relief. Defendants acknowledge and agree that all money paid pursuant to this Order is irrevocably paid to the Commission for purposes of settlement between Plaintiff and Defendants; and
- D. Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Paragraph.

V.

### **COMPLIANCE MONITORING**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Order:

- A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendants each shall submit additional written reports, which are true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in each such Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business operation;
- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to use all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
  - 1. Obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, 45, and 69; and
  - 2. Posing as consumers and suppliers to Defendants, their employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by any Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice; and
- C. Defendants each shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.

*Provided, however,* that nothing in this Order shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)).

## 

#### VI.

### **COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANTS**

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be monitored:

- A. Defendants shall, for a period of five (5) years after the date of entry of this Order, notify the Commission of any changes in structure of any of the Defendants or any business entity that any Defendant directly or indirectly controls, or has an ownership interest in, that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Order, including but not limited to: incorporation or other organization; a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Order; or a change in the business name or address, at least thirty (30) days prior to such change, provided that, with respect to any proposed change in the business entity about which a Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, such Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as is practicable after obtaining such knowledge;
- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order and annually thereafter for a period of five (5) years, Defendants shall each provide a written report to the FTC, which is true and accurate and sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which the Defendant has complied and is complying with this Order. This report shall include, but not be limited to:
  - 1. A copy of each acknowledgment of receipt of this Order, obtained pursuant to Paragraph VIII.B, below; and
  - 2. Any other changes required to be reported under Subparagraph A of this Paragraph;

*Provided, however*, that this requirement shall not apply to the Receiver if the receivership has not been terminated as of 180 days after the date of entry of this Order;

- C. Each Defendant shall notify the Commission of the filing of a bankruptcy petition by such Defendant within fifteen (15) days of filing;
- D. For the purposes of this Order, Defendants shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, send all reports and notifications required by this Order to the Commission by overnight courier, using the following address:

Associate Director of Enforcement Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Room NJ2122 Washington, D.C. 20580

Re: FTC v. Dennis Connelly et al., Civil Action No. SACV-06-0701 DOC

*Provided that,* in lieu of overnight courier, Defendants may send such reports or notifications by first-class mail, but only if Defendants contemporaneously send an electronic version of such report or notification to the Commission at: DEBrief@ftc.gov.

E. For purposes of the compliance reporting and monitoring required by this Order, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with each Defendant.

#### VII.

### RECORD KEEPING PROVISIONS

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of eight (8) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendants, their agents, servants, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities who are in active concert or participation with any of the Defendants and who receive actual notice of this Order by personal

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, email (if any) and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; and the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly, indirectly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all sales scripts, training materials, advertisements, website printouts, or other marketing materials; and
- F. All records and documents necessary to demonstrate full compliance with each provision of this Order, including but not limited to, copies of acknowledgments of receipt of this Order, required by Paragraph VIII.B, below, and all reports submitted to the FTC pursuant to Paragraph VI.B, above.

### VIII.

### DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER BY DEFENDANTS

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of five (5) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendants shall deliver copies of this Order as directed below:

- 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25
- Each of the Defendants must deliver a copy of this Order to (1) all of its A. principals, officers, directors, and managers, (2) all of its employees, agents, and representatives who engage in conduct related to the subject matter of the Order, and (3) any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Paragraph VI.A above. For current personnel, delivery shall be within five (5) days of service of this Order upon such Defendant. For new personnel, delivery shall occur prior to them assuming their responsibilities. For any business entity resulting from any change in structure set forth in Paragraph VI.A, delivery shall be at least ten (10) days prior to the change in structure.
- Each of the Defendants must secure a signed and dated statement B. acknowledging receipt of the Order, within thirty (30) days of delivery, from all persons receiving a copy of the Order pursuant to this Paragraph.

#### IX.

# ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER **BY DEFENDANTS**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days of receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, each Defendant must submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement acknowledging receipt of this Order.

#### X.

### **SEVERABILITY**

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the provisions of this Order are separate and severable from one another. If any provision is stayed or determined to be invalid, all of the remaining provisions shall remain in full force and effect.

///

26

27

#### XI.

### RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of construction, modification and enforcement of this Order.

### SO STIPULATED:

Dated: 8/13/

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

Dated: Jept. 15, 2008

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Laber D. Laber D.

John D. Jacobs

Jennifer Larabee

Barbara Y.K. Chun

Attorneys for Plaintiff FTC

### **DEFENDANTS:**

**PLAINTIFF:** 

FINANCIAL LIBERTY SERVICES, LLC.

By: Kenton Johnson, Deputy Receiver Robb Evans & Associates, LLC Receiver of Financial Liberty Services, LLC

HOMELAND FINANCIAL SERVICES

By: Kenton Johnson, Deputy Receiver Robb Evans & Associates, LLC Receiver of Homeland Financial Services

NATIONAL SUPPORT SERVICES, LLC

By: Kenton Johnson, Deputy Receiver Robb Evans & Associates, LLC

Receiver of National Support Services, LLC

UNITED DEBT RECOVERY, LLC

Cluter Colinson

By: Kenton Johnson, Deputy Receiver Robb Evans & Associates, LLC Receiver of United Debt Recovery, LLC

### SO ORDERED:

The Honorable David O. Carter
United States District Judge