#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSIO

COMMISSIONERS: Edith Ramirez, Chairwoman Maureen K. Ohlhausen

Terrell McSweeny

584380

ORIGINAL

In the Matter of

The Penn State Hershey Medical Center, a corporation,

and

Pinnacle Health System, a corporation.

Docket No. 9368

PUBLIC DOCUMENT

#### JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT

Complaint Counsel and Respondents, Penn State Hershey Medical Center and Pinnacle Health System, jointly move to dismiss the complaint in the above-captioned matter. On October 14, 2016, Respondents informed Complaint Counsel that they are abandoning the proposed combination of Penn State Hershey Medical Center and Pinnacle Health System. The Hart-Scott-Rodino filing for this proposed merger has expired and, as set forth in the attached press releases, Respondents have ended their efforts to pursue the proposed merger. Accordingly, the complaint is now moot.

The parties therefore respectfully request that the Commission dismiss the complaint. A proposed order is attached.

Dated: October 19, 2016 Respectfully submitted,

#### /s/ William H. Efron

William H. Efron Jared P. Nagley Geralyn J. Trujillo Ryan F. Harsch Jonathan W. Platt Nancy Turnblacer Theodore Zang Gerald A. Stein Peggy Bayer Femenella BUREAU OF COMPETITION FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION NORTHEAST REGION One Bowling Green, Suite 318 New York, NY 10004 wefron@ftc.gov T: (212) 607-2829 F: (212) 607-2822

Counsel Supporting the Complaint

#### /s/ Adrian Wager-Zito

Adrian Wager-Zito
Kenneth W. Field
Julie E. McEvoy
Christopher N. Thatch
William D. Coglianese
JONES DAY
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20001-2113
adrianwagerzito@jonesday.com
T: (202) 879-3939
F: (202) 626-1700

Counsel for Respondents
Penn State Hershey Medical Center
& Pinnacle Health System

#### UNITED STATES OF AMERICA BEFORE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of

The Penn State Hershey Medical Center, a corporation,

and

Pinnacle Health System, a corporation.

SO ORDERED.

Docket No. 9368

PUBLIC DOCUMENT

### [PROPOSED] ORDER GRANTING JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT

This matter having come before the Commission upon Complaint Counsel and Respondents' Joint Motion to Dismiss the Complaint, and having considered the positions of all parties, it is hereby ORDERED that the motion is GRANTED and the complaint is dismissed without prejudice.

Date:			

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on October 19, 2016, I filed the foregoing document electronically using the FTC's E-Filing System, which will send notification of such filing to:

Donald S. Clark
Secretary
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
600 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Rm. H-113

Washington, DC 20580

The Honorable D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Rm. H-110 Washington, DC 20580

William H. Efron
Jared P. Nagley
Geralyn J. Trujillo
Ryan F. Harsch
Jonathan W. Platt
Nancy Turnblacer
Theodore Zang
Gerald A. Stein
Peggy Bayer Femenella
BUREAU OF COMPETITION
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
NORTHEAST REGION
One Bowling Green, Suite 318
New York, NY 10004
wefron@ftc.gov
T: (212) 607 2829

T: (212) 607-2829 F: (212) 607-2822

Counsel Supporting the Complaint Federal Trade Commission

#### **CERTIFICATE FOR ELECTRONIC FILING**

I certify that the electronic copy sent to the Secretary of the Commission is a true and correct copy of the paper original and that I possess a paper original of the signed documents that is available for review by the parties and the adjudicator.

Dated: October 19, 2016	/s/ Adrian Wager-Zito		
	Adrian Wager-Zito		

#### **ATTACHMENT**

## PinnacleHealth, Milton S. Hershey Medical Center end integration efforts







On Sept. 27, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit ruled in favor of the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) and Pennsylvania Attorney General's Office (AG).

October 14, 2016Penn State Health News

The Court overturned the May 9 decision by Judge John Jones, U.S. District Court for the Middle District of Pennsylvania, and in doing so granted the FTC and AG an injunction to prevent the integration of the Milton S. Hershey Medical Center and PinnacleHealth.

We are disappointed by the Court's decision. We firmly believe the integration of our two health systems would have served the best interests of patients and the entire central Pennsylvania community. But given the time and cost associated with continuing litigation, PinnacleHealth and the Milton S. Hershey Medical Center have decided to bring our integration efforts to a close.

While we pursued plans for our integration, PinnacleHealth and the Hershey Medical Center enjoyed a positive and collaborative working relationship. Where circumstances allow and where it makes the most sense for our patients, we will continue to collaborate in the future.

We are deeply grateful for the enthusiasm shown by the many employers, community physicians, commercial insurance providers, community leaders and others who have recognized the benefits of our proposed integration and demonstrated their broad support for it.

Both organizations remain firmly committed to controlling healthcare costs, increasing access to needed services, and improving the quality and safety of healthcare in our region.

If you're having trouble accessing this content, or would like it in another format, please <u>email Penn</u>
<u>State Health Marketing & Communications.</u>

#### **Share this story**

Subscribe to our email newsletter

# Update on Proposed PinnacleHealth and Hershey Medical Center Integration

On September 27, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit ruled in favor of the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) and Pennsylvania Attorney General's Office (AG).

The Court overturned the May 9 decision by Judge John Jones, U.S. District Court for the Middle District of Pennsylvania, and in doing so granted the FTC and AG an injunction to prevent the integration of the Milton S. Hershey Medical Center and Pinnacle Health.

We are disappointed by the Court's decision. We firmly believe the integration of our two health systems would have served the best interests of patients and the entire central Pennsylvania community. But given the time and cost associated with continuing litigation, PinnacleHealth and the Milton S. Hershey Medical Center have decided to bring our integration efforts to a close.

While we pursued plans for our integration, PinnacleHealth and the Hershey Medical Center enjoyed a positive and collaborative working relationship. Where circumstances allow and where it makes the most sense for our patients, we will continue to collaborate in the future.

We are deeply grateful for the enthusiasm shown by the many employers, community physicians, commercial insurance providers, community leaders and others who have recognized the benefits of our proposed integration and demonstrated their broad support for it.

Both organizations remain firmly committed to controlling healthcare costs, increasing access to needed services, and improving the quality and safety of healthcare in our region.

###

#### **About PinnacleHealth System**

PinnacleHealth System has been a leading provider of inpatient and outpatient healthcare services in central Pennsylvania since 1873. The 636-bed system has three acute care hospitals (Community General Osteopathic, Harrisburg and West Shore Hospitals) on four campuses (Community, Harrisburg, Polyclinic and West Shore) serving a five-county service area and supporting rural hospitals through affiliations and telehealth services. PinnacleHealth pursues innovative treatment options for the region through cardiac and cancer clinical trials, while offering convenient community services including medical home-certified primary care, urgent care, Magnet-recognized nursing excellence, emergency services, imaging, high-volume maternity care and a level III NICU, and workplace-based wellness services. PinnacleHealth includes a CardioVascular

10/18/2016

Institute and Cancer Institute, as well as a Bone and Joint Institute, Neurosurgery and Neurosciences Institute, and Spine Care Center that combine a multi-disciplinary approach o comprehensive spine, bone, joint, orthopedic and sports medicine services. PinnacleHealth is recognized for high-quality care with national and regional recognitions for volumes, outcomes and safety. For more information, visit pinnaclehealth.org.

#### Notice of Electronic Service

I hereby certify that on October 19, 2016, I filed an electronic copy of the foregoing Joint Motion to Dismiss, with:

D. Michael Chappell Chief Administrative Law Judge 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Suite 110 Washington, DC, 20580

Donald Clark 600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Suite 172 Washington, DC, 20580

I hereby certify that on October 19, 2016, I served via E-Service an electronic copy of the foregoing Joint Motion to Dismiss, upon:

William Efron Regional Director Federal Trade Commission wefron@ftc.gov Complaint

Ryan Harsch Attorney Federal Trade Commission rharsch@ftc.gov Complaint

Jared Nagley Attorney Federal Trade Commission jnagley@ftc.gov Complaint

Jonathan Platt Attorney Federal Trade Commission jplatt@ftc.gov Complaint

Gerald Stein Attorney Federal Trade Commission gstein@ftc.gov Complaint

Geralyn Trujillo Attorney Federal Trade Commission gtrujillo@ftc.gov Complaint

Nancy Turnblacer Attorney Federal Trade Commission nturnblacer@ftc.gov

#### Complaint

Theodore Zang Attorney Federal Trade Commission tzang@ftc.gov Complaint

Adrian Wager-Zito JONES DAY adrianwagerzito@jonesday.com Respondent

Toby Singer JONES DAY tgsinger@jonesday.com Respondent

Kenneth Field JONES DAY kfield@jonesday.com Respondent

Julia McEvoy JONES DAY jmcevoy@jonesday.com Respondent

William Coglianese JONES DAY wcoglianese@jonesday.com Respondent

Christopher Thatch JONES DAY cthatch@jonesday.com Respondent

Peggy Bayer Femenella Attorney Federal Trade Commission pbayer@ftc.gov Complaint

James W. Frost Attorney Federal Trade Commission jfrost@ftc.gov Complaint

Lynda Lao Attorney Federal Trade Commission llao1@ftc.gov Complaint

 $\frac{William\ Coglianese}{Attorney}$