



Cathy M. Ellington 404-504-5424 cme@mmmlaw.com www.mmmlaw.com

May 24, 2013

VIA FEDERAL EXPRESS

Phone: 202-326-2021 Donald S. Clark, Secretary of the Commission Federal Trade Commission Room H-172 600 Pennsylvania Avenie, NW Washington, D.C. 20580 Judge D. Michael Chappell Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Room H-110 Washington, D.C. 10580

In Re: <u>Phoebe Putney Health System, Inc. et al.</u>, Docket No. 9348 Submission of Notices of Response to Subpoenas

Dear Honorable Judge Chappell and Secretary Clark:

Please find enclosed service copies of our client's Notice of Response to Phoebe Putney Health System Inc.'s April 26, 2013 Subpoena for the following entities in the above-referenced matter:

- (1) Evans Memorial Hospital;
- (2) Hutcheson Medical Center
- (3) Irwin County Hospital
- (4) Murray Medical Center.

If you need any additional information or have any questions, please contact me and I will forward any requested information immediately.

Sincerely,

MORRIS, MANNING & MARTIN, LLP

Cathy M. Ellington

Paralegal for Robert C. Threlkeld

Enclosure

MORRIS, MANNING & MARTIN, LLP
May 24, 2013
Donald S. Clark, Secretary of the Commission
And Judge D. Michael Chappell
Page 2

cc: Robert C. Threlkeld, Esq. (w/o encl.)
Michele P. Madison, Esq. (w/o encl.)
Dana S. Durrett, Esq. (w/o encl.)
Ryan C. Burke, Esq. (w/o encl.)
Counsel of Record in Adjudicative Proceeding (w/enclosures)

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

ORIGINAL
SECRETARY

Docket No. 9348

In the Matter of:)
PHOEBE PUTNEY HEALTH SYSTEM, INC.,)
PHOEBE PUTNEY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL, INC.,)
PHOEBE NORTH, INC.,)
HCA INC.,)
PALMYRA PARK HOSPITAL, INC., and)
HOSPITAL AUTHORITY OF ALBANY- DOUGHERTY COUNTY.)
	,

IRWIN COUNTY HOSPITAL'S NOTICE OF RESPONSE TO PHOEBE PUTNEY HEALTH SYSTEM, INC.'S APRIL 26, 2013 SUBPOENA

COMES NOW, Irwin County Hospital ("Irwin") and respectfully files this Notice of Response to Phoebe Putney Health System, Inc.'s ("Phoebe") April 26, 2013 Subpoena. Irwin respectfully states as follows:

Phoebe issued a Subpoena dated April 26, 2013 (the "Subpoena") to Irwin, a third-party to this adjudicative proceeding. The Subpoena sought the production of documents through four enumerated requests:

- 1. All documents relating to the Transaction, including but not limited to, all documents sent to or received from the FTC, and all documents relating to communications with the FTC.
- 2. All documents relating to Phoebe or Palmyra.
- 3. Since 2006, all audited or other financial statements or materials for Your Hospital prepared for either internal use or presented to third parties, (e.g., the Georgia Department of Community Health, the Georgia Hospital Association, potential investors or lenders, investment banks).

4. All Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations ("JCAHO") or other periodic reviews performed by any organization that assigned a "quality

rating" or "quality-score" to Your Hospital. Subpoena Requests Nos. 1-4.

Following extensive negotiations with Phoebe, Phoebe agreed on May 10, 2013 to limit

the Subpoena as set forth in Exhibit A. Phoebe withdrew Requests Nos. 1, 2, and 4, and limited

Request No. 3. Request No. 3 now seeks only "one copy" of existing year-end summary

financial statements for the years 2010, 2011, and 2012 for Irwin. These financial statements are

to be audited hospital-level financial statements, if those exist, otherwise an entity may produce

unaudited hospital-level financial statements.

Irwin hereby gives notice that it is producing existing audited hospital-level financial

statements for 2010 and 2011 responsive to this amended Request No. 3. Year 2012 does not yet

exist. Irwin notes that it is producing these documents pursuant to the protections of the April

21, 2011 Protective Order Governing Discovery Material issued by the Federal Trade

Commission Office of Administrative Law Judges, and understands that these documents will be

so treated as confidential.

This 24th day of May, 2013.

MORRIS, MANNING & MARTIN, LLP

D.,,

Robert C. Threlkeld Georgia Bar No. 710760

D.C. Bar No. 416563

Dana S. Durrett

Georgia Bar No. 141742

1600 Atlanta Financial Center 3343 Peachtree Road, NE Atlanta, Georgia 30326 Telephone: (404) 233-7000

Fax: (404) 365-9532

Exhibit "A"

DOCUMENTS TO BE PRODUCED

- 1. All documents relating to the Transaction, including but not limited to, all documents sent to or received from the FTC, and all documents relating to communications with the FTC.
- 2. All documents relating to Phoebe or Palmyra.
- 3. Since 2006, all audited or other financial statements or materials for Your Hospital prepared for either internal use or presented to third parties, (e.g., the Georgia Department of Community Health, the Georgia Hospital Association, potential investors or lenders, investment banks).

As offered previously and clarified during our call yesterday, 5/7/13, this request is now limited to financial statements prepared since January 1, 2010 and is further limited to audited hospital-level data, to the extent that it exists. If hospital-level audited data is unavailable, year-end summary hospital-level financial statements, even if unaudited are preferable to audited consolidated financial statements such as those sometimes created for health systems. In addition, the request no longer seeks "all" such documents; we request only one-copy of each.

4. All Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations ("JCAHO") or other periodic reviews performed by any organization that assigned a "quality rating" or "quality-score" to Your Hospital.

After discussions with GHA and after consulting with our expert, we will no longer be seeking to enforce Requests 12 of the long-form subpoena, and Request 4 of the short-form subpoena ("All Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations . .").

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:)
PHOEBE PUTNEY HEALTH SYSTEM, INC.,)
PHOEBE PUTNEY MEMORIAL HOSPITAL, INC.,))) Docket No. 9348
PHOEBE NORTH, INC.,) Docket No. 7546
HCA INC.,)
PALMYRA PARK HOSPITAL, INC., and)
HOSPITAL AUTHORITY OF ALBANY- DOUGHERTY COUNTY.)
)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

This is to certify that I have this day served counsel for the foregoing matter with a true and correct copy of the within and foregoing "Notice of Response to Phoebe Putney Health System, Inc.'s April 26, 2013 Subpoena" via electronic mail and United States Mail with sufficient postage affixed thereto, addressed to:

Amanda Lewis

Federal Trade Commission

600 Pennsylvania Ave

Washington, DC 20580

Email: alewis1@ftc.gov

Christopher Abbott

Federal Trade Commission

600 Pennsylvania Ave

Washington, DC 20580

Email: cabbott@ftc.gov

Douglas E. Litvack

Federal Trade Commission

600 Pennsylvania Ave

Washington, DC 20580

Email: dlitvack@ftc.gov

Edward D. Hassi

Federal Trade Commission

600 Pennsylvania Ave NW

Washington, DC 20580

Email: ehassi@ftc.gov

Jeffrey H. Perry

Federal Trade Commission

600 Pennsylvania Ave

Washington, DC 20580

Email: jperry@ftc.gov

Lucas Ballet

Federal Trade Commission

600 Pennsylvania Ave

Washington, DC 20580

Email: jballet@ftc.gov

Maria M. Dimoscato Federal Trade Commission 601 New Jersey Ave NW Washington, DC 20580 Email: mdimoscato@ftc.gov

Emmet J. Bondurant, II 1201 West Peachtree Street, N.W. 3900 One Atlantic Center Atlanta, GA 30309 Email: bondurant@bmelaw.com

Lee K. Van Voorhis; Katherine I. Funk; Brian F. Burke; Jennifer A. Semko; John J. Fedele; Teisha C. Johnson Brian Rafkin; Jeremy W. Cline Baker & McKenzie, LLP 815 Connecticut Avenue, NW

Lee K. Van Voorhis; Katherine I. Funk; Brian F. Burke; Jennifer A. Semko; John J. Fedele; Teisha C. Johnson Brian Rafkin; Jeremy W. Cline Baker & McKenzie, LLP 815 Connecticut Avenue, NW

This 24th day of May, 2013.

Sara Y. Razi Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Ave NW Washington, DC Email: srazi@ftc.gov

Kevin James Arquit, Esq. Simpson, Thacher & Bartlett, LLP 425 Lexington Avenue New York, New York 10017-3954 karquit@stblaw.com

Judge D. Michael Chappell Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Room H-110 Washington, D.C. 20580

Donald S. Clark – Secretary of the Commission Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Room H-113 Washington, D.C. 20580

Dana S. Durrett