1	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA		
2	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES		
3			
4	In the Matter of)		
5	BENCO DENTAL SUPPLY CO.,) a corporation,)		
6	a corporación,		
7	HENRY SCHEIN, INC.,) Docket No. 9379 a corporation, and)		
8	PATTERSON COMPANIES, INC.,) a corporation,)		
9)		
10	Respondents.)))		
11	,		
12			
13	February 8, 2019		
14	9:47 a.m.		
15	TRIAL VOLUME 18		
16	PART 1, PUBLIC RECORD		
17			
18	BEFORE THE HONORABLE D. MICHAEL CHAPPELL		
19	Chief Administrative Law Judge		
20	Federal Trade Commission		
21	600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.		
22	Washington, D.C.		
23			
24			
25	Reported by: Josett F. Whalen, Court Reporter		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	APPEARANCES:
2	
3	ON BEHALF OF THE FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION:
4	LIN W. KAHN, ESQ.
5	Federal Trade Commission
6	Bureau of Competition - Western Region
7	901 Market Street - Suite 570
8	San Francisco, California 94103
9	(415) 848-5115
10	lkahn@ftc.gov
11	
12	-and-
13	
14	THOMAS DILLICKRATH, ESQ.
15	JOSH GOODMAN, ESQ.
16	KAREN GOFF, ESQ.
17	Federal Trade Commission
18	Bureau of Competition
19	Constitution Center
20	400 7th Street, S.W.
21	Washington, D.C. 20024
22	(202) 326-3286
23	tdillickrath@ftc.gov
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	APPEARANCES: (continued)
2	
3	ON BEHALF OF THE RESPONDENT (BENCO DENTAL SUPPLY CO.):
4	KENNETH L. RACOWSKI, ESQ.
5	Buchanan Ingersoll & Rooney, P.C.
6	Two Liberty Place
7	50 S. 16th Street - Suite 3200
8	Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19102-2555
9	(215) 665-3608
10	kenneth.racowski@bipc.com
11	
12	-and-
13	
14	GEOFFREY D. OLIVER, ESQ.
15	Jones Day
16	51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
17	Washington, D.C. 20001-2113
18	(202) 879-3939
19	gdoliver@jonesday.com
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	APPEARANCES: (continued)
2	
3	ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENT (HENRY SCHEIN, INC.):
4	JOHN P. McDONALD, ESQ.
5	Locke Lord LLP
6	2200 Ross Avenue - Suite 2800
7	Dallas, Texas 75201
8	(214) 740-8758
9	jpmcdonald@lockelord.com
10	-and-
11	LAUREN MORGAN FINCHER, ESQ.
12	Locke Lord LLP
13	600 Congress Avenue - Suite 2200
14	Austin, Texas 78701
15	(512) 305-4843
16	lfincher@lockelord.com
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	APPEARANCES: (continued)
2	
3	ON BEHALF OF RESPONDENT (PATTERSON COMPANIES, INC.):
4	JOSEPH A. OSTOYICH, ESQ.
5	WILLIAM C. LAVERY, ESQ.
6	ANDREW GEORGE, ESQ.
7	Baker Botts LLP
8	1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
9	Washington, D.C. 20004-2400
10	(202) 639-7905
11	joseph.ostoyich@bakerbotts.com
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION					
2	I N D E X					
3	IN THE	MATTER OF BE	NCO DEN	TAL SUPPLY	CO., et a	1.
4		TR	IAL VOL	UME 18		
5		PART	1, PUBL	IC RECORD		
6		FEB	RUARY 8	, 2019		
7						
8	WITNESS:	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS	VOIR
9	WU		5094	5179	5188	
10	TITUS	5190				
11		5277	5287	5334		
12						
13						
14	EXHIBITS	FOR ID IN E	VID	STRI	CKEN/REJEC	TED
15	CX					
16	(none)					
17						
18	RX					
19	(none)					
20						
21	JX					
22	(none)					
23						
24						
25						

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	
3	JUDGE CHAPPELL: Okay. We're back on the
4	record.
5	Continuing with your cross?
6	MR. GOODMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
7	JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right.
8	
9	Whereupon
10	LAWRENCE WU
11	a witness, called for examination, having been
12	previously duly sworn, was examined and testified
13	further as follows:
14	
15	CROSS-EXAMINATION (continued)
16	BY MR. GOODMAN:
17	Q. Good morning, Dr. Wu.
18	A. Good morning.
19	Q. In section 5.2 of your expert report, you offer
20	the opinion that Patterson's discounting to independent
21	dentists, including to members of buying groups, is
22	consistent with unilateral competitive conduct; is that
23	right?
24	A. Yes.
25	Q. Now, you presented some quantitative analysis

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 in this section of your report in Exhibits 5A, 5B and
- 2 5C; correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 May I just take a look at my report?
- O. Sure.
- 6 A. Okay.
- 7 Q. All of these exhibits involve the sale of one
- 8 product, Septocaine; correct?
- 9 MR. LAVERY: Objection, Your Honor. This is
- 10 beyond the scope of my direct. I was very focused, and
- 11 I didn't even touch this section.
- 12 MR. GOODMAN: Well, Your Honor, I understand
- 13 that these are sections of Dr. Wu's report that
- 14 counsel chose not to address in direct, but they're,
- 15 as far as we understand it, opinions that they still
- 16 may try to rely on that are expressed in his expert
- 17 report.
- 18 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Then you need to lay the
- 19 proper foundation that this is part of his report that
- 20 he submitted in this case and this is support for one
- 21 of his opinions.
- 22 Under rule 705, the proponent of an expert can
- 23 have an expert sit there and just give us conclusions
- 24 and opinions. On cross, the other side is entitled to
- 25 get into all the bases, everything that supports that

Benco Denta	l Suppl	y, et al	
-------------	---------	----------	--

2/8/2019

- 1 opinion. If that's what you're doing, then overruled.
- Is that what you're doing?
- 3 MR. GOODMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 4 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Go ahead.
- BY MR. GOODMAN:
- 6 O. Dr. Wu, I believe you testified that in
- 7 section 5.2 of your report you're offering the opinion
- 8 that Patterson's discounting to independent dentists,
- 9 including to members of buying groups, is consistent
- 10 with unilateral competitive conduct.
- 11 MR. LAVERY: Once again, objection. He did not
- 12 testify to that, and he did not address this report at
- 13 all, and as Your Honor has ruled in prior cases, the
- 14 rule that it has to be within the scope of direct
- 15 applies equally to experts. I would just like to renew
- 16 the objection.
- 17 JUDGE CHAPPELL: The question is, you're
- 18 offering this opinion. I'm allowing that. Overruled.
- 19 He didn't answer it yet. The question is
- 20 inquiring into whether he's offering this opinion.
- 21 Any opinion he's offering may be gone into on
- 22 cross. Let's understand that. You got it?
- MR. LAVERY: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 24 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Do you want to have her read
- 25 the question?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 MR. GOODMAN: Yes. I'll read it again.
- 2 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- Q. Dr. Wu, in section 5.2 of your report, you're
- 4 offering the opinion that Patterson's discounting to
- 5 independent dentists, including to members of buying
- 6 groups, is consistent with unilateral competitive
- 7 conduct; is that correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And are you still offering that opinion as part
- 10 of your testimony in this case?
- 11 A. This is an opinion in my expert report, and I
- 12 still stand by it.
- 13 Q. And in support of that opinion you presented
- 14 some quantitative analysis in this section of your
- 15 report in Exhibits 5A, 5B and 5C; correct?
- 16 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Hold on a second.
- 17 You need to clarify with the witness whether
- 18 it's in his report, which has been offered in evidence,
- 19 or the vagueness is the way you worded your question is
- 20 is he offering that as part of his testimony. There's
- 21 a difference there.
- 22 The opinion may be offered and he hasn't
- 23 testified about it, but because it's in evidence I'm
- 24 allowing you to inquire about it, so let's make that
- 25 clear, because his response to you was: It's in my

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 report.
- 2 MR. GOODMAN: Yes, Your Honor.
- 3 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Do you understand my point?
- 4 MR. GOODMAN: Let me ask a question, and if I
- 5 don't, I will ask for guidance from the court.
- 6 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Well, if you get into is this
- 7 opinion part of your report submitted in this case, as
- 8 long as he's aware of the report that was submitted,
- 9 that's allowable. But when you start saying is this an
- 10 opinion you're offering as part of your testimony, that
- 11 could be vague to a witness. It could be, well, does
- 12 he mean yesterday, does he mean in a deposition months
- 13 ago. Just be clear.
- 14 MR. GOODMAN: I think I understand.
- 15 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- 16 Q. So, Dr. Wu, is it an opinion in your expert
- 17 report -- so are the quantitative analyses that you
- 18 presented in sections 5A, 5B and 5C of your expert
- 19 report in support of your opinion that Patterson's
- 20 discounting to independent dentists, including members
- 21 of buying groups, is consistent with unilateral
- 22 competitive conduct?
- A. Just one clarification. You mean 5.1? I don't
- 24 have a 5A, 5B and 5C.
- Q. Sorry. In Exhibits 5A, 5B and 5C of your

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 report?
- A. Oh. So I do have Exhibits 5A, 5B and 5C in my
- 3 expert report, and these would be the amended exhibits
- 4 that I submitted prior to my deposition.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. That's not an
- 6 answer. Now you know what he's talking about. Now
- 7 answer his question.
- 8 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 9 Oh. Would you repeat the question.
- 10 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- 11 O. Dr. Wu, is it an opinion in your -- are the
- 12 quantitative analyses that you presented in
- 13 sections 5A, 5B and 5C of your expert report in
- 14 support of your opinion that Patterson's discounting to
- independent dentists, including members of buying
- 16 groups, is consistent with unilateral competitive
- 17 conduct?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 O. All of these exhibits involve the sale of one
- 20 product, Septocaine; is that correct?
- 21 A. Yes. Septocaine was the product that
- 22 Dr. Marshall used in his examples in his report.
- 23 O. Just to clarify what you said there,
- 24 Dr. Marshall did a number of analyses that involve
- 25 products beyond Septocaine; correct?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Yes. But the analysis that I was rebutting is
- 2 focused on the analysis he did with the product
- 3 Septocaine.
- Q. Okay. And the Exhibits 5A, 5B and 5C just
- 5 involve the sale of one product, Septocaine; correct?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And those exhibits also just involve sales in
- 8 Washington state; correct?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Well, let's start with your Exhibit 5B.
- Now, in your original expert report that you
- 12 served in this matter, you presented the results of a
- 13 particular study that you performed in Exhibit 5B;
- 14 correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Are you referring to Exhibit 5B in my original
- 17 report or my amended Exhibit 5B?
- 18 Q. So just to clarify, you've revised or amended a
- 19 number of exhibits that were contained in your original
- 20 expert report; correct?
- 21 A. Yes, I have.
- Q. So if I refer to your original expert report,
- 23 will you understand that to mean the original expert
- 24 report and original exhibits that you served along with
- 25 that report?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Yes. But the amended exhibits are the ones
- 2 that I'm relying on.
- 3 JUDGE CHAPPELL: The witness raises a good
- 4 point. You have not said "original" or "amended."
- 5 You've just been saying "5B," so you clarify it when
- 6 you ask him a question.
- 7 MR. GOODMAN: Yes, Your Honor. We're going to
- 8 explore this original amended exhibit through this line
- 9 of inquiry.
- 10 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- 11 Q. In your original expert report that you served
- 12 in this matter, you presented the results of a
- 13 particular study that you performed in your original
- 14 Exhibit 5B; correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Q. In your original Exhibit 5B, you purported to
- 17 compare prices that Smile Source members paid for
- 18 Septocaine in Washington state to Patterson versus
- 19 prices that Smile Source members paid to Schein;
- 20 correct?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And in your original Exhibit 5B, the time
- 23 period you studied was January 2009 to January 2012;
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. Yes.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Then the night before your scheduled deposition
- 2 in this case, at approximately 9:30 p.m., Patterson's
- 3 lawyers provided complaint counsel with a new or
- 4 amended Exhibit 5B that reported the results of a
- 5 different study; correct?
- 6 A. It was an amended exhibit. It's the same
- 7 methodology, but I looked at the time period in which
- 8 Patterson was in the -- was, according to the FTC, in
- 9 the alleged conspiracy.
- 10 So as I thought more about my original
- 11 Exhibit 5B, I realized that the time period studied in
- 12 my original Exhibit 5B was in the time period before
- 13 Patterson was in the alleged -- was, according to the
- 14 FTC, in the alleged conspiracy. I wanted to do an
- 15 analysis of Patterson's pricing in the period that the
- 16 FTC alleges was in the conspiracy because I --
- 17 JUDGE CHAPPELL: I'm going to need you to
- 18 listen to the question, sir. The question was --
- 19 didn't call for any explanation, didn't call for you to
- 20 tell us what it was and why. The question was, to the
- 21 extent you're aware, was it served on the prosecuting
- 22 attorneys in this case at 9:30 p.m. on the eve of the
- 23 deposition. That's the question that's pending, if
- 24 you're aware of that.
- 25 MR. GOODMAN: Thank you, Your Honor.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 THE WITNESS: I'm aware that it was sent to FTC
- 2 counsel sometime that evening.
- 3 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- 4 O. Now, in this new study that was sent to FTC
- 5 counsel at some point that evening, you purported to
- 6 compare prices Smile Source members paid for
- 7 Septocaine in Washington state to Burkhart versus
- 8 prices Smile Source members paid to Patterson;
- 9 correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And in your revised Exhibit 5B, the time
- 12 period you studied was January 2010 to December 2016;
- 13 correct?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. So you changed both the time period and the
- 16 distributor comparison in your analysis from the
- 17 original exhibit to the new revised Exhibit 5B;
- 18 correct?
- 19 A. I changed the time period studied to be in the
- 20 relevant period. As a result of that, I changed the
- 21 distributor studied because the Smile Source contracted
- 22 distributor changed in that time period.
- 23 MR. GOODMAN: Your Honor, I move to strike that
- 24 answer as nonresponsive.
- MR. LAVERY: I object to that. He just

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 explained his answer and did respond.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: He answered your question.
- 3 Overruled. Or if that's a motion, it's denied.
- 4 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- 5 Q. In your revised Exhibit 5B you also added a
- 6 visual distinction to indicate whether transactions
- 7 involving a dentist who is an active member -- let me
- 8 restart that question.
- 9 In your revised Exhibit 5B you also added a
- 10 visual distinction to indicate whether the transaction
- 11 involved a dentist who was an active member of
- 12 Smile Source at the time of the transaction depicted;
- 13 correct?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Your original Exhibit 5B didn't indicate any
- 16 distinction between active members of Smile Source and
- 17 dentists who were not active members of Smile Source at
- 18 the time of the transactions depicted; correct?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Let's pull up demonstrative CXD 16.
- 21 This demonstrative compares your original
- 22 Exhibit 5B with what you're calling the amended
- 23 version.
- 24 Does this demonstrative accurately summarize
- 25 the differences in your new study?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. And although you provided a revised Exhibit 5B,
- 3 you never provided any revised expert report in this
- 4 matter; correct?
- 5 A. I did not.
- 6 Q. Prior to the night before your deposition, you
- 7 did not provide any notice to complaint counsel that
- 8 you'd be revising any part of your expert report;
- 9 correct?
- 10 A. I don't believe so.
- 11 Q. Your expert report --
- 12 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Hold on a second.
- 13 Let's be clear. You're asking him questions
- 14 that would involve attorneys in this case. He as an
- 15 expert witness, he doesn't provide notice of anything.
- 16 He's not an attorney, so let's clarify the questions.
- 17 MR. GOODMAN: Very good, Your Honor. I'll
- 18 withdraw the last question.
- 19 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- Q. You provided your expert report -- your expert
- 21 report in this matter was due on September 5, 2018;
- 22 correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. And you submitted it on that date as far as
- 25 you're aware; correct?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Now, Dr. Marshall submitted a rebuttal expert
- 3 report in response to your report in late September;
- 4 correct?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And you received and reviewed that rebuttal
- 7 report; correct?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Now, your revisions that you ultimately made to
- 10 your exhibits were in response to Dr. Marshall's
- 11 critiques of your work; correct?
- 12 A. Some of it, some of it not.
- Q. Now, even after you had received Dr. Marshall's
- 14 rebuttal report, you still did not provide to
- 15 Patterson's counsel to provide to complaint counsel new
- 16 analysis until the very night before your deposition;
- 17 correct?
- 18 A. I did not --
- 19 MR. LAVERY: Objection, Your Honor. This is
- 20 getting argumentative and it's getting into what
- 21 counsel for Patterson provided to the FTC. I don't see
- 22 the relevance also.
- MR. GOODMAN: Your Honor, I think I'm just
- 24 establishing the timing of the revisions of these
- 25 exhibits.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 MR. LAVERY: Which he already answered and now
- 2 you're just arguing with --
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: You can ask about timing, but
- 4 the way you phrased it, even though, you still, that's
- 5 argumentative. Rephrase it. You can get to the facts
- 6 without the argument. Sustained.
- 7 BY MR. GOODMAN:
- Q. It was not just Exhibit 5B that you revised
- 9 before your deposition; correct?
- 10 A. Yes, correct.
- 11 Q. You also revised your original Exhibit 4,
- 12 Exhibit 5A, Exhibit 5C, Exhibit 12B, Exhibit 13A and
- 13 Exhibit 13B; correct?
- 14 A. Yes. Because some of those were typos, some of
- 15 those were printing errors, and I just wanted to have a
- 16 complete set of exhibits.
- 17 MR. GOODMAN: Your Honor, at this time I believe
- 18 we need to go in camera to continue this examination.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. You're going to
- 20 disappoint some people in the back of the room.
- 21 At this time I'm going into in camera session.
- 22 I'll need to ask those not subject to the protective
- 23 order to vacate the courtroom.
- 24 (Whereupon, the proceedings were held in
- 25 in camera session.)

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

```
1
              (The following proceedings were held in
 2
     in camera session.)
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	That - I oblic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Tridi - Fublic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	That - I oblic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	- Fublic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	That - Fublic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	- Fublic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	That - Fublic Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	mai - rubiic kecora	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	Trial - Public Record	2/8/2019
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Benco Dental Supply, et al.	2/8/2019
1	
2	
3 (End of in camera session.)	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 (The following proceedings continued in
- 2 public session.)
- 3 - -
- 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 5 BY MR. LAVERY:
- 6 Q. Dr. Wu, hello again.
- 7 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Hold it, hold it. Wait for
- 8 the public to rush in.
- 9 (Pause in the proceedings.)
- Go ahead.
- 11 BY MR. LAVERY:
- 12 O. Dr. Wu, hello.
- I just want to clarify a few things that
- 14 Mr. Goodman asked you today and yesterday.
- So counsel for the FTC asked you to assume a
- 16 bunch of conclusions about various things in your
- 17 exhibits. Do you remember that?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Do you accept any of their conclusions as
- 20 true?
- 21 A. No, I do not.
- 22 Q. Do you -- did Dr. Marshall do any statistical
- 23 study that would suggest that any of their conclusions
- 24 are true?
- 25 A. I've not seen them.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. As far as you know here today did they just
- 2 make those up?
- 3 A. I cannot verify that, verify what was done or
- 4 the numbers presented to me in the questions.
- 5 Q. Now, Dr. Wu, counsel showed you a document,
- 6 CX 4484. Do you remember that? It should be in one of
- 7 your binders I assume.
- 8 Kurt, if you have that, could you pull it up,
- 9 please, page 23 specifically.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And Dr. Wu, could you turn to the page that's
- 12 CX 4484-023.
- 13 I'm sorry. We don't have it on your screen
- 14 because it wasn't on their exhibit list, but could you
- 15 just turn to it in the binder?
- 16 A. Yes. I have it.
- 17 Q. So do you see on page 23 it's a slide that's
- 18 titled Kois Tribe Buyers Program?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you see that the bottom bullet says, "Case
- 21 studies show typical overall savings over 15 percent"
- 22 with an exclamation point?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you see down below, it says "What to expect
- in pricing" and number 3, "The savings per line item

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 will vary. You will see huge savings of 30 to
- 2 40 percent"?
- 3 A. Yes, I see that.
- 4 Q. Okay. So now can you turn to your amended
- 5 Exhibit C.
- 6 And Kurt, could we get that up on the screen,
- 7 please.
- 8 I'm sorry. Amended Exhibit 5C.
- 9 Sorry, Dr. Wu.
- 10 A. Okay.
- 11 Q. Now -- so you see the lines represented there.
- 12 You have the Patterson prices and the Burkhart
- 13 prices?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Even accepting what complaint counsel asked you
- 16 to assume as true, to get rid of the various items from
- 17 the top line, does the difference between those two
- 18 lines look like 30 to 40 percent to you?
- 19 A. They do not.
- 20 O. Does it even look like 15 percent?
- 21 A. They do not.
- Q. And so if you could flip to paragraph 63 in
- 23 your report --
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Before you do that, we're
- 25 going to take a short break. Have your next witness

Benco Dental	Supp	ly, et al	١.
--------------	------	-----------	----

2/8/2019

- 1 standing by outside the courtroom.
- 2 MR. LAVERY: Yes, Your Honor.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: We'll reconvene at -- I think
- 4 I already said 12:15. And I'll be asking for time
- 5 estimates to finish this witness when we come back.
- 6 MR. LAVERY: Yes, sir.
- 7 JUDGE CHAPPELL: We're in recess.
- 8 (Recess)
- 9 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Okay. We're back on the
- 10 record.
- 11 Time estimate.
- MR. LAVERY: Your Honor, I only have about five
- 13 more minutes with Dr. Wu.
- 14 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Do you anticipate any
- 15 recross?
- 16 MR. GOODMAN: Not at this time, Your Honor.
- 17 JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. Will there be any
- 18 other questioning on this side?
- 19 MR. OLIVER: Not from Benco, Your Honor.
- MR. McDONALD: Not from me, Your Honor.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. Go ahead.
- MR. LAVERY: Thank you, Your Honor.
- BY MR. LAVERY:
- Q. Kurt, could you actually pull up Exhibit 5C
- 25 again.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Dr. Wu, by the way, where did you get the data
- 2 when you were looking at active versus nonactive for
- 3 all the information in your Exhibit 5C?
- 4 A. I believe I received the data from
- 5 Dr. Marshall's backup.
- 6 Q. Right.
- 7 So take a -- if you could take a look and down
- 8 at the bottom in the notes, why don't you read us the
- 9 second sentence there.
- 10 I know. We've had an issue. It's shaking and
- 11 blurry.
- 12 A. No. That's fine.
- The second sentence reads, "Marshall Report's
- 14 Kois lookup is used to identify Kois members in
- 15 Burkhart and Patterson sales data."
- 16 That's just a -- that sentence refers to the
- 17 formula that Dr. Marshall uses to identify whether a
- 18 dentist is a member of Kois or not. I used
- 19 Dr. Marshall's methodology to identify an active Kois
- 20 member.
- 21 Q. And Dr. Marshall in his lookup, he didn't
- 22 specify when any member joined, did he?
- 23 A. He did not.
- Q. Okay. So all these entities that
- 25 complaint counsel pointed out in their

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 cross-examination, did you get all of those from
- 2 Dr. Marshall's own lookup?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 O. I'm sorry?
- 5 A. What -- did I get any of these from
- 6 Dr. Marshall?
- 7 Q. I'll strike the question and ask it again.
- 8 The entities that complaint counsel mentioned,
- 9 were those from Dr. Marshall's lookup?
- 10 A. Yes. The Kois members that are in my analysis
- 11 would be Kois members identified by Dr. Marshall's
- 12 lookup methodology.
- 0. Now, Dr. Wu, even accepting all of the
- 14 counterfactual assumptions that complaint counsel asked
- 15 you to make, does any of that change the conclusion
- 16 regarding Exhibit C?
- 17 A. No, it does not.
- 18 Q. And why don't we flip to paragraph 63 of your
- 19 report.
- 20 And so down at the bottom, the last sentence,
- 21 you say that (as read) "I see that the prices Patterson
- 22 was charging members of Kois were in the same range and
- 23 sometimes lower than the prices charged by the
- 24 contracting distributor."
- 25 Dr. Wu, is that statement still accurate?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. It is still accurate. And again, this is not a
- 2 conclusion driven by averages or any statistic like
- 3 that. Looking at the chart, it's plain that Patterson
- 4 was charging members of Kois pricing that's in the same
- 5 range as the contracted distributor.
- 6 O. So that was your point with this paragraph?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 And overall, the point of the entire section is
- 9 to address competitive impact. And as a reminder,
- 10 Dr. Marshall basically claims that it is unreasonable
- 11 to believe that the distributors would not have
- 12 contracted with buying groups unless there was
- 13 communication. That is -- that's something we want to
- 14 look at. That's something that one would want to look
- 15 at. It's just not right to say it's unreasonable to
- 16 believe as the basis of a conclusion.
- 17 O. And Dr. Wu, the conclusion that you just
- 18 mentioned by Dr. Marshall, was the main point of this
- 19 section to rebut that conclusion by Dr. Marshall?
- 20 A. Yes. Because Dr. Marshall does not put forward
- 21 any evidence of competitive effect.
- Q. Okay. Now, Dr. Wu, if you could flip to
- 23 paragraph 152 of your report.
- Now, Dr. Wu, even taking the counterfactual
- 25 assumptions that complaint counsel asked you to make as

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 true, does any of that change your conclusion in this
- 2 paragraph?
- 3 A. No. My conclusion remains that dentists did
- 4 not have to join a buying group to get the kind of
- 5 pricing that Patterson was offering to buying group
- 6 members.
- 7 Q. And what about paragraph 153, the paragraph
- 8 that discusses 13B? Does -- do any of the assumptions,
- 9 even taken as true, that complaint counsel asked you to
- 10 make -- does that -- any of that change your conclusion
- 11 in paragraph 153?
- 12 A. It does not.
- 13 My conclusions are not about differences in
- 14 average pricing. I'm looking at the range of prices.
- 15 And again, the overall conclusion is that dentists did
- 16 not have to join a buying group to get the same prices
- 17 that Patterson was offering group members by the
- 18 contracted distributors.
- 19 Q. Okay. Now, Dr. Wu, several times today and
- 20 yesterday you were asked if you did a quantitative
- 21 analysis about this or that. Do you recall that, sir?
- 22 A. I do.
- 23 Q. Is a quantitative analysis the only type of
- 24 economic analysis in the -- in an economist's tool
- 25 chest?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. It is not. Good economics has a quantitative
- 2 component and is also rooted in reviewing the
- 3 documents and the testimony that would help one
- 4 understand the dynamics of competition in an industry.
- 5 It's common and I think it should be part of any
- 6 economist's analysis to review not just quantitative
- 7 data but the qualitative facts surrounding a question
- 8 at issue.
- 9 Q. Okay. And Dr. Wu, yesterday,
- 10 complaint counsel pointed to a list of groups that you
- 11 had in your report and asked if you did a
- 12 profitability analysis with respect to each of those.
- 13 Do you remember that?
- 14 A. I do.
- Q. Did Dr. Marshall do a profitability analysis
- 16 with respect to each of those groups?
- 17 A. He did calculations of the profitability of
- 18 certain agreements.
- 19 Q. For how many groups did Dr. Marshall calculate
- 20 that for?
- 21 A. Dr. Marshall did calculations of five examples,
- 22 and it only involved two buying groups and three
- 23 distributors.
- Q. So Dr. Marshall didn't do a profitability
- 25 analysis for every group that complaint counsel pointed

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 out to you yesterday, did he, sir?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. He just did the two, Kois and Smile Source;
- 4 right?
- 5 A. Just two buying groups.
- 6 Q. And is that what you told me yesterday was
- 7 economically unreliable?
- 8 A. It is economically unreliable to draw
- 9 inferences about what other distributors would have
- 10 done with buying groups generally based on those two,
- 11 especially when those two are different from each
- 12 other and they're different from buying groups
- 13 generally.
- 14 MR. LAVERY: Okay. Thank you, Dr. Wu. That's
- 15 all I have.
- 16 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Anything further?
- 17 MR. GOODMAN: I just have a couple questions to
- 18 clarify one point very briefly, Your Honor.
- 19 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Go ahead.
- MR. GOODMAN: Thank you.
- 21 - -
- 22 RECROSS-EXAMINATION
- BY MR. GOODMAN:
- Q. Dr. Wu, in response to Mr. Lavery's questions
- 25 just now, I believe you testified that you followed the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 active and nonactive Kois member distinction in your
- 2 revised Exhibit 5C that you got from Dr. Marshall. Is
- 3 that right?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. And you had Dr. Marshall's rebuttal report
- 6 before you prepared your revised Exhibit 5C; correct?
- 7 A. I did.
- 8 Q. And in Dr. Marshall's rebuttal report, he
- 9 pointed out that he believed your Exhibit 5C
- 10 incorrectly included purchases that were not from
- 11 active members of Kois; correct?
- 12 A. Yes, he pointed that out.
- 13 Q. In fact, Dr. Marshall looked at your
- 14 Exhibit 5C and provided you with a detailed list of
- 15 specific dental practices, including some that we
- 16 discussed in the in camera session, that did not
- 17 appear to him to be active members of Kois yet were
- included in your analysis in your Exhibit 5C; correct?
- 19 A. He may have. I don't remember specifically.
- MR. GOODMAN: No further questions,
- 21 Your Honor.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Anything further?
- 23 MR. LAVERY: Nothing further, Your Honor.
- 24 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Thank you, sir. You may
- 25 stand down.

Benco Dental S	upply, et al.
----------------	---------------

2/8/2019

- 1 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Call your next witness.
- 3 (Pause in the proceedings.)
- 4 MS. FINCHER: Good morning, Your Honor.
- 5 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Good afternoon.
- 6 MS. FINCHER: Good afternoon, Your Honor.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: When you're ready.
- 8 MS. FINCHER: Your Honor, Henry Schein calls
- 9 Ms. Kathleen Titus.
- 10 - -
- 11 Whereupon --
- 12 KATHLEEN TITUS
- 13 a witness, called for examination, having been first
- 14 duly sworn, was examined and testified as follows:
- 15 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 16 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 17 O. Good afternoon, Ms. Titus.
- 18 A. Good afternoon.
- 19 Q. Please state your full name for the record,
- 20 please.
- 21 A. Kathleen Titus.
- 22 Q. Mr. Titus, are you currently employed?
- 23 A. I am.
- Q. Where are you employed?
- 25 A. I am employed as of January as a business

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 consultant for Henry Schein.
- Q. And how long have you worked for Henry Schein?
- 3 A. I worked as a full-time employee for
- 4 Henry Schein for 24 years and some months.
- 5 Q. And what divisions of Henry Schein did you work
- 6 in in your 24 years at the company?
- 7 A. I started in 1994 I believe as a field sales
- 8 consultant. I worked as a field sales consultant for
- 9 approximately two and a half years.
- I was recruited to go to work for the
- 11 Special Markets Division. I worked there for
- 12 15 years.
- And then approximately five years ago, I was
- 14 also recruited to be the director for our mid-market
- 15 emerging group sales.
- 16 Q. Ms. Titus, while you were at Henry Schein, did
- 17 you work with buying groups of independent dentists?
- 18 A. I did indeed. I worked with buying groups for
- 19 essentially my entire career up until the time I
- 20 retired.
- Q. Which again was December of 2018?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- Q. Now, Ms. Titus -- Kurt, if you could pull up
- 24 RXD 5, please.
- Now, Ms. Titus, I'd like to show you RXD 5.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 This is the specific agreement that complaint counsel
- 2 alleges in this case. It says that "Benco, Schein and
- 3 Patterson agreed not to provide discounts to, or
- 4 otherwise contract with, buying groups of independent
- 5 dentists."
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 A. I do.
- Q. Ms. Titus, are you aware of any agreement
- 9 between Benco, Schein and Patterson not to provide
- 10 discounts to or otherwise contract with buying groups
- 11 of independent dentists?
- 12 A. Absolutely not, because no agreement existed,
- and I know that because it was my job to work with
- 14 buying groups over the last twenty-plus years. In
- 15 fact, I find it personally diminishing because I spent
- 16 so much of my career at Henry Schein working with
- 17 buying groups.
- 18 Q. Now, Ms. Titus, who did you report to while you
- 19 were at Henry Schein?
- 20 A. I had several bosses while I was at
- 21 Henry Schein. Working backwards, Jake Meadows, VP of
- 22 multisite scales; Brian Brady, director of sales for
- 23 our mid-market group; Joe Cavaretta, who was the area
- 24 vice president and also mid-market sales; Randy Foley,
- 25 vice president of special markets; and Hal Muller,

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 president of special markets.
- Q. Ms. Titus, did any of those individuals you
- 3 just named ever instruct you not to do business with
- 4 buying groups when you were at Schein?
- 5 A. Absolutely not.
- 6 O. What about Mr. Tim Sullivan? Did Mr. Sullivan
- 7 ever instruct you not to do business with buying groups
- 8 while you were at Schein?
- 9 A. Absolutely not.
- 10 Q. Have you ever heard of any instruction from
- 11 Mr. Sullivan not to do business with buying groups?
- 12 A. I have not.
- 0. Ms. Titus, has anyone at Schein ever instructed
- 14 you not to do business with buying groups?
- 15 A. Absolutely not.
- 16 Q. Are you aware of any policy at Henry Schein,
- 17 either in Special Markets or Henry Schein Dental, not
- 18 to work with buying groups?
- 19 A. No, I have not because that policy did not
- 20 exist.
- 21 Q. Ms. Titus, during your 24 years at
- 22 Henry Schein, were there ever any kinds of customers
- 23 that Schein just categorically refused to do business
- 24 with?
- 25 A. Absolutely not.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Did Henry Schein Special Markets provide
- 2 discounts to buying groups while you were at Schein?
- 3 A. They did indeed.
- 4 O. What about Henry Schein Dental? Did
- 5 Henry Schein Dental provide discounts to buying groups
- 6 while you were at Schein?
- 7 A. Yes, they did.
- 8 Q. Ms. Titus, are you aware that the FTC points to
- 9 the end of Schein's relationship with the Dental Co-Op
- 10 and Steadfast buying groups as evidence of an alleged
- 11 conspiracy?
- 12 A. I am aware.
- 0. Were you personally involved in Schein's
- 14 decision to end its relationship with the
- 15 Dental Cooperative and Steadfast buying groups?
- 16 A. I was.
- 17 O. Did Schein end its relationship with those two
- 18 buying groups as the result of some agreement between
- 19 Benco, Schein and Patterson not to do business with
- 20 buying groups?
- 21 A. Absolutely not. My job was to work on behalf
- 22 of Henry Schein and do what was good for our company
- 23 and our constituency, so absolutely not.
- Q. And we'll get into more details about those
- 25 groups a little bit later, but just to be clear, did

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Schein's decision-making with respect to the
- 2 Dental Cooperative of Utah and the Steadfast Medical
- 3 buying groups have anything to do with Benco or
- 4 Patterson?
- 5 A. It did not.
- 6 Q. Have you ever had any communications
- 7 whatsoever with anyone from Patterson about GPOs or
- 8 buying groups?
- 9 A. No, I have not.
- 10 Q. Have you ever had any communications
- 11 whatsoever with anyone from Benco about GPOs or buying
- 12 groups?
- 13 A. No, I have not.
- Q. Ms. Titus, have you ever had any
- 15 communications with anyone from Benco or Patterson
- 16 about any business?
- 17 A. No, I have not.
- 18 Q. And I believe you stated you first started at
- 19 Henry Schein 24 years ago.
- 20 Is that 1994?
- 21 A. It is.
- Q. I believe you said you worked as a field sales
- 23 consultant?
- 24 A. I did.
- Q. And how long did you work as a field sales

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 consultant?
- 2 A. Approximately two and a half years.
- 3 Q. And I believe you stated that you then joined
- 4 Special Markets? Is that correct?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 Q. And how long did you work in Special Markets?
- 7 A. 15 years.
- 8 Q. And what were your roles in the
- 9 Special Markets Division at Henry Schein?
- 10 A. Special Markets was created and designed to
- 11 work with nontraditional customers, including buying
- 12 groups. That consisted of buying groups with private
- 13 practice dentists, schools and institutions, community
- 14 health centers, government, Indian health, and DSOs.
- 15 Q. Can you give us a sense of your
- 16 responsibilities when you were in the
- 17 Special Markets Division.
- 18 A. I had a variety of responsibilities. I
- 19 covered a very large geography, so virtually
- 20 everything that was part of the Special Markets budget
- 21 fell into my area of responsibility, so I worked with
- 22 all of those varieties that I had just testified were
- 23 part of the Special Markets group.
- Q. When you were in Special Markets, did you have
- 25 any direct involvement with buying groups of

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 independent dentists?
- 2 A. I did.
- 3 Q. And who else in Special Markets worked with
- 4 buying groups of independent dentists?
- 5 A. My peer group. There was a woman that worked
- 6 for us named Rhonda Durante. Rick Heysquierdo.
- 7 That's what's coming to mind right now.
- 8 Q. Now, Ms. Titus, at some point you transitioned
- 9 over to Henry Schein Dental; is that correct?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 Q. When did that occur?
- 12 A. That occurred approximately five years ago, so
- 13 2014.
- 14 Q. Now, why did you move over from Henry Schein
- 15 Special Markets to Henry Schein Dental?
- 16 A. I moved over to Henry Schein Dental to respond
- 17 to the changing landscape of dentistry. Essentially,
- 18 we saw -- and this was Henry Schein's habit, to stay on
- 19 the cutting edge of innovation and following market
- 20 trends -- and we saw a larger trend towards emerging
- 21 group practices and also buying groups.
- Q. Now, Ms. Titus, what is the
- 23 Mid Market Division?
- A. So the Mid Market Division was a group of
- 25 individuals that were hired to act as a resource to

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 further develop emerging group practices, buying
- 2 groups, vocational and hygiene schools, as well as
- 3 community health centers.
- 4 Q. And when was the Mid Market Division formed?
- 5 A. 2014.
- 6 O. And were you a part of the Mid Market Division?
- 7 A. I was. I was appointed as director of the
- 8 Western United States.
- 9 Q. What were your responsibilities as the
- 10 director for the Western United States in the
- 11 Mid Market Division?
- 12 A. My responsibilities were directly responsible
- 13 for the P&L, meaning directly responsible for
- 14 customers, directly responsible for a team of people
- 15 that we were adding to provide more resources and
- 16 access to our customers throughout my area of
- 17 responsibility, and responsible for essentially growing
- 18 Henry Schein business in that space.
- 19 Q. Now, at the time you transitioned to
- 20 Henry Schein Dental's Mid Market Division, did
- 21 Henry Schein Dental have relationships with buying
- 22 groups of independent dentists?
- 23 A. They did.
- Q. And were you, Ms. Titus, personally involved in
- 25 engaging with those buying groups after you moved to

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Henry Schein Dental?
- 2 A. Indeed, I was.
- Q. Ms. Titus, what are your personal views
- 4 regarding buying groups?
- 5 A. I think buying groups are a variety of
- 6 representations. Some are good and healthy business
- 7 partners for Henry Schein and some are not so good, and
- 8 it was my job to help to establish those that made
- 9 sense and those that perhaps did not.
- 10 Q. Now, do you believe that your views about
- 11 buying groups have changed over time?
- 12 A. I think I know more based on my tenure
- 13 certainly. And we have seen a market increase in the
- 14 number of entities that would like to create a buying
- 15 group, so start-ups I think you would call them, so
- 16 yes, I have a deeper understanding of them.
- Q. And you testified a moment ago that part of
- 18 your responsibilities was figuring out sort of which
- one of these groups were Schein and which ones maybe
- 20 are not a good fit.
- 21 Can you tell us some of the characteristics of
- 22 a buying group that would make it potentially a good
- 23 fit for Schein.
- 24 A. I can.
- 25 So buying groups are an extension of

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Henry Schein. In fact, we share their brand and they
- 2 share ours.
- I would characterize a good buying group as one
- 4 that shares the same values and integrity that we have
- 5 at Henry Schein, the same reverence and respect for the
- 6 dentists who we're focused on, those that offer more
- 7 than just an opportunity to buy consumables at a
- 8 discount, someone who shares our vision for developing
- 9 the productivity and profitability of a dentist and
- 10 also offers some added value like business solutions as
- 11 well as education.
- 12 Ultimately, the goal was to work
- 13 collaboratively to help those dentists work more
- 14 efficiently, provide best-of-class solutions deep into
- 15 their environment, and ultimately assist them in
- 16 delivering better patient care.
- 17 Q. Can you think of any other specific
- 18 characteristics of a particular buying group that might
- 19 inform you that they could be potentially a good
- 20 business fit?
- 21 A. Could you repeat that question.
- 22 O. Yeah. Sure.
- 23 You were just talking a moment ago about kind
- 24 of the value and alignment between a buying group and
- 25 Henry Schein.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Are there other things that you have looked at
- 3 in terms of a buying group to determine how might this
- 4 be a good fit for Schein?
- 5 A. Well, I think one of the things that we were
- 6 looking at is we were going to pour a lot of resources
- 7 into helping that buying group round out their
- 8 offering, be supportive to them, understand each
- 9 other's cultures and environment, so in order to
- 10 justify the amount of resources that we were pouring
- into that relationship, we would look for an
- 12 opportunity to be exclusive with that buying group, so
- 13 we wouldn't want to have them invite our competitors to
- 14 share that same partnership.
- 15 And this is probably the most critical part.
- 16 We were looking for partners that could actually move
- 17 the needle, meaning that they could enforce a certain
- 18 amount of compliance and affect the -- and affect and
- 19 influence the behavior of those said customers to buy
- 20 from Henry Schein.
- Q. And we've heard that term "compliance" a number
- 22 of times throughout this trial, but can you tell us
- what you mean when you use that word?
- 24 A. I certainly can.
- 25 So exclusivity and compliance go hand in hand.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 And you can promise exclusivity. However, if you don't
- 2 have compliance, it's an empty promise, because we're
- 3 not getting any traction to grow sales. And that was
- 4 my job, to help those relationships be fostered so that
- 5 we were actually growing sales.
- 6 O. Ms. Titus, in your experience at Henry Schein
- 7 and working with a number of buying groups, can all
- 8 buying groups drive compliance?
- 9 A. They cannot.
- 10 Q. Why not?
- 11 A. Driving compliance requires a significant
- 12 amount of credibility on the buying group parent
- 13 entity, meaning that they offer something more than
- 14 just a discount on consumables. That's why it was so
- 15 important that we looked at how they served that
- 16 dentist, were they looking to just build an additional
- 17 revenue stream on the back of that dentist or gain
- 18 access to Henry Schein's customer list or were they
- 19 truly trying to deliver solutions to that dentist to
- 20 make them better providers and better deliverers of
- 21 healthcare.
- 22 Q. Ms. Titus, the FTC alleges that when Schein
- 23 decides not to work with a buying group that it's
- 24 acting against its self-interest.
- 25 Do you agree with that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do not agree with that. In fact, I think
- 2 it's quite the contrary when we have a buying group
- 3 that either does not keep its promises to stay
- 4 exclusive or does not deliver additional sales to
- 5 Henry Schein.
- 6 Q. Ms. Titus, have you observed any downsides to
- 7 working with certain buying groups?
- 8 A. I have observed downsides to working with
- 9 certain buying groups.
- 10 Q. Can you tell us about some of those.
- 11 A. We are sharing our information about customers
- 12 openly. We are exchanging information that would
- 13 otherwise be considered confidential between us and the
- 14 parent entity or the buying group.
- 15 When those said buying groups would invite our
- 16 competitors in and then take existing Henry Schein
- 17 business and divert it or diminish it by sending it to
- 18 a competitor, that was almost predatory in nature.
- 19 Q. Anything else you can think of sitting here
- 20 today in terms of some of the challenges that you
- 21 experienced working with buying groups?
- 22 A. So some of the challenges were, if they were
- 23 small, they didn't have enough infrastructure behind
- them or a very solid business plan that we could help
- 25 boost them up and help them to deliver and gain

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 access, yes, or if they lacked the influence with
- 2 those individual dentists to enforce a certain or
- 3 effect a certain amount of compliance from those
- 4 dentists.
- 5 So we were putting discounts in place that
- 6 were significant for those dentists that were members
- 7 of a buying group, and we wanted to be sure that our
- 8 return on investment was there.
- 9 Q. And despite all of these challenges,
- 10 Ms. Titus, did Henry Schein still work with buying
- 11 groups?
- 12 A. We did.
- 13 O. Now, I'd like to talk a little bit about your
- 14 evaluation of buying groups once you moved over to
- 15 Henry Schein Dental, the Mid Market Division.
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 Q. How would you describe Henry Schein Dental's
- 18 strategy related to buying groups at the time you
- 19 joined Mid Market?
- 20 A. I think our strategy was much more
- 21 regionalized at the time, and while the
- 22 Special Markets Division had ultimate responsibility
- 23 for many of the buying groups, there were buying
- 24 groups under the Henry Schein Dental umbrella, and
- 25 those buying groups were very much ad hoc. We would

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 see them pop up. They were highly regionalized. They
- 2 might be tied to a study club or something that was
- 3 very regional in nature.
- 4 Q. Now, after you joined Henry Schein Dental's
- 5 Mid Market Division in 2014, were you involved in
- 6 helping to develop Schein's buying group strategy?
- 7 A. I was.
- 8 Q. And did you personally have a role in vetting
- 9 and evaluating buying groups in Henry Schein Dental?
- 10 A. I did.
- 11 Q. Can you give me some names of some of the
- 12 groups you evaluated or vetted?
- 13 A. Certainly.
- 14 Klear Impakt comes to mind.
- 15 Breakaway Dental.
- 16 Dental Gator.
- 17 Smile Source.
- Those are just a few examples.
- 19 Q. Ms. Titus, can you give me a sense of what your
- 20 evaluation process looked like in the 2014 time frame
- 21 with respect to buying group opportunities.
- 22 A. Our intention was to grow the buying groups
- 23 but do it with a discerning evaluation before we
- 24 jumped into those relationships, meaning that we
- 25 needed to create a criteria that constituted value to

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 all of the stakeholders, ourselves most importantly
- 2 because it was my job to grow business as director of
- 3 the Western United States, the buying group, and
- 4 ultimately that mutual customer that we were serving,
- 5 private practice dentists.
- 6 Q. And what were some of the factors that you
- 7 considered in evaluating whether to do business with
- 8 particular buying groups?
- 9 A. So the very first thing that we would look at
- 10 is the value alignment. I've worked for Henry Schein
- 11 for 24 years, and their uncompromising integrity was
- 12 the icon, the beam, that we always held to at
- 13 Henry Schein. It was part of our culture.
- 14 We take a lot of pride in the Henry Schein
- 15 brand and we take a lot of pride in what we represent
- 16 to the healthcare, the dental community specifically.
- 17 So it was very important that we first felt
- 18 that we were aligned with our values and our
- 19 integrity, that we were partnering with somebody that
- 20 we could mutually share in how we felt about our
- 21 dentists and how we treated them.
- 22 We would also look at their member group, what
- 23 was their member group like, what tied them together,
- 24 and most importantly we were looking for a partner that
- 25 was making an investment in those end users, the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 dentists.
- 2 If they were just looking for a way to create
- 3 a revenue stream on the back of those dentists, that
- 4 didn't fit our criteria for a healthy relationship.
- 5 We were looking for somebody that was willing and able
- 6 to invest in those dentists and would allow us to work
- 7 collaboratively with them to present our full portfolio
- 8 of products and services as that was our role. We were
- 9 a full-service dental dealer.
- 10 Q. Did you ever consider whether buying groups
- 11 would be able to drive new or additional business to
- 12 Henry Schein?
- 13 A. That was a lot of my consideration. Yes.
- 14 O. And how would you evaluate or measure that?
- 15 A. Well, I mentioned earlier that exclusivity was
- 16 a big, very important factor. The last thing we
- 17 wanted to do was share our customer list with a buying
- 18 group who would then take it to one of our
- 19 competitors.
- 20 So we would look for exclusivity. But, as I
- 21 mentioned before, we were looking for somebody that
- 22 could effect influence with those dentists who buy
- 23 from Henry Schein, and those dentists had to have a
- 24 degree of credibility with their dentists. They had
- 25 to be offering something more than just an opportunity

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 to get a discount in order to have that credibility,
- 2 so not just exclusivity, but exclusivity and
- 3 compliance go hand in hand. You can't separate them
- 4 from each other.
- 5 Q. Ms. Titus, in your view, did Henry Schein's
- 6 evaluation process related to buying groups change over
- 7 time?
- 8 A. I think our criteria was the same over the
- 9 twenty-plus years that I worked at Henry Schein. What
- 10 changed is that we were formalizing our strategy so
- 11 that we would use parity, essentially the same
- 12 yardstick to measure whether a customer or a buying
- 13 group entity was a good fit for Henry Schein or
- 14 whether we were risking our business to
- 15 cannibalization.
- 16 Q. Okay. Ms. Titus, I'd like to talk a little
- 17 more in detail about your role in evaluating buying
- 18 groups.
- 19 A. Okay.
- 20 Q. So, Kurt, if you could please pull up RX 2120.
- 21 And Ms. Titus, you're welcome to either pick up
- 22 the binder that's next to you or take a look at the
- 23 screen when --
- 24 A. I can see that pretty well. Thank you.
- 25 Q. Okay.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Now, Ms. Titus, this is an April 24,
- 2 2014 e-mail from you to Dean Kyle about the
- 3 Colorado Community Health Network; correct?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 Q. What is the Colorado Community Health Network?
- 6 A. The Colorado Community Health work -- Network
- 7 is an association that supports community health
- 8 centers throughout the state of Colorado.
- 9 Q. Would you characterize the Colorado Community
- 10 Health Network as a CHC GPO or buying group?
- 11 A. Definitely.
- 12 O. Now, you mentioned here that "this GPO
- 13 (Colorado Community Health Network) is actually one of
- 14 the 'good' ones."
- 15 Do you see that?
- 16 A. I do.
- 17 O. What were some of the characteristics of this
- 18 GPO that you viewed as good for Schein?
- 19 A. As I mentioned before, they're a member group,
- 20 and this particular -- as we called them CCHN to
- 21 shorten it up, this particular group had a membership
- 22 of every community health center throughout the state
- 23 of Colorado.
- 24 Q. And what other characteristics did you lay out
- in your e-mail that you viewed as good or favorable to

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Schein?
- 2 A. What we were looking for was really kind of
- 3 the -- again, the genesis of our strategy, and so as I
- 4 evaluated them using that same yardstick, they were
- 5 willing to be exclusive with Henry Schein.
- 6 They were also willing to enhance our
- 7 engagement with our customers, so we had a full sales
- 8 team out calling on these health centers. They were
- 9 able to open doors for us that perhaps we didn't have
- 10 the business with.
- We have an agenda to serve community health
- 12 centers. In very specific ways they promoted that
- 13 agenda. And they also gave us access to speak to the
- 14 entire group in their corporate office venue, so we
- were able to reach members with our messaging more
- 16 effectively and efficiently.
- 17 Also our cost was very low for supporting this
- 18 group with marketing fees or admin fees, so that
- 19 allowed us to actually contribute to advocacy
- 20 activities within the organization.
- Q. Now, Ms. Titus, in your view, do those
- 22 characteristics you laid out relating to exclusivity,
- 23 also engagement with end users, promotion of Schein's
- 24 agenda, and also access to the members -- are those
- 25 characteristics that you view as favorable both for CHC

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 buying groups and also buying groups of independent
- 2 dentists?
- 3 A. I definitely do. In fact, I think that this is
- 4 a really good example because in my e-mail I refer to
- 5 it as a win/win, and that's what we were looking
- 6 for.
- 7 Q. You go on towards the bottom of your e-mail to
- 8 say, "I am not 100 percent against GPOs as long as they
- 9 work for us."
- 10 Do you see that?
- 11 A. I do.
- 12 O. What did you mean by that?
- 13 A. That meant that we were beginning a strategy to
- 14 create a criteria for what made good business sense for
- 15 Henry Schein, those that helped us grow our business
- 16 and other things, and we were finding some that weren't
- 17 so good, frankly.
- 18 So when I say that -- that as long as they work
- 19 for us, that meant that we were starting to really
- 20 formulate that yardstick to measure by which we'd
- 21 create a really healthy relationship for all of the
- 22 stakeholders.
- Q. Ms. Titus, did you believe at this point in
- 24 time when you wrote this e-mail in April of 2014 that
- 25 GPOs or buying groups could be beneficial for Schein?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I did. And I had been working with them for
- 2 some time, so this statement was based on my
- 3 experience. There were some good ones and then some
- 4 not so good ones.
- 5 Q. Kurt, could you please pull up RX 2105,
- 6 please.
- 7 Ms. Titus, this is a May 12, 2014 e-mail
- 8 between you and Colan Rogers, copying others, regarding
- 9 Floss Dental.
- 10 Do you see that?
- 11 A. I do.
- 12 Q. Who is Colan Rogers?
- 13 A. Colan was a director for the Special Markets
- 14 Division.
- 15 O. What is Floss Dental?
- 16 A. Floss Dental was a small group of fully owned
- 17 offices, but also they had members that were
- 18 individual or independent practices that were part of
- 19 their group. That part of their group was a buying
- 20 group.
- 21 Q. And you say in your e-mail here, "I just
- 22 finished a 30-minute conversation with Joe Cav" -- is
- 23 that Joe Cavaretta?
- 24 A. It is.
- Q. -- "about GPOs and the impact to our business

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 (not always healthy to us)."
- 2 Do you see that?
- 3 A. I do.
- 4 Q. Now, what did you discuss with Mr. Cavaretta
- 5 during your 30-minute conversation regarding GPOs?
- 6 A. Joe Cavaretta and I were working shoulder to
- 7 shoulder to really create a document that could be
- 8 distributed to our constituency that had been well
- 9 thought out, that it had multiple contributors, where
- 10 we could evaluate more efficiently and create more
- 11 parity on those relationships with buying groups that
- 12 made sense for us, made good business sense for us.
- Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta ever tell you not to work
- 14 with buying groups?
- 15 A. He did not.
- 16 Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta ever ask you to shut down any
- 17 buying groups?
- 18 A. He did not.
- 19 Q. Did anyone at Henry Schein Dental ever ask you
- 20 to shut down any buying groups?
- 21 A. They did not.
- Q. Did anyone at Henry Schein Dental ever ask you
- 23 to dismantle any buying groups?
- 24 A. Absolutely not.
- Q. You then go on to say (as read): Andrea and

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 I -- is that Andrea Hight?
- 2 A. It is.
- 3 Q. -- have agreed in writing when the
- 4 relationships make sense and when it does not.
- 5 Do you see that?
- 6 A. I do.
- 7 Q. What was Ms. Hight's role at this time?
- 8 A. Ms. Hight was my peer. She was also a
- 9 director, but she had a different region of the
- 10 country. She was the director for the
- 11 Central United States.
- 12 O. What was the nature of your discussion with
- 13 Ms. Hight around this time about buying groups?
- 14 A. Ms. Hight and I had spent years to get --
- 15 working together essentially in the same role for the
- 16 Special Markets Division where we worked with a number
- of buying groups, each of us. And we had the
- 18 experience of having more exposure to them, and
- 19 because we had more exposure to them, it was our job
- 20 as directors for the mid-market to start to develop a
- 21 strategy, a criteria, so to speak, to put together a
- 22 very cogent list so that our peer group who were
- 23 meeting with these buying groups would be measuring
- 24 these -- the opportunity with the same yardstick.
- Q. And when did you believe that a relationship

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 with a buying group would make sense for Henry Schein?
- 2 A. I'm sorry. Could you repeat the question.
- 3 Q. Sure.
- 4 When did you believe that a buying group
- 5 relationship would make sense for Henry Schein?
- 6 A. Well, we were in process of building a
- 7 strategy. And again, we were looking for a partner. I
- 8 think that is really the key word. We were looking for
- 9 alignment in values. We were looking for alignment in
- 10 integrity.
- 11 Again, pointing to who we were as a company, we
- 12 had an uncompromising integrity at Henry Schein.
- 13 Everyone practiced that, and it would not do for us to
- 14 partner with somebody that didn't share our values or
- 15 share that inherent integrity within their
- 16 organization. We were looking for a member group that
- 17 collectively could generate business through
- 18 Henry Schein.
- 19 Q. You go on to say, "Just some brainstorming so
- 20 we can develop our policy as we are not blindly
- 21 empowering entities that are bad for Schein."
- 22 Do you see that?
- 23 A. I do.
- 24 Q. What were you interested in developing based on
- 25 that statement?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. What I was interested in developing was again a
- 2 strategy that we could consistently point to and
- 3 establish parity across the United States so that we
- 4 were sharing this information with our peer groups,
- 5 with management groups. We were looking to have other
- 6 people contribute their good ideas.
- 7 A lot of collective brainstorming brought some
- 8 other good ideas of what was important to look at with
- 9 a healthy relationship with a buying group.
- 10 And then we wanted to actually formalize that
- 11 strategy so that it could be shared with others so that
- 12 we could continue to grow the buying group in a healthy
- 13 way.
- Q. Now, as of the date of this e-mail, May 12,
- 15 2014, did Schein have an official policy related to
- 16 buying groups at that time?
- 17 A. I think "policy" is the wrong word. When I
- 18 used the word "policy," I think strategy would be much
- 19 more accurate. We were looking to develop a strategy.
- 20 Q. Kurt, you can take this document down.
- 21 Ms. Titus, are you familiar with a group called
- 22 Pacific Group Management Services or PGMS?
- 23 A. I am.
- Q. What is PGMS?
- 25 A. Practice group -- Pacific Group Management was

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 essentially a start-up buying group.
- Q. And how did you become familiar with PGMS?
- 3 A. PGMS was brought to my attention by one of our
- 4 field salespeople, one of our equipment sales
- 5 specialists that was working with one of the
- 6 principals.
- 7 Q. And did you proceed to evaluate the opportunity
- 8 to work with PGMS?
- 9 A. I did.
- 10 Q. Kurt, could you please pull up CX 2809.
- 11 Ms. Titus, this is a June 12, 2014 e-mail chain
- 12 involving you and Joe Cavaretta and also, earlier in
- 13 the chain, PGMS.
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. Now, what was your first step in the evaluation
- 16 of PGMS?
- 17 A. I'm sorry. One more time.
- 18 Q. Yeah. Sure.
- 19 What was your first step in the evaluation of
- 20 PGMS?
- 21 A. Any good business practice requires discovery,
- 22 so that was my first process, was to collect
- 23 information about who PGMS was, what their mission,
- 24 their vision, and how they felt developing a buying
- 25 group relationship with Henry Schein would serve them

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 and our stakeholders.
- Q. And Kurt, if you could turn to page 5, please.
- 3 Ms. Titus, was -- were the questions listed on
- 4 page 5 of this exhibit the questions that you asked of
- 5 PGMS during this discovery phase?
- 6 A. It was indeed.
- 7 Q. And can you run through some of those questions
- 8 that you asked during your discovery of PGMS.
- 9 A. I can.
- 10 A brief profile and history of PGMS. Again,
- 11 this goes back to finding out more about who are we
- 12 working with, who is this company, what did they
- 13 represent.
- 14 A portfolio of their services, again going back
- 15 to are you just looking to create a consumable discount
- 16 or are you offering something more to our shared
- 17 audience.
- 18 How do they market to their candidates, are
- 19 they doing educational seminars, are they investing in
- 20 enhancing the skill set of the dentists.
- 21 How many members do they have. That was very
- 22 important because members mean volume.
- 23 Can PGMS effect compliance of its members.
- 24 This became a very important question in my engagement
- 25 with PGMS, so we wanted to know, could you move the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 needle, can you get people to buy from Schein.
- 2 Does PGMS have a stake in the practices. And
- 3 I think this was a question that would help us define
- 4 more if these were independent private practices or if
- 5 this was some form of a DSO. And it turns out that
- 6 they had no stake in the practices. They were selling
- 7 to -- or they were a group of members who were
- 8 independent dentists.
- 9 Q. Ms. Titus, is it fair to characterize these
- 10 questions that you asked of PGMS as due diligence on
- 11 the group?
- 12 A. Very much due diligence. That's a very
- 13 correct term because we again were starting to look at
- 14 our relationships with a more critical eye and assure
- 15 that if we were hearing something that didn't make
- 16 sense that we were exploring those questions or
- 17 concerns to find out if there was room for
- 18 negotiation.
- 19 Q. And Kurt, if you could turn to page 2, please.
- Ms. Titus, in your June 12, 2014 e-mail to
- 21 Joe Cavaretta you ask him whether you should set up a
- 22 call with PGMS; right?
- 23 A. Correct.
- Q. You also told Mr. Cavaretta that PGMS was a
- 25 potential hybrid GPO partner, but only with a carefully

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 crafted deal that guarantees compliance, exclusivity
- 2 and the opportunity to market Schein business
- 3 solutions.
- 4 Do you see that?
- 5 A. I do.
- 6 Q. What were you conveying to Mr. Cavaretta
- 7 there?
- 8 A. In context of my e-mail to Mr. Cavaretta, we
- 9 had our heads together and our shoulders together
- 10 working to create, again, a strategy that we could work
- 11 more effectively. We could make a more discerning
- 12 decision about what constituted a healthy relationship
- 13 and what didn't.
- 14 When I wrote this e-mail, I was essentially
- 15 telling him that we were going to be applying these
- 16 questions or these strategies to evaluating whether we
- 17 should move forward with PGMS.
- 18 Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta give you the green light to
- 19 set up a call with PGMS?
- 20 A. He did.
- 21 Q. Now, Mr. Cavaretta says on the top of page 2,
- 22 "This is not going to stop and another reason why we
- 23 need to make sure we have our systems and offering down
- 24 cold and the team understanding how to present."
- Do you see that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do.
- Q. Do you know what offering Mr. Cavaretta was
- 3 referring to?
- 4 A. I do. It -- it constituted many things.
- 5 Our offering would be -- it would start with
- 6 a -- we were working on developing sales plans. Those
- 7 sales plans were specifically created. They were
- 8 discount plans so that we were offering essentially
- 9 the same sorts of discounts across the board and we
- 10 weren't all over the map on discounts and we were being
- 11 fair with buying groups and fair with their member
- 12 groups.
- So we wanted to make sure that our offerings
- 14 were in line on pricing, that we had a mission to sell
- 15 deeper into our client base. We wanted to be able to
- 16 gain access to those members to talk about our
- 17 nonclinical business services, equipment, technology
- 18 and education.
- 19 O. So was Mr. Cavaretta telling you in
- 20 June 2014 that Schein needed to have a more formal
- 21 offering with respect to buying groups?
- A. He was. He was asking me to build the
- 23 portfolio.
- Q. Did you agree with that, that there was a need
- 25 to get this buying group offering down cold?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. 100 percent. In fact, I spent a whole lot of
- 2 my time doing just that.
- Q. Now, Kurt, if you could turn to page 1,
- 4 please.
- 5 And Mr. Cavaretta responded to you and stated
- 6 that he thought your questions below should be standard
- 7 for all the group practice team.
- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. Did you interpret him to be referring to your
- 11 discovery questions with respect to PGMS?
- 12 A. He was.
- Q. Did you ultimately end up meeting with PGMS?
- 14 A. I did.
- 15 Q. And what was the result of that meeting?
- 16 A. I thought it was a good meeting. I thought it
- 17 was a good start to what could potentially be a
- 18 partnership. I liked them very much.
- 19 I did have some concerns throughout our
- 20 discussion, one of which is they only had a very small
- 21 number of members, the other of which is they were
- 22 very insecure about whether they could actually
- 23 influence their members to buy from Schein or gain
- 24 compliance.
- Q. Kurt, if you could pull up CX 2250, please.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Ms. Titus, this is a July 14, 2014 e-mail chain
- 2 between you, Brian Brady, Joe Cavaretta, Glenn Showgren
- 3 and Nicole Lena about PGMS.
- 4 Do you see that?
- 5 A. I do.
- 6 Q. Who is Brian Brady?
- 7 A. At the time, Brian Brady was the regional
- 8 manager for Northern California, San Francisco Bay
- 9 area.
- 10 Q. And who is Glenn Showgren?
- 11 A. And Glenn Showgren was the zone general
- 12 manager overseeing a large part of the
- 13 Western United States.
- 0. What about Nicole Lena?
- 15 A. And Nicole Lena was a regional account manager
- 16 who reported directly to me and worked directly with
- 17 the mid-market.
- 18 Q. Ms. Titus, did anyone at Schein express
- 19 concerns to you about entering into the PGMS
- 20 relationship?
- 21 A. They did.
- 0. And who was that?
- A. Well, specifically Brian Brady, who sat in on
- 24 the meeting with the folks from PGMS, at which time he
- 25 heard things that were very concerning to him.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Now, if you look at his e-mail to you on the
- 2 bottom of the first page, he says that PGMS "told us a
- 3 few times during the meeting that they can only 'lead
- 4 the horses,' but 'not make them drink.'"
- 5 Do you see that?
- 6 A. I do.
- 7 Q. What did you interpret that to mean?
- 8 A. I interpreted that to mean that he had -- PGMS
- 9 had members, but they could not effect compliance of
- 10 thus members.
- 11 O. Was that a concern for Schein?
- 12 A. That was a very big concern for Schein because
- 13 there was no return on investment and the resources
- 14 that we were pouring in to help them create their
- 15 organization.
- 16 Q. Ms. Titus, who is Dr. Luque?
- 17 A. Dr. Luque was a prosthodontist oral surgeon in
- 18 the San Francisco Bay area and also a member of PGMS.
- 19 Q. Did Dr. Luque have any leadership role with the
- 20 PGMS group?
- 21 A. He did. I would call him the key leader.
- 22 Q. Did Dr. Luque agree to do business with Schein
- 23 if Schein partnered with PGMS?
- 24 A. He did not.
- Q. Did that cause you any concern?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That was a definite red flag because we felt
- 2 that if the leader of the organization was unwilling
- 3 to vote with his dollars, how could he influence his
- 4 member group to do the very same.
- 5 Q. And Kurt, if you could pull up CX 2235,
- 6 please.
- 7 Ms. Titus, this is a July 17, 2014 e-mail from
- 8 you to Glenn Showgren, Kevin Upchurch, and the subject
- 9 line is PGMS Agreement.
- 10 Do you see that?
- 11 A. I do.
- 12 Q. Who is Kevin Upchurch?
- 13 A. Kevin Upchurch shares the same role as
- 14 Glenn Showgren. He's a zone general manager that
- 15 covered a different part of the United States.
- Q. Did Schein ultimately enter into a relationship
- 17 with PGMS?
- 18 A. We did not.
- 19 O. Why not?
- 20 A. Like any negotiation and you work with a
- 21 customer over a period of time, you learn more about
- 22 who they are and what they can do and what they can't
- 23 do.
- We had two very serious red flags. One was
- 25 Dr. Luque, who was the leader of PGMS, was unwilling

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 to vote with his own dollars. Number two was hand in
- 2 hand with that statement in that we didn't believe and
- 3 they didn't believe that they could effect compliance
- 4 with their member group.
- 5 Q. In this e-mail, CX 2235, you tell Mr. Showgren
- 6 and Mr. Upchurch that you "had a GPO prospect called
- 7 PGMS. Very intriguing, willing to be exclusive."
- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. Why did Schein not enter into a relationship
- 11 with PGMS if they were willing to be exclusive?
- 12 A. As I mentioned earlier, exclusivity was
- one-half of the -- actually, it was probably the
- 14 threshold for beginning negotiations. But exclusivity
- 15 and compliance are intrinsically linked to one another
- in that you could promise exclusivity, but if you
- 17 couldn't deliver the sales, then it was an empty
- 18 promise and there was no return on investment.
- 19 O. And so there is a difference then between
- 20 exclusivity and compliance.
- 21 A. Very much so.
- Q. And what did you determine ultimately about
- 23 PGMS's ability to drive compliance?
- 24 A. I think I was evolving our criteria and our
- 25 strategy for engaging with these start-up buying

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 groups. And what I understood during this period is
- 2 that we really needed to partner with a buying group
- 3 that could drive compliance in order for it to be
- 4 justified for us to put our resources into it.
- 5 Q. You go on to say, "It went to Tim and he shot
- 6 it down."
- 7 Do you see that?
- 8 A. I do.
- 9 Q. Was your "Tim" there referring to
- 10 Tim Sullivan?
- 11 A. It is.
- 12 Q. Did Tim Sullivan ever tell you that?
- 13 A. I never spoke to Tim. He did not tell me
- 14 that.
- 15 Q. Did you ever talk to Tim Sullivan about PGMS?
- 16 A. I did not.
- 17 Q. Did someone else tell you that Tim shot it
- 18 down?
- 19 A. I believe it would have been my boss who --
- 20 I -- I don't like the -- the -- the words I use,
- 21 "shot it down." I think Joe was more measured and said
- 22 that there were concerns, and it specifically revolved
- 23 around Dr. Luque buying from our competitors and the
- 24 fact that they were very sure that they couldn't drive
- 25 compliance.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta tell you that Tim Sullivan
- 2 didn't want to work with PGMS?
- 3 A. He did not.
- 4 Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta tell you that Schein could
- 5 not work with PGMS?
- 6 A. No, he did not.
- 7 O. Do you know who made the ultimate decision not
- 8 to partner with PGMS?
- 9 A. In my recollection, this was again part of our
- 10 evaluation that we -- there was a consensus amongst our
- 11 management and leadership group that this was probably
- 12 one we should pass on, and we did.
- 13 Q. And when you say "our management and
- 14 leadership group, "who specifically are you referring
- 15 to?
- 16 A. The two general managers for each part of the
- 17 United States, Brian Brady and Joe Cavaretta --
- 18 Q. And yourself?
- 19 A. -- myself.
- Q. Did Schein's decision not to move forward with
- 21 PGMS have anything to do with Patterson or Benco?
- 22 A. Nothing whatsoever. I was completely focused
- on our business. It never entered into our thought
- 24 process.
- Q. You go on in your e-mail to say, "I think the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 meta message is officially, GPOs are not good for
- 2 Schein."
- 3 Do you see that?
- 4 A. I do.
- 5 Q. What did you mean, Ms. Titus, when you wrote
- 6 that?
- 7 A. So, again, perhaps not a very thoughtful
- 8 choice of words, but I was specifically referring to a
- 9 group like this, a start-up that did not put their
- 10 money where their mouth is by buying from Henry Schein
- 11 and could not enforce compliance with their member
- 12 group.
- 0. When you wrote this e-mail, Ms. Titus, were you
- 14 intending to convey that Schein would not work with
- 15 GPOs or buying groups?
- 16 A. I was not. In fact, that would be counter to
- 17 reality, which I was working with many GPOs.
- 18 Q. Did Tim Sullivan ever tell you that GPOs are
- 19 not good for Schein?
- A. He did not.
- 21 Q. Did Joe Cavaretta ever tell you that GPOs are
- 22 not good for Schein?
- 23 A. He did not.
- Q. Kurt, if you could pull up CX 2220, please.
- Now, Ms. Titus, this is an

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 August 29, 2014 e-mail chain you're on about
- 2 Denali Group.
- 3 Do you see that?
- 4 A. I do.
- 5 Q. And you refer to the -- Denali in this e-mail
- 6 as a consulting group; correct?
- 7 A. I did.
- 8 Q. Did you actually know at the time you wrote
- 9 this whether Denali was a consulting group?
- 10 A. I didn't know much about Denali. I assumed
- 11 they were a consulting group. I had no knowledge, no
- 12 real intimate knowledge of them.
- Q. Did you know whether they were a buying group?
- 14 A. Yes, I did know that they were a buying group.
- 15 Q. When did you come to learn that?
- 16 A. I -- I don't remember exactly how I learned it,
- 17 but I think it was through making an inquiry and
- 18 learning that they were doing business with
- 19 Special Markets.
- 20 Q. And you say -- if you look down in your
- 21 e-mail -- and it's highlighted here -- you have a
- 22 sentence that says, "This model is prevalent, but very
- 23 unhealthy for distribution."
- 24 Do you see that?
- 25 A. I do.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. Were you referring generally to the GPO or
- 2 buying group model?
- 3 A. I was not. I was referring to specifically
- 4 consultants that their agenda was to gain access to
- 5 Henry Schein's customer list so they could grow their
- 6 consulting business and essentially grow a revenue
- 7 stream on the back of their dentists by offering them a
- 8 discount on consumables through Henry Schein.
- 9 Q. Were you talking about all consulting groups
- 10 when you made that statement?
- 11 A. Not necessarily.
- 12 O. Now, Ms. Titus, this e-mail is a few months
- 13 after you joined Henry Schein Dental's Mid Market
- 14 Division; correct?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 Q. And a few months after you started working on
- 17 Schein's buying group strategy in Henry Schein Dental;
- 18 correct?
- 19 A. That's correct.
- 20 Q. And you say in your e-mail at the top to
- 21 Joe Cavaretta, "It doesn't help to have a GPO policy if
- 22 Special Markets" -- "SM" -- is that Special Markets?
- 23 A. It is.
- Q. -- "is opening up these consulting firms."
- Do you see that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do.
- Q. Did Schein have a GPO policy on the date you
- 3 wrote this e-mail?
- 4 A. No, they did not have a policy.
- 5 Q. So what did you mean then when you wrote, "It
- 6 doesn't help to have a GPO policy if Special Markets is
- 7 opening up these consulting firms"?
- 8 A. I was referring more to strategy because we
- 9 were building something that we hoped would set the
- 10 standard for evaluating buying groups throughout our
- 11 organization nationally and we -- we were looking at
- 12 making this as universal as possible, so I was really
- 13 referring to something that I didn't have enough
- 14 knowledge of, unfortunately.
- Q. Was there ever a policy at Schein not to open
- 16 up GPOs or buying groups?
- 17 A. Never.
- 18 Q. Was Henry Schein Dental still determining its
- 19 strategy with respect to buying groups as of the date
- 20 of this e-mail?
- 21 A. It was.
- Q. But was Schein still working with buying groups
- 23 at this time?
- 24 A. They absolutely were.
- Q. Can you give me some examples?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Sure.
- 2 OrthoSynetics.
- 3 Are you talking about in the
- 4 Special Markets Division?
- 5 Q. In any --
- 6 (Counsel and witness speaking at the same time
- 7 and cautioned by court reporter.)
- BY MS. FINCHER:
- 9 Q. Let's talk about Henry Schein Dental first.
- 10 A. Okay.
- 11 Q. Was Henry Schein Dental working with other
- 12 buying groups as of the date of this e-mail,
- 13 August 2014?
- 14 A. They were.
- 15 Q. Can you give me some examples?
- 16 A. So I would say Dental Co-Op would be one.
- 17 That's the one that comes to the top of my head
- 18 right now.
- 19 Q. Have you heard of a group called Dental Gator?
- 20 A. Dental Gator, yes. Uh-huh.
- Q. Have you heard of a group called Steadfast?
- 22 A. I have.
- Q. Do you know whether Schein was working with
- 24 Dental Gator as of the date of this e-mail?
- 25 A. I believe they were.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. In this e-mail chain you also -- if you go down
- 2 to the end of that middle paragraph, you tell
- 3 Ms. Edstrom, "If it makes you feel better, PDCO is not
- 4 on board for these type of GPO relationships either."
- 5 Do you see that?
- 6 A. I do.
- 7 Q. Is "PDCO" Patterson Dental?
- 8 A. It is.
- 9 Q. Did you know whether Patterson was on board for
- 10 GPO relationships as of the date of this e-mail?
- 11 A. I did not.
- 12 In fact, this statement was more of a market
- 13 observation just looking at the dental landscape, being
- 14 involved in the marketplace, being very focused on
- 15 developing buying groups myself. And frankly, my
- 16 comment was speaking to an FSC. In context, I was
- 17 trying to get her to refocus and keep doing what she
- 18 was doing.
- 19 Q. And just to be clear, did you ever have any
- 20 communications with anyone from Patterson about GPO
- 21 relationships?
- 22 A. Absolutely not.
- 23 Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta ever tell you anything about
- 24 Patterson's strategy as it related to buying groups or
- 25 GPOs?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. He did not.
- Q. Did anyone at Henry Schein ever tell you
- 3 anything about Patterson's strategy as it related to
- 4 buying groups or GPOs?
- 5 A. They did not.
- 6 Q. Now -- and you can put that down, Kurt -- I'd
- 7 like to talk to you, Ms. Titus, about some of the other
- 8 buying groups you personally evaluated.
- 9 A. Okay.
- 10 Q. Are you familiar with the Dental Cooperative of
- 11 Utah?
- 12 A. I am.
- Q. What is the Dental Cooperative of Utah?
- 14 A. The Dental Cooperative of Utah is a buying
- 15 group.
- 16 Q. When did you first become aware of the
- 17 Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 18 A. I believe I was contacted by Jeff Harmon, who
- 19 was a regional manager for Utah.
- Q. Did Schein have a business relationship with
- 21 the Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 22 A. As I understood it, they had a relationship and
- 23 it was a long-term legacy relationship.
- Q. What did you learn about the dental cooperative
- 25 buying group after being introduced by Mr. Harmon?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. My initial process was to, again, using the
- 2 same standards and strategies that we were developing,
- 3 was to contact the COO, Mr. Eberhardt, and to really
- 4 just ask a lot of questions about who they were, what
- 5 they do, what their audience is, those kinds of
- 6 things.
- 7 Q. Kurt, if you could pull up CX 2239, please.
- 8 Ms. Titus, this is a May 19, 2014 e-mail chain
- 9 involving some at Schein and then earlier in the chain
- 10 Colgate; is that right?
- 11 A. That's right.
- 12 O. And this e-mail chain is about the
- 13 Dental Cooperative of Utah?
- 14 A. Correct.
- 15 Q. Kurt, if you could go to page 2, please.
- Now, if you look at the bottom of the page,
- 17 Ms. Titus, you received an e-mail from Francis Keefe
- 18 regarding the dental co-op; correct?
- 19 A. I did.
- O. Who is Francis Keefe?
- 21 A. Francis Keefe is the national director for
- 22 Colgate-Palmolive's preventive division. They sell
- 23 toothbrushes, floss and other oral health products to
- 24 the dental community.
- Q. Does Schein have a relationship with Colgate?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. We have a relationship that is exclusive with
- 2 Henry Schein.
- Q. And can you tell us what that means, an
- 4 exclusive relationship?
- 5 A. Meaning that Colgate did not sell through any
- 6 of our competitive distributors.
- 7 Q. Do you know why Mr. Keefe sent you an e-mail
- 8 about the dental co-op?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. Why is that?
- 11 A. Like myself, Frank Keefe was responsible for
- 12 a -- the P&L for his -- he was national, so
- 13 nationally. There was a remarkable event that began
- 14 taking place that called his attention to it.
- 15 What was happening is established customers --
- 16 and they were Henry Schein customers because we were
- 17 exclusive -- started canceling their preventive
- 18 shipment plans and as he did a little more
- 19 investigation discovered from his field team that those
- 20 plans were being reengaged directly with
- 21 Procter & Gamble.
- Q. And were those plans for customers of
- 23 Henry Schein that were also members of the
- 24 Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 25 A. That's correct. He was able to identify them

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 as dental co-op members.
- Q. And what was the issue in learning that those
- 3 contracts had been canceled?
- 4 A. The issue is that preventive is one of our
- 5 most important categories with a dental office, as you
- 6 can imagine. It represented significant sales to
- 7 Henry Schein. When we noticed all of these dental
- 8 plans dropping off, there was a very significant,
- 9 45 percent drop-off in the sales of Colgate products
- 10 into these offices.
- Q. And again, those offices that you're referring
- 12 to are the offices that were members of the
- 13 dental co-op buying group?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. You then forward that e-mail from Mr. Keefe to
- 16 Mr. Harmon, Joe Cavaretta and Kevin Upchurch; correct?
- 17 A. I did.
- 18 Q. And you reported to them that you had a call
- 19 with Mr. Eberhardt; correct?
- 20 A. That's right.
- Q. And again, who was Mr. Eberhardt?
- 22 A. Mr. Eberhardt was the chief operating officer
- 23 for Dental Co-Op.
- Q. And you go on to state that during your
- 25 conversation with Mr. Eberhardt you told him that the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 moment he signed on with P&G direct and Komet, it was
- 2 tantamount to throwing down the gauntlet with Schein
- 3 and acting as a competitor.
- 4 Do you see that?
- 5 A. I do.
- 6 Q. What did you mean by that?
- 7 A. Up until this point, when we became aware that
- 8 the dental co-op was working with direct sale
- 9 Procter & Gamble to cancel Henry Schein business and
- 10 redirect it to Procter & Gamble, the business -- the
- 11 relationship with Dental Co-Op was one based on a
- 12 handshake and based on trust, so there was a lot of I
- 13 guess hurt feelings, you know, a breach of trust that
- 14 had happened there.
- We were surprised that Andy Eberhardt would do
- 16 something like that without alerting Henry Schein. We
- 17 considered it aggressive, and we were very concerned.
- 18 As I started talking with Andy Eberhardt, what
- 19 I discovered is that his intention was to begin to
- 20 fill his portfolio with Henry Schein direct
- 21 competitors.
- Q. Did that cause you concern?
- 23 A. It caused me concern, especially understanding
- 24 that some of those competitors, like our preventive
- 25 business, were very high-return categories of business

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 within Henry Schein.
- Q. You go on to state in your e-mail that
- 3 Mr. Eberhardt told you that he had 400 members.
- 4 Do you see that?
- 5 A. I do.
- 6 O. You also state that you told Mr. Eberhardt that
- 7 the collective volume, two million-plus, was concerning
- 8 and wondered if he felt he was able to drive
- 9 compliance.
- 10 Do you see that?
- 11 A. I do.
- 12 Q. Why was the volume of the dental cooperative
- 13 buying group concerning?
- 14 A. Based on the number of members that
- 15 Dental Co-Op had, 400, there would be an expectation
- 16 that number would be multiplied out by the average
- 17 spend for private practice dentists, which is
- 18 approximately industrywide about \$35,000 a year. When
- 19 you do the math on this, we come out to about \$5,000 a
- 20 year, so clearly we were very concerned about
- 21 compliance.
- 22 Q. And why is that? What did the \$5,000 figure
- 23 communicate to you?
- A. It meant that we were getting a very small
- 25 portion of the business from the dental co-op

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 members, that they were under -- significantly
- 2 underperforming.
- Q. You go on to say, "I think we should meet live
- 4 when he is back from his motorcycle adventure and
- 5 discover if we can become an exclusive."
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 A. I do.
- 8 Q. Were you referring to Mr. Eberhardt?
- 9 A. I was.
- 10 Q. Why did you want to discuss exclusivity with
- 11 Mr. Eberhardt?
- 12 A. I was tapped by Jeff Harmon and also endorsed
- 13 by Joe Cavaretta to turn the relationship around.
- 14 Based on my experience, the fact that I negotiated
- 15 with many customers, many large customers, they felt
- 16 confident that I had the skill set to sit down with
- 17 Andy Eberhardt and find a resolution to what was
- 18 happening, discover if there was a way that we could go
- 19 back to a healthy relationship.
- Q. You then say, "If not, it might be wise to
- 21 start thinking about an exit strategy as Andy will
- 22 surely be looking to bring more of our competitors into
- 23 his portfolio."
- 24 Do you see that?
- 25 A. I do.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. What was your concern there?
- 2 A. My concern was essentially to stop the
- 3 bleeding. We were losing significant business and we
- 4 needed to stop that, so in the out- -- outcome, if he
- 5 decided that he didn't want exclusivity, then we needed
- 6 a backup plan.
- 7 Q. And at this point, as of the date of this
- 8 e-mail in May of 2014, had Schein made a decision on
- 9 its future with the dental co-op?
- 10 A. We had not.
- 11 Q. Did you meet with Mr. Eberhardt of the
- 12 dental co-op after this e-mail?
- 13 A. I did.
- 14 Q. Do you remember approximately when that meeting
- 15 took place?
- 16 A. As I recall, Mr. Eberhardt was on a
- 17 cross-country motorcycle trip with a group of his
- 18 friends. I believe the meeting took place six to eight
- 19 weeks after the -- post this conversation.
- 20 Q. When you ultimately did meet --
- 21 JUDGE CHAPPELL: "Mr. Eastbound" was on a
- 22 motorcycle trip?
- THE WITNESS: He was.
- 24 JUDGE CHAPPELL: What's his first name?
- 25 THE WITNESS: Andy.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 BY MS. FINCHER:
- Q. Ms. Titus, when you ultimately did meet with
- 3 Mr. Eberhardt, what did you learn in that
- 4 conversation?
- 5 A. Well, unfortunately, it was more of the same.
- 6 I think Andy Eberhardt was looking to increase the
- 7 revenue that he was earning from a variety of vendors,
- 8 manufacturers that were selling into the dental
- 9 office. This was a way that he could build his revenue
- 10 stream, and he wasn't happy having an exclusive
- 11 relationship with Henry Schein. He wanted to bring
- 12 more competitors into his portfolio and offer those to
- 13 his members, our customers.
- Q. And when you say, "He wanted to bring more
- 15 competitors into his portfolio, " are you referring to
- 16 competitors of Henry Schein?
- 17 A. I am.
- 18 Q. Did you specifically ask Mr. Eberhardt in your
- 19 meeting whether the Dental Co-Op of Utah was willing to
- 20 be exclusive with Henry Schein?
- 21 A. I did. I asked him if he would consider
- 22 canceling the relationship that he had with the
- 23 competitors that he brought on board.
- Q. What was his response?
- 25 A. A definitive no.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Did that create any issues for Schein?
- 2 A. It did. It did create issues for Schein.
- 3 Q. Now, after that meeting with Mr. Eberhardt,
- 4 did you ultimately make a recommendation as to the
- 5 future of the dental co-op's relationship with
- 6 Henry Schein?
- 7 A. I did.
- 8 Q. Who did you make that recommendation to?
- 9 A. I made the recommendation to the management
- 10 team, starting with my boss, Joe Cavaretta,
- 11 Kevin Upchurch, who was the zone general manager for
- 12 the area, and then Jeff Harmon, who was the regional
- manager.
- 14 Q. And what was your recommendation with respect
- 15 to the Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 16 A. My recommendation is that the relationship was
- 17 clearly not healthy for Henry Schein. It was
- 18 cannibalizing existing business and disrupting
- 19 relationships that we had long-term with our
- 20 customers.
- 21 My recommendation was that we leave the door
- 22 open, because again it was a long-term relationship,
- 23 and it was our desire to salvage it, but that it was
- 24 very risky and actually we could measure and manage
- 25 that and that it was one that we should decline doing

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 business with.
- Q. Did anyone at Schein ask you to end Schein's
- 3 relationship with the dental cooperative?
- 4 A. They did not.
- Q. Kurt, if you could please pull up CX 2211.
- 6 Ms. Titus, this is a July 18, 2014 e-mail chain
- 7 relating to a call that you had with Kevin Upchurch and
- 8 Jeff Harmon at Schein regarding the dental co-op;
- 9 correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. Did this internal call take place after you had
- 12 your meeting with Mr. Eberhardt of the Dental Co-Op of
- 13 Utah?
- 14 A. It did.
- 15 Q. Now, Kurt, if you could turn to page 3,
- 16 please.
- 17 Mr. Upchurch e-mails Joe Cavaretta, copying you
- 18 and Jeff Harmon, and says, "We had a good call today
- 19 with Jeff and KT about the Utah (soon to be multi
- 20 state) Co-Op."
- 21 Do you see that?
- 22 A. I do.
- Q. Does "KT" refer to you?
- 24 A. It does.
- Q. What did you, Mr. Harmon and Mr. Upchurch

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- discuss on this call about the Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 2 A. Essentially, I debriefed them on our live
- 3 meeting. Jeff Harmon was present at that meeting.
- 4 We discussed the fact that Andy was acting in a
- 5 predatory manner, cannibalizing existing business. We
- 6 discussed the fact that he was unwilling, in fact
- 7 committed to continuing to bring on competitors into
- 8 his portfolio as an offering to his 400 members.
- 9 Q. Mr. Upchurch goes on to say, "We will no longer
- 10 be a part of the Utah Co-Op."
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- 0. Were you involved in the decision-making
- 14 process to end Schein's relationship with the co-op?
- 15 A. I was involved in providing a debrief and an
- 16 evaluation and a recommendation.
- 17 Q. Do you know who ultimately made the final
- 18 decision to no longer work with the dental co-op?
- 19 A. I believe it was Kevin Upchurch.
- 20 Q. And do you know why Mr. Upchurch ultimately
- 21 decided not to continue to work with the dental co-op?
- 22 A. I do.
- Q. Why is that?
- 24 A. Kevin had -- as the zone general manager, like
- 25 myself, was responsible for the P&L and the sales and

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 for growing those sales in that region, and this was
- 2 hurting our sales. This was cannibalizing existing
- 3 business. This was no longer a healthy relationship
- 4 and was in fact putting our business, our future
- 5 business, at significant risk.
- 6 O. Even though Schein decided to no longer partner
- 7 with the dental co-op, did Schein continue to give
- 8 discounts to members of the co-op?
- 9 A. They did.
- 10 Q. Now, if we -- go to page 2, please.
- 11 And this is an e-mail further up the chain and
- 12 an e-mail from Mr. Kevin Upchurch.
- He writes, "The Co-Op is turning into a GPO
- 14 (even if they don't think they are one now), from what
- 15 KT has observed in Texas, NM and from Tim S, HSD does
- 16 not want to enter the GPO world."
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 Q. Do you believe that's an accurate statement?
- 20 A. I do not.
- 21 Q. Why not?
- 22 A. One, I think Kevin had just a very cursory
- 23 knowledge of what we were doing in the buying group or
- 24 GPO world. I think he doesn't have a good
- 25 understanding of what a GPO was because, in essence,

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Dental Co-Op was a GPO or a buying group.
- Q. Was Henry Schein in the GPO world as of the
- 3 date of this e-mail, July 2014?
- 4 A. We definitely were.
- 5 Q. Did you ever tell Mr. Upchurch that
- 6 Henry Schein Dental did not want to enter the GPO
- 7 world?
- 8 A. I did not.
- 9 Q. Did Tim Sullivan ever tell you that
- 10 Henry Schein Dental did not want to enter the GPO
- 11 world?
- 12 A. He did not.
- Q. Did Mr. Sullivan ever tell you not to work with
- 14 GPOs or buying groups?
- 15 A. He did not.
- Q. Did Mr. Sullivan ever express to you any
- 17 negative views about GPOs or buying groups?
- 18 A. Absolutely not.
- 19 O. Ms. Titus, did Schein's decision to end its
- 20 relationship with the dental co-op have anything to do
- 21 with the fact that it was a buying group or GPO?
- 22 A. None whatsoever.
- 23 O. Did Schein's decision to end its relationship
- 24 with the Dental Co-Op of Utah have anything to do with
- 25 Patterson or Benco?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. None whatsoever.
- Q. Now, Ms. Titus -- Kurt, you can take that
- 3 down -- I'd like to talk to you about some of the
- 4 buying groups that were transferred from
- 5 Special Markets to Henry Schein Dental with the
- 6 creation of the Mid Market Division.
- 7 A. Okav.
- 8 Q. Which buying group relationships did
- 9 Henry Schein Dental inherit from Special Markets at the
- 10 time Mid Market was created?
- 11 A. The two that come to mind immediately are
- 12 Breakaway Practice and Steadfast Medical.
- 0. After these two buying groups transferred over
- 14 from Special Markets to Mid Market, did you engage in
- 15 any fact-finding regarding those groups?
- 16 A. I did.
- 17 O. Why did you do that?
- 18 A. I was the director and a new director for our
- 19 Mid Market emerging group practice. These customers
- 20 were doing a significant amount of business with
- 21 Henry Schein. I didn't know anything about them, and
- 22 it was my job to develop a profile of that customer
- 23 that I could understand their needs more thoroughly and
- 24 I could engage the right resources to grow their
- 25 business.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Did anyone at Schein specifically instruct you
- 2 to look into the Steadfast Medical buying group
- 3 relationship?
- 4 A. Absolutely not.
- 5 Q. Did anyone from Schein specifically instruct
- 6 you to look into the Breakaway buying group
- 7 relationship?
- 8 A. Absolutely not.
- 9 Q. So let's talk a little bit more about
- 10 Steadfast Medical.
- 11 A. Okay.
- 12 Q. After looking into Steadfast Medical, what did
- 13 you learn?
- 14 A. Steadfast Medical was a buying group with a
- 15 procurement model.
- Q. What do you mean by "a procurement model"?
- 17 A. Steadfast Medical was strictly looking to
- 18 enroll members to gain discounts on consumable
- 19 supplies.
- 20 Q. Were there any issues that you uncovered with
- 21 respect to Steadfast's procurement model that were of
- 22 concern to Henry Schein?
- 23 A. There were many. I would say one of the
- 24 biggest concerns is that when we looked at their member
- 25 list, which was my habit, to first look at the member

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 list, and we took those very same members and looked at
- them from the year before, and our business was down
- 3 nearly half with the same customers.
- 4 Q. In other words, you had looked at a group of
- 5 existing Schein customers prior to them joining
- 6 Steadfast in terms of the amount of sales and then
- 7 looked at the total sales once they had joined
- 8 Steadfast; is that right?
- 9 A. That's correct. We looked at the collective
- 10 business of those said members, those very same
- 11 members, the previous year and then looked at it at the
- 12 same time the following year, and our business was down
- 13 almost 50 percent.
- 14 O. And what was your reaction to learning this
- 15 information regarding Steadfast, specifically the
- 16 decline in Schein's business?
- 17 A. I was very shocked and I was very concerned.
- 18 Q. What steps did you take next after learning
- 19 that information?
- 20 A. Again, I needed to find out why and I needed
- 21 to go to Steadfast as the source of that information.
- 22 What I learned following those inquiries further gave
- 23 me concern.
- 24 What I learned is that we had a group of
- 25 offices that were their members. They were taking

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 orders from that group of offices and they were farming
- 2 it out to the lowest bidder with four or five of our
- 3 competitors.
- 4 Q. Kurt, if you could pull up RX 2207, please.
- 5 Ms. Titus, this is an April 24 -- I don't think
- 6 that's the right one. Maybe try CX.
- 7 There we go.
- 8 Ms. Titus, this is an April 24, 2014 e-mail
- 9 from you to Joe Cavaretta and Dean Kyle regarding
- 10 Steadfast Medical.
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- 0. And in this e-mail you state, "Under their
- 14 current model, it is my recommendation that we cease
- 15 doing business with Steadfast."
- 16 Do you see that?
- 17 A. I do.
- 18 Q. What factors did you consider in making that
- 19 recommendation?
- 20 A. First and most concerning is that our business
- 21 was going the opposite direction. Instead of growing,
- 22 we were shrinking and we were shrinking significantly.
- 23 Secondly, what we learned is that they were
- 24 offering no added value to the customer whatsoever.
- Third, they were standing between us and our

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 customer. We knew that they took the order, and they
- 2 discouraged us from having any engagement directly
- 3 with the customer, which was not our model.
- 4 These were independent oral surgery and perio
- 5 offices. We have a full portfolio of services,
- 6 equipment, technology to sell to these groups, and we
- 7 were being asked not to engage directly with those
- 8 customers. That was part of the original strategy that
- 9 we wanted that access.
- 10 Also we discovered that one of these -- the
- 11 member offices would take an order that was earmarked
- 12 for Henry Schein, and Steadfast would take that very
- 13 same order and they would redistribute it to our
- 14 competitors. We would get a portion of it.
- So let's say, for example, it was a
- 16 \$3,000 order. We might realize somewhere between
- 17 \$500 and \$1,000 instead of the larger order that the
- 18 customer had earmarked for Schein.
- 19 Q. Did Steadfast ask your permission to
- 20 redistribute the Schein customer order to your
- 21 competitors?
- 22 A. They did not.
- Q. And I'm assuming by your testimony, Ms. Titus,
- 24 that Schein did not have any notice that that was how
- 25 Steadfast would be operating?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That is correct. We had no notice and we were
- 2 very unhappy about it.
- Q. Ms. Titus, is this e-mail that we're looking at
- 4 now on CX 2207 -- is this a listing of the factors you
- 5 considered in making your recommendation to end the
- 6 relationship with Steadfast Medical?
- 7 A. Essentially, it is. It's dual. I was
- 8 gathering information about the characteristics and the
- 9 business practices of Steadfast Medical and, by
- 10 contrast, demonstrating that these were -- putting a
- 11 discerning eye on it, these were the things that
- 12 constituted a very poor relationship for Henry Schein.
- Q. Ms. Titus, anywhere in this e-mail or the
- 14 number of bulleted factors you list do you have any
- 15 references to Benco or Patterson?
- 16 A. I had no idea, and there are no references
- 17 whatsoever.
- 18 Q. Why not?
- 19 A. It wasn't a concern to me. I was there on
- 20 behalf of Henry Schein.
- Q. Ms. Titus, what steps, if any, did you take
- 22 next with respect to Steadfast?
- A. Again, my practice was that we had tremendous
- 24 reverence for our customers. All of our customers are
- 25 precious to us, and I took on that mantle that every

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 relationship can be corrected with proper negotiation,
- 2 so that was my plan, was to seek out and engage with
- 3 their executive and start a process of dialogue sort of
- 4 coming to an agreement of a win-win for both
- 5 stakeholders.
- 6 Q. Kurt, can you pull up RX 2201, please.
- 7 Ms. Titus, this is an April 28, 2014 e-mail
- 8 chain regarding Steadfast Medical; correct?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 Q. And earlier in the chain you exchanged some
- 11 e-mails with Jon Staples regarding setting up a
- 12 meeting; is that right?
- 13 A. That's right.
- Q. And who is Jon Staples?
- 15 A. Jon Staples is the CEO for Steadfast Medical.
- 16 Q. Now, you tell Mr. Staples in your e-mail here
- 17 on April 22, 2014 that you and Mr. Cavaretta -- was
- 18 that "Joe" Mr. Cavaretta?
- 19 A. That's Joe Cavaretta.
- 20 Q. -- that you and Mr. Cavaretta agree, "in order
- 21 to continue to support your growth, we [sic] need to
- 22 have a better understanding of how you allocate to the
- 23 distribution network and discover if there is [a] way
- 24 to create a better collaboration that provides
- 25 prosperity to all the stakeholders."

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Do you see that?
- 2 A. I do.
- 3 Q. What were you intending to communicate there?
- 4 A. What I wanted Mr. Staples to know is that we
- 5 were concerned about the business, number one. I had
- 6 expressed in another, I think another message that our
- 7 business was trending down, that we were very
- 8 concerned about that and we didn't have access to --
- 9 directly to the customers.
- I wanted to let him know that we were willing
- 11 to have a discussion with him about their practices
- 12 and see if we could find a reciprocity or a mutuality
- 13 that would be a win-win for all of us so that we could
- 14 all prosper. At this point Henry Schein was the one
- 15 that was being significantly hurt.
- Q. Kurt, if you could flip to an earlier page,
- 17 please.
- 18 Try page 2.
- 19 Actually, go to page 1, please, the bottom.
- You go on to tell Mr. Staples in your e-mail
- 21 here, "Unfortunately, our reporting shows that under
- 22 Steadfast Medical, business for that same group of
- 23 customers is trending down."
- 24 Do you see that?
- 25 A. I do.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. Are you referring there to the discovery you
- 2 made in looking at the group of Henry Schein customers
- 3 that you mentioned earlier --
- 4 MS. GOFF: Objection.
- 5 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 6 O. -- it was business --
- 7 MS. GOFF: Sorry.
- 8 MS. FINCHER: If I could finish my question,
- 9 please.
- 10 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 11 Q. Ms. Titus, what are you referring to there in
- 12 terms of business for the same group of customers was
- 13 trending down?
- 14 A. We had Steadfast member lists because we had
- opened all of those accounts on behalf of Steadfast's
- 16 request. We also had their information from the
- 17 previous year for the same group of customers.
- 18 We looked at the collective sales for that same
- 19 group of customers from the previous year and at the
- 20 same month we looked at those same customer sales, and
- 21 we were significantly down.
- Q. By how much?
- 23 A. Somewhere closer to half.
- Q. You then say, "My guess is that Steadfast is
- 25 reallocating that business to other suppliers."

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Do you see that?
- 2 A. I do.
- 3 Q. Did you ever confirm that Steadfast was
- 4 reallocating Schein's --
- 5 A. I did.
- 6 JUDGE CHAPPELL: You need to wait for her to
- 7 finish the question.
- 8 THE WITNESS: Yes. I'm sorry, Judge.
- 9 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 10 Q. Ms. Titus, if you could please read, very
- 11 slowly, the portion of your e-mail that begins "To be
- 12 clear."
- 13 A. (As read): To be clear, we are not against
- 14 having GPO partnerships. Quite the contrary, we have a
- 15 number of them which all parties are in a position to
- 16 win. I would like to think that it is possible with
- 17 Steadfast as well. I hope you -- your understanding --
- 18 you understanding our position, Jon, but in order to
- 19 continue we need to find a common ground that makes
- 20 financial and business sense for all of the
- 21 stakeholders.
- Q. Ms. Titus, are you telling a buying group, in
- 23 the middle of the alleged conspiracy, that you have a
- 24 number of GPO partnerships in which all parties are in
- 25 a position to win?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I am.
- Q. Are you telling a buying group, in the middle
- 3 of the alleged conspiracy, that you would like to
- 4 think a win-win relationship is possible with them as
- 5 well?
- 6 A. I am.
- 7 O. As the date of this e-mail, Ms. Titus, did you
- 8 want to continue to work with Steadfast?
- 9 A. Very much so.
- 10 Q. Ultimately, did a meeting between Mr. Staples
- 11 and Mr. Cavaretta ever occur?
- 12 A. Unfortunately not.
- 13 O. Why not?
- 14 A. After multiple attempts to set up a time to
- 15 meet with Mr. Staples and we were willing to fly to his
- 16 location and also offering alternatives like conference
- 17 calls, Mr. Staples stopped responding.
- 18 Q. Did you ultimately recommend ending the
- 19 relationship with Steadfast Medical?
- 20 A. I did.
- 21 Q. Why?
- 22 A. I felt that we had a partner who was unwilling
- 23 to compromise or negotiate and was demonstrating that
- 24 by his lack of response.
- Q. Kurt, if you could pull up RX 2208, please.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Ms. Titus, this is a June 16, 2014 e-mail chain
- 2 with Mr. Staples.
- 3 Do you see that?
- 4 A. I do.
- 5 Q. Is this the e-mail in which you inform
- 6 Mr. Staples that Schein is no longer able to do
- 7 business with Steadfast?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. And if you could turn to page 2, please.
- 10 And I'd like to draw your attention to your
- 11 e-mail here, where you say, "After examination of your
- 12 GPO business model we have concluded that continuation
- of our current relationship is counter to our business
- 14 practices."
- 15 Do you see that?
- 16 A. I do.
- 17 Q. What did you mean by "counter to our business
- 18 practices"?
- 19 A. Our business practices were intended to grow
- 20 business and to work collaboratively in a healthy
- 21 relationship with a buying group. What we were seeing
- 22 here is a buying group that -- that was in violation,
- 23 for lack of a better word, of two of our most critical
- 24 strategic components, exclusivity and growing the
- 25 business through compliance.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. Was Steadfast's model counter to Schein's
- 2 business practices solely because it was a GPO or
- 3 buying group?
- 4 A. Absolutely not.
- 5 Q. Who ultimately made the decision to end the
- 6 relationship with Steadfast?
- 7 A. Ultimately the decision was made by Randy Foley
- 8 in Special Markets.
- 9 Q. And do you know why Mr. Foley ultimately made
- 10 the decision to end the relationship with Steadfast?
- 11 A. Because the customer Steadfast was -- had --
- 12 Randy Foley had oversight on that, that particular
- 13 buying group.
- Q. You also tell Mr. Staples in the same e-mail,
- 15 "If at some future date you are interested in
- 16 exploring an exclusive relationship with Henry Schein,
- 17 we would welcome revisiting a mutually beneficial
- 18 partnership."
- 19 Do you see that?
- 20 A. I do.
- Q. Why did you tell Steadfast that?
- 22 A. I told Steadfast that because I was
- 23 disappointed that we couldn't find a way to muscle
- 24 through the differences in the way we saw the world
- 25 and that we really wanted to redeem the relationship,

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 but only in a way where we weren't -- Steadfast wasn't
- 2 cannibalizing our business and we weren't losing ground
- 3 so quickly.
- Q. Kurt, if you could turn to page 1, please.
- 5 Ms. Titus, do you believe that you left things
- 6 on good terms with Steadfast Medical buying group?
- 7 A. I do. And I was very respectful of Steadfast
- 8 and their right to do business the way that they wanted
- 9 to, but I always felt that there was a hope that we
- 10 could revisit at a later date.
- 11 Q. And if you take a look at Mr. Staples' e-mail
- 12 to you, his response on June 16, 2014, he tells you,
- 13 "While we are disappointed that you have chosen to no
- 14 longer partner with us, I wanted to let you know that
- 15 your company was a very good partner"; is that right?
- 16 A. That's right.
- 17 Q. And do you recall Mr. Staples expressing that
- 18 sentiment to you?
- 19 A. I do.
- 20 Q. Did Mr. Staples ever reach out to you again
- 21 about a potential partnership between Schein and
- 22 Steadfast buying group?
- 23 A. Unfortunately, he did not.
- Q. Did Schein nevertheless undertake efforts to
- 25 still retain the business of its Steadfast members?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. We did.
- Q. You can take that down, Kurt. Thank you.
- 3 I'd like to talk now about Breakaway.
- 4 Are you familiar with a group called Breakaway,
- 5 Ms. Titus?
- 6 A. I am.
- 7 O. What is Breakaway?
- 8 A. Breakaway is a buying group.
- 9 Q. Did Breakaway have a business relationship with
- 10 Henry Schein?
- 11 A. They did.
- 12 Q. Who formed the relationship with Breakaway
- 13 buying group?
- 14 A. The relationship initially was formed with
- 15 Special Markets.
- 16 Q. Did Breakaway get transferred to
- 17 Henry Schein Dental with the creation of the
- 18 Mid Market Division?
- 19 A. Correct.
- Q. Prior to 2014, was Special Markets doing
- 21 business with Breakaway?
- 22 A. They were.
- Q. Did Breakaway fall into your area of
- 24 responsibility once you moved over to
- 25 Henry Schein Dental?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. They did.
- Q. What, if anything, happened with Breakaway
- 3 buying group after it was transferred to
- 4 Henry Schein Dental?
- 5 A. I needed to develop a relationship with
- 6 Breakaway. As I said, they were doing a significant
- 7 amount of business with Henry Schein, and I didn't know
- 8 very much about them and yet I was responsible for
- 9 growing sales with Breakaway and other customers, so my
- 10 first order of business was to collect information from
- 11 my internal peer group.
- 12 Q. Did Mr. Cavaretta ever ask you to look into or
- 13 evaluate Breakaway?
- 14 A. He did not.
- 15 Q. Did anyone else at Henry Schein ever ask you to
- 16 look into or evaluate Breakaway buying group?
- 17 A. They did not.
- Q. Then why did you, Kathleen Titus, look into
- 19 Breakaway?
- 20 A. I have a very strong work ethic, and I believe
- 21 that we should deliver the best of class to our
- 22 customers. I didn't know very much about Breakaway,
- 23 other than they were a buying group. I wanted to know
- 24 more about them.
- 25 The reason I wanted to know more about them is

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 it was my job to grow business with people like
- 2 Breakaway Dental, and I was seeking to understand who
- 3 they were, what their needs were and how we could work
- 4 together to introduce more Henry Schein products and
- 5 services into their environment.
- 6 O. Did Henry Schein Dental continue to do
- 7 business with Breakaway buying group after it was
- 8 transferred from Special Markets with the creation of
- 9 Mid Market?
- 10 A. Yes, we did. Not only did we continue to do
- 11 business with them, but we continued to grow their
- 12 business and we still are doing business with them.
- 0. Kurt, if you could please pull up RX 2718.
- Ms. Titus, you sent this e-mail on
- 15 May 9, 2014 to a number of folks at Henry Schein
- 16 regarding Breakaway Dental.
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 O. And the subject is: Breakaway Dental -
- 20 URGENTLY SEEKING INFO ON THE CORPORATE RELATIONSHIP.
- 21 Do you see that?
- 22 A. I do.
- Q. And why did you send this e-mail?
- 24 A. This goes back to my statement about seeking
- 25 to understand from my team members first on what they

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 knew about Breakaway's business model, what they knew
- 2 about their footprint, their vision, their mission,
- 3 again, just collecting information so I could build a
- 4 profile.
- Q. You say in your e-mail, "There is no question;
- 6 Breakaway's business model has a GPO component and we
- 7 are supporting it."
- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. Did you determine, when you first looked into
- 11 Breakaway, that it was a buying group?
- 12 A. I did.
- Q. You then go on to say, "This is causing a lot
- 14 of confusion and misinformation, especially as when a
- 15 new affiliate opens the local HSD team are not provided
- 16 background."
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 O. So what was the nature of the confusion
- 20 regarding Breakaway at this time?
- 21 A. So Breakaway had an extremely large national
- 22 footprint. They were doing business with private
- 23 practice dentists, and those dentists were building
- 24 practices throughout the United States.
- 25 When a new Breakaway Practice or a new

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Breakaway member was opening in a location that had a
- 2 distant geography from the home office in San Antonio,
- 3 Texas, there was no communication with the local team
- 4 that was required to engage with that practice and --
- 5 and help them with what they needed to get their office
- 6 opened.
- 7 Q. You then go on to say, "If we are going to
- 8 continue our relationship, I need to put a system of
- 9 communication in place so that we have cooperation from
- 10 our local teams."
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- Q. What were you envisioning in terms of a system
- of communication related to Breakaway?
- 15 A. What I was envisioning was sharing information
- 16 with the team holders in other geographies so that
- 17 they would know who Breakaway is. They would know what
- 18 offerings that we had in place for Breakaway Dental.
- 19 And frankly, I felt that Breakaway Dental and our local
- 20 people deserved to all be part of the same mission so
- 21 that we could take good care of their customers when
- 22 they opened.
- 23 O. Did Schein in fact continue to do business with
- 24 Breakaway Dental buying group?
- 25 A. We did.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. To your knowledge, did Schein ever enter into a
- 2 formal contract with Breakaway?
- 3 A. We did.
- 4 Q. Ms. Titus, are you aware that the FTC alleges
- 5 that Schein was involved in a conspiracy not to do
- 6 business with buying groups from 2011 to 2015?
- 7 A. I am.
- 8 Q. To your knowledge, did Schein continue to do
- 9 business with the Breakaway buying group throughout
- 10 that entire alleged conspiracy period?
- 11 A. Throughout the entire period.
- 12 Q. Kurt, you can take that down. Thank you.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: How much more time do you
- 14 think you need?
- 15 MS. FINCHER: Not long. Probably ten minutes.
- 16 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Go ahead.
- 17 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 18 Q. Are you familiar with a group called
- 19 Klear Impakt?
- 20 A. I am.
- Q. And what is Klear Impakt?
- 22 A. Klear Impakt is a buying group.
- 23 Q. Okay. And Kurt, if you could pull up CX 2208.
- Now, this is a January 22, 2015 e-mail chain
- in which you forward an e-mail from Rich Johnson;

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 correct?
- 2 A. Correct.
- 3 Q. Who is Rich Johnson?
- 4 A. Rich Johnson is one of the principals at
- 5 Klear Impakt buying group.
- 6 O. And when did you initially engage in
- 7 discussions with the Klear Impakt buying group?
- 8 A. Again, using the strategy and the criteria
- 9 that we had developed, my first order of business was
- 10 to collect information on who they were, their scope
- of membership, who those members were, what their
- 12 vision and their mission, whether they were aligned in
- 13 their values and their integrity that they would serve
- 14 our brand well and we would serve theirs well, whether
- 15 they could offer us exclusivity, whether they could
- 16 promote our business solutions portfolio which
- 17 included education and nonclinical business services,
- 18 and whether they could comply, their members would
- 19 comply, with an agreement with Henry Schein as a prime
- 20 vendor.
- 21 Q. And during what time do you recall originally
- 22 engaging in those discussions and negotiations with
- 23 Klear Impakt?
- 24 A. As I recall, it was Q4 of 2014.
- Q. Okay. And Kurt, if you could turn to page 2,

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 please.
- 2 And this is an e-mail that you sent to the
- 3 Klear Impakt buying group; correct?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 Q. And if you look down in your e-mail, you say,
- 6 "Klearimpakt is a testimony that not all are created
- 7 equal... oh, and the cream just rises to the top!"
- 8 Do you see that?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. What were you expressing to Klear Impakt
- 11 there?
- 12 A. That I liked them very much and that they fit
- 13 our criteria extremely well.
- 14 Q. And then you also say that you feel "encouraged
- 15 that our Senior leadership will want to continue the
- 16 discussion."
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 O. How did you know that?
- 20 A. Again, I knew that they fit our criteria or
- 21 strategy for engaging with buying groups that would
- 22 present a healthy relationship for all the stakeholders
- 23 and would grow the Henry Schein business.
- I also liked the fact that they had a lot of
- 25 infrastructure built into their model, that they were

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 offering education and other supportive services to
- 2 support their dentists, making them better providers
- 3 and deliverers of healthcare.
- 4 Q. So did you think at this point in time that
- 5 Klear Impakt might be a good fit for Schein?
- 6 A. I thought it would be a very good fit for
- 7 Schein.
- 8 Q. During this evaluation process that I believe
- 9 you said began in late 2014 and then continued on into
- 10 early 2015, did anyone at Schein ever tell you not to
- 11 do business with the Klear Impakt buying group?
- 12 A. They did not.
- 0. Did anybody at Henry Schein Dental ever ask
- 14 you to end negotiations with the Klear Impakt buying
- 15 group?
- 16 A. They did not.
- 17 Q. What did Schein ultimately decide to do with
- 18 Klear Impakt?
- 19 A. Ultimately we entered a contract, a prime
- 20 vendor agreement with Klear Impakt, which is still
- 21 current today.
- 22 Q. Kurt, you can take that down, please.
- 23 Ms. Titus, are you familiar with a group called
- 24 Dentistry Unchained?
- 25 A. I am.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. What type of group is Dentistry Unchained?
- 2 A. It's a buying group.
- 3 Q. Is that another buying group that you vetted?
- 4 A. That's correct.
- 5 Q. And how was the group bought to your
- 6 attention?
- 7 A. The group was brought to my --
- 8 Dentistry Unchained was brought to my attention by the
- 9 regional manager for Colorado, Mr. Rudy Wolf.
- 10 Q. Did you enter into negotiations with the
- 11 Dentistry Unchained buying group?
- 12 A. I did.
- Q. Approximately when did those negotiations
- 14 begin?
- 15 A. If recollection is correct, I believe it was
- 16 2015.
- 17 Q. And how long were you in negotiations with the
- 18 Dentistry Unchained buying group?
- 19 A. Oh, close to a year.
- 20 Q. And did Schein end up partnering with
- 21 Dentistry Unchained?
- 22 A. We did not.
- Q. And why not?
- 24 A. There were a number of disturbing factors that
- 25 came up. As we were learning more about

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Dentistry Unchained and our negotiations moved along,
- 2 exclusivity and compliance were a very big part of what
- 3 the discussions were. They met that criteria.
- 4 Unfortunately, towards the end of the
- 5 negotiations, we made a discovery that was extremely
- 6 disturbing and we felt was a breach of trust.
- 7 Dentistry Unchained launched a website in which they
- 8 were featuring, prominently featuring, our competitor
- 9 for some technology and for also some business
- 10 solutions, two of our most important units of
- 11 business.
- 12 Q. Did Dentistry Unchained buying group ever tell
- 13 you during your negotiations that it had entered into a
- 14 competitive relationship with another distributor?
- 15 A. They did not.
- 16 Q. What did Schein decide to do with respect to
- 17 the Dentistry Unchained opportunity?
- 18 A. Again, the practice was to see if we could find
- 19 a compromise. That compromise would be to sever the
- 20 relationship and remove competitive information from
- 21 their website. They refused.
- Q. Ms. Titus, in your opinion, did Schein's
- 23 decision-making with respect to Dentistry Unchained in
- 24 the 2015 to 2016 period differ in any way from prior
- 25 evaluations of buying groups?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. It did not.
- 2 JUDGE CHAPPELL: You need to --
- 3 THE WITNESS: We --
- 4 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Hold it.
- 5 You need to rephrase that. You're asking a
- 6 fact witness, a lay witness, for an opinion. Either
- 7 ask her a question or don't.
- 8 MS. FINCHER: Okay.
- 9 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 10 Q. Ms. Titus, as part of your experience in
- 11 evaluating buying groups at Henry Schein, was there
- 12 anything that stood out to you in terms of the
- 13 Dentistry Unchained evaluation that differed in any
- 14 way from any of your prior evaluations of buying
- 15 groups?
- 16 A. It did not. In fact, the standards were the
- 17 same. They were just more formula -- more form -- more
- 18 formal and better articulated.
- 19 Q. Now, Ms. Titus, I'd like you -- to bring to you
- 20 very quickly to the present.
- 21 What's the process like now when a buying group
- 22 approaches Schein?
- 23 A. Today we have a resource. We hired this
- 24 resource in and created a sub- -- subset of our
- 25 Mid Market business unit. We call it alternative

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 purchasing. And we have resources allocated to engage
- 2 directly with new buying groups.
- Q. Do you believe that your efforts in the
- 4 2014 time frame to formalize a buying group strategy at
- 5 Schein were successful?
- 6 A. Yes, I do. I believe that my work -- I poured
- 7 a lot of time and effort into this. I believe that I
- 8 helped to formalize it. I believe that I helped to
- 9 standardize it, and I believe that the work that I did
- 10 is very much a by-product of where we are today with a
- 11 dedicated division to help these groups.
- 12 Q. Ms. Titus, at any time during your employment
- 13 at Henry Schein, has Benco or Patterson's strategy
- 14 related to GPOs or buying groups impacted in any way
- 15 Schein's decision-making with respect to buying
- 16 groups?
- 17 A. It has not.
- 18 It has always been my goal to do what's right
- 19 for Henry Schein. It has always been my goal to work
- 20 on behalf of creating good relationships and to grow
- 21 sales for Henry Schein. My competitors were never part
- 22 of the discussion process.
- 23 MS. FINCHER: That's all I have, Your Honor.
- 24 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Will there be any cross?
- MS. GOFF: There will be, yes, Your Honor.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

1	JUDGE CHAPPELL: How much time do you think you		
2	need?		
3	MS. GOFF: An hour and a half.		
4	JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. How much time do		
5	you need for lunch today?		
6	MR. McDONALD: Whatever you want, Your Honor,		
7	we can do it. Half hour, 45 minutes, whatever you		
8	want.		
9	JUDGE CHAPPELL: 45 minutes okay with you?		
10	MS. GOFF: Sure, Your Honor.		
11	JUDGE CHAPPELL: We'll reconvene at 3:00 p.m.		
12	That's 47 minutes.		
13	(Whereupon, at 2:12 p.m., a lunch recess was		
14	taken.)		
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

Benco Dental	Supply	y, et al.
--------------	--------	-----------

2/8/2019

- 1 AFTERNOON SESSION
- 2 (3:03 p.m.)
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Okay. We're back on the
- 4 record.
- 5 During the direct examination of this witness,
- 6 I pointed out the attorney was asking for an opinion
- 7 from a lay or fact witness. And apparently, the
- 8 witness did not hear me and answered, which I just
- 9 realized.
- 10 That question and that response will not be
- 11 considered and will not be cited for any proposition or
- issue in this case. It's currently at 2:09 p.m.
- 13 line 23 through 2:09 p.m. line 1.
- 14 Proceed.
- MR. GEORGE: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 16 - -
- 17 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 18 BY MR. GEORGE:
- 19 O. Hello, Ms. Titus.
- 20 My name is Andrew George -- we haven't met
- 21 before. My name is Andrew George, and I represent
- 22 Patterson. It's nice to meet you.
- 23 A. Thank you.
- Q. You said on direct I believe that you felt
- 25 personally diminished by the accusation that Schein

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 conspired with Patterson and Benco not to work with
- 2 buying groups; is that right?
- 3 A. I did.
- 4 Q. Are you aware that the FTC has listed you in
- 5 sworn court documents as a person who has knowledge of
- 6 such an agreement?
- 7 A. I am not.
- 8 Q. Kurt, can you please pull up RX 2958.
- 9 MS. GOFF: Your Honor, I'm going to object.
- 10 The witness is not on this document, has no basis to
- 11 testify about this document. And in addition,
- 12 Ms. Titus is not on Patterson's witness list.
- 13 MR. GEORGE: Whether or not she's on our
- 14 witness list doesn't -- isn't particularly relevant.
- 15 She is named in the document, and that's the part that
- 16 I'm going to point her to.
- 17 MS. GOFF: Your Honor, this is a legal document
- 18 related to discovery in this matter, has no bearing on
- 19 Ms. Titus' testimony. She's here to provide facts that
- 20 she knows.
- 21 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Discovery in the case is
- 22 relevant. Discovery in the case may be inquired into
- 23 and upon when a witness is on the stand. Your
- 24 objection is overruled.
- 25 MS. GOFF: Okay. Thank you, Your Honor.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 BY MR. GEORGE:
- Q. Kurt, can you please turn to page 10 -- 010 --
- 3 thank you -- and call out -- thank you.
- 4 Do you see, Ms. Titus, the line that begins,
- 5 "The following persons have knowledge of the facts
- 6 supporting the allegations in Paragraphs 7, 8 and
- 7 36 and the finding of the agreement alleged in the
- 8 Complaint"?
- 9 Do you see that, Ms. Titus?
- 10 A. I do.
- 11 Q. And then if you can turn to the top of the next
- 12 page.
- Do you see your name listed there at the top,
- 14 Ms. Titus?
- 15 A. I do.
- 16 O. Is that a true statement?
- 17 Do you have knowledge of the facts of this --
- 18 of a -- an agreement in this case?
- 19 A. I'm not sure I understand the question.
- 20 I'm sorry.
- Q. Sure. I'm sorry.
- Is this statement true about you?
- 23 A. That I have knowledge of the facts?
- Q. Supporting the allegations in the FTC's
- 25 complaint is that the -- that there was a conspiracy in

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 this case?
- 2 A. That is not true.
- 3 Q. Are you aware that the FTC has also named you
- 4 in sworn court documents as a person who either
- 5 referred to or enforced a conspiracy with Patterson and
- 6 Benco?
- 7 A. I was not aware of that.
- 8 Q. Kurt, could you please pull up RX 2957 and turn
- 9 to page 13.
- 10 Specifically, right in the middle, "Other
- 11 Schein executives, " the middle of that page.
- Do you see that paragraph there, Kurt?
- Okay. And you see the part that he just
- 14 highlighted at the beginning of that sentence, "Other
- 15 Schein executives and employees also referred to and/or
- 16 enforced Schein's policy not to provide discounts to or
- 17 compete for the business of Buying Groups,
- 18 including" -- and your name is listed, Kathleen Titus.
- 19 Is that a true statement?
- 20 A. That is not a true statement.
- 21 Q. Have you ever referred to or enforced a
- 22 conspiracy involving Patterson?
- A. No, I have not, and there was no conspiracy.
- Q. Well, let's look back at CX 2220, which was
- 25 brought up during Ms. Fincher's questioning.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Do you remember giving a deposition in this
- 2 case?
- 3 A. I do.
- 4 Q. And do you remember being asked about this
- 5 document during your deposition?
- 6 A. Not specifically, but there were a lot of
- 7 documents.
- 8 Q. Fair enough.
- 9 Would you ever testify that this document shows
- 10 Patterson participating in a conspiracy?
- 11 A. I would not.
- 12 Q. Kurt, can you please pull up RX 2958, and go to
- 13 page 10.
- Now, I'm going to represent to you, Ms. Titus,
- 15 that this number at the end of paragraph 3,
- 16 Henry Schein 000003664, that's the document we just
- 17 looked at.
- 18 A. Okay.
- 19 Q. Now, Kurt, if you could turn to page 25 of
- 20 this.
- This document is dated August 17, 2018.
- Do you see that, Ms. Titus?
- 23 A. I do.
- Q. You were deposed in this case back in June of
- 25 2018; is that right?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That sounds right.
- Q. Okay. So this, this document that we're
- 3 looking at here, this is from after your deposition.
- 4 A. Okay.
- 5 Q. Okay. And if you testified at your deposition
- 6 that that document doesn't show Patterson
- 7 participating in a conspiracy, would that have been a
- 8 lie?
- 9 A. It would not.
- 10 Q. Let's turn back to the document itself.
- 11 Can you please pull up again CX 2220.
- 12 And zoom in on the middle paragraph starting
- 13 with "Thanks, Kristi."
- 14 All right. So starting with the language that
- 15 begins, "They are a consulting group" and in particular
- 16 that "They also like to take an 'Admin' or 'Marketing'
- 17 fee on the collective volume of their clients" and that
- 18 they represent a layer between you and your customer,
- 19 is this the sort of thing you were talking about when
- 20 you told Ms. Fincher when she was asking you guestions
- 21 that some GPOs are not so good?
- 22 A. That is correct.
- 23 O. You said in this e-mail that -- that some GPOs
- 24 are just looking to create a revenue stream on the back
- 25 of your clients; right?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That's right.
- Q. Is this the sort of thing you meant by some
- 3 GPOs not being very good?
- 4 A. It is.
- 5 Q. That they're just looking to take their taste?
- 6 MS. GOFF: Objection. Leading.
- 7 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. I didn't hear the
- 8 question.
- 9 BY MR. GEORGE:
- 10 Q. Is it a fair characterization --
- 11 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Hold it.
- 12 There was an objection. Unless you want to --
- 13 MR. GEORGE: I apologize, Your Honor.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Do you want to rule on it?
- MR. GEORGE: I can rephrase.
- 16 JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. Rephrase.
- 17 When someone stands up or speaks, hold your
- 18 answer.
- 19 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 20 BY MR. GEORGE:
- 21 Q. What do you mean when you say that they're just
- 22 looking to create a revenue stream on the back of your
- 23 clients?
- 24 A. My intention for this statement was to call out
- 25 that they offered nothing more than discounts off

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 consumable supplies.
- 2 Q. You used the word "predatory" before.
- Is that what you were talking about when you
- 4 used the word "predatory"?
- 5 A. It is.
- 6 Q. Now, you say at the end of this e-mail, "If it
- 7 makes feel better, PDCO is not on board for these
- 8 types [sic] of GPO relationships either"; right?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. Now, just to confirm, you have no knowledge of
- 11 what Patterson's policies are towards GPOs or buying
- 12 groups; right?
- 13 A. None whatsoever.
- 14 Q. And you're not aware of any communications
- 15 between anyone at Patterson and anyone at Schein
- 16 regarding buying groups?
- 17 A. None whatsoever.
- Q. You said earlier to Ms. Fincher that when you
- 19 had said that PDO -- excuse me -- PDCO wasn't on board
- 20 for these types of GPO relationships that that was a
- 21 market observation. Do you remember saying that?
- 22 A. I do.
- Q. What do you mean by that?
- A. Meaning that my full-time job was to live, eat
- 25 and breathe our mid-market and my observations was I

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 didn't run into Patterson in these situations, but
- 2 primarily the statement was to essentially ask our FSC
- 3 to -- to focus on what was at hand for her, which is
- 4 selling to her territory.
- 5 Q. So you were saying that you weren't personally
- 6 seeing Patterson in this space; is that fair?
- 7 A. Essentially.
- 8 Q. Had you asked or spoken with any GPOs about
- 9 whether Patterson was your competition?
- 10 A. Never.
- 11 Q. Now, not seeing Patterson in this space, was
- 12 that a contrast from other customer classes you dealt
- 13 with in your job at Schein?
- 14 A. Not necessarily, but to some degree.
- 15 Q. What were some customer classes where you did
- 16 see Patterson as a competitor?
- 17 A. Patterson was one of our largest competitors,
- 18 so essentially they had pretty good market penetration
- 19 with our dental trade.
- Q. So, for instance, DSOs --
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. -- are you familiar -- when -- do you recall
- 23 any examples of Patterson competing with Henry Schein
- 24 over a DSO?
- 25 A. I do.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Would you mind naming a few.
- 2 A. American Dental Partners, Jefferson Dental
- 3 Care, are two that come to mind immediately.
- 4 Q. How about Mortenson? Does that ring a bell?
- 5 A. It does.
- 6 O. Was that another company, another DSO that
- 7 Patterson competed with Schein over?
- 8 A. It is.
- 9 O. And how about Heartland?
- 10 MS. GOFF: Objection. Leading.
- 11 MR. GEORGE: I can rephrase.
- 12 BY MR. GEORGE:
- 0. Are there any others that you can recall?
- 14 A. Heartland Dental Group.
- 15 Q. And what was Heartland Dental Group?
- Sorry. What -- it's my voice.
- 17 What was Heartland Dental Group?
- 18 A. Heartland Dental Group is a DSO.
- 19 Q. And what happened with Heartland Dental Group
- 20 with respect to Patterson?
- 21 A. Heartland Dental Group sent their business out
- 22 to bid. Henry Schein and Patterson Dental competed,
- and we lost the bid.
- Q. Is it fair to say that throughout your career
- 25 at Henry Schein that Patterson was consistently a

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 vigorous competitor of Henry Schein?
- 2 A. It was a vigorous competitor, and I would look
- 3 at them as a nemesis. They were the largest and they
- 4 were the ones we worried about.
- 5 MR. GEORGE: Thank you very much.
- 6 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Anything else from this side?
- 7 MR. RACOWSKI: No questions from Benco.
- 8 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Cross?
- 9 MS. GOFF: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 10 - -
- 11 CROSS-EXAMINATION
- 12 BY MS. GOFF:
- 0. Good afternoon, Ms. Titus.
- 14 My name is --
- 15 A. Hello.
- Q. -- Karen Goff. We met at your deposition.
- 17 Good to see you again.
- 18 A. Thank you.
- 19 Q. You spoke with Ms. Fincher about your work
- 20 history at Henry Schein, and I just wanted to confirm a
- 21 few things.
- 22 You worked in Special Markets for about
- 23 15 years; is that right?
- 24 A. That's right.
- Q. And then in around March of 2014 you were

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 transferred to Henry Schein Dental?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- Q. And you were transferred to the mid-markets
- 4 group?
- 5 A. That's correct.
- 6 Q. And the mid-markets group was within
- 7 Henry Schein Dental.
- 8 A. It was.
- 9 Q. And when you transferred to the --
- 10 Henry Schein Dental, you reported to Mr. Joe Cavaretta;
- 11 is that right?
- 12 A. That's right.
- 13 Q. And you never reported directly to
- 14 Mr. Tim Sullivan, did you?
- 15 A. I did not.
- 16 Q. Okay. You spoke with Ms. Fincher about
- 17 customers of Special Markets and Henry Schein Dental,
- 18 and I'd like to look at a document. It's CX 0165.
- 19 And --
- 20 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Hold it, hold it. Wait for
- 21 people to find their place in the binders that were
- 22 just distributed.
- MS. GOFF: Sure.
- 24 And Your Honor, may I approach the witness to
- 25 give her a binder?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Yes.
- 2 MS. GOFF: Thank you.
- 3 THE WITNESS: Would it be efficient to just
- 4 look at what's posted on the screen?
- 5 JUDGE CHAPPELL: It's your choice.
- 6 THE WITNESS: If you could make it a little
- 7 bigger -- somebody was making it bigger, and that
- 8 worked just fine. It's easier than flipping through
- 9 the pages.
- 10 BY MS. GOFF:
- 0. Understood, Ms. Titus. We will attempt to
- 12 make the portions bigger as we review them, and then
- 13 you're welcome to look in the binder if you would
- 14 like.
- 15 A. Thank you.
- 16 Q. So let's start with the e-mail on CX 0165-002.
- 17 It's from Bret McCarroll to you and Tom McCulloch
- 18 regarding Business Intelligence Group.
- 19 Do you see that?
- 20 A. I do.
- Q. And the e-mail is from February 1, 2011.
- 22 Do you see that?
- 23 A. I do.
- Q. So at this point you worked in Special Markets;
- 25 right?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That's correct.
- Q. And Bret McCarroll is e-mailing you about
- 3 Business Intelligence Group, a group interested in
- 4 forming a buying group for dentists.
- 5 Do you see that?
- 6 A. I do.
- 7 Q. And then he asks, at page 003, "Do we have any
- 8 interest in opening up an account for a group like
- 9 this?" He mentions that they have 150 clients and they
- 10 plan on growing to 500 clients by year end.
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- 13 Q. Okay. And then you respond to Mr. McCarroll
- 14 and you informed him, at 002, "I can tell you" -- there
- 15 it is -- "I can tell you that with authority that is
- 16 not something SM would be interested in."
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. And you had been in Special Markets for maybe
- 19 around ten years or so at the point that you wrote this
- 20 e-mail?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And then the next sentence, you wrote, "The
- 23 participants are Private Practice customers which rules
- 24 SM out."
- Do you see that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do.
- 2 Q. "SM" is Special Markets?
- 3 A. It is.
- 4 O. Okay. So Special Markets did not work with
- 5 groups in which the participants were private practice
- 6 customers?
- 7 A. They did work with groups that were private
- 8 practice customers.
- 9 Q. You wrote here in your e-mail, "The
- 10 participants are Private Practice customers which rules
- 11 SM out."
- 12 A. That was only one aspect of this particular
- 13 group that was being presented to me.
- 14 O. Okay. Thank you. We can take that one down.
- You used some terms with Ms. Fincher. I just
- 16 wanted to make sure I have an understanding of what
- 17 they mean.
- You use the terms "buying group" and "GPO"
- 19 interchangeably, don't you?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And you use the acronyms "MSO" and "DSO"
- 22 interchangeably.
- 23 A. No.
- Q. Do you recall testifying at your deposition
- 25 that "MSO" and "DSO" are interchangeable words?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do recall that, and they are interchangeable.
- 2 Throughout the evolution of the space, "MSO" was an
- 3 acronym that was used, however, inaccurate.
- 4 O. You also spoke with Ms. Fincher about community
- 5 health centers.
- 6 A. I did.
- 7 Q. For a period of time you had responsibility for
- 8 Schein's community health center group relationships;
- 9 is that correct?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 O. And a community health center is a safety net
- 12 clinic that's mission is to serve underserved
- 13 populations regardless of their ability to pay?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. And you define "private practice dentists" as
- 16 solo dental practitioners that do not receive any
- 17 state, local or government funds to help defray
- 18 operating costs?
- 19 A. That's incorrect.
- Q. Let's take a look at your deposition on
- 21 page 45 line 10.
- 22 If you could please pull that up, Ms. Glover.
- 23 MS. FINCHER: Objection, Your Honor. I'm not
- 24 sure if counsel is trying to impeach the witness or not
- 25 with what she just said, and we can find no reference

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 to her deposition at all in the question.
- MS. GOFF: Your Honor, I asked this question at
- 3 the deposition and I --
- 4 JUDGE CHAPPELL: You haven't laid a foundation
- 5 to throw a deposition up. The objection is sustained.
- 6 BY MS. GOFF:
- 7 Q. Ms. Titus, do you recall that I asked you at
- 8 your deposition how you define the term "independent
- 9 private practice dentists"?
- 10 A. May I see the document?
- 11 Q. Your deposition?
- 12 A. Uh-huh.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: You should be able to answer,
- 14 ma'am, whether you recall it without looking at it.
- 15 Either you recall it or you do not.
- 16 THE WITNESS: I recall it was in the context to
- 17 comparing it to a community health center. The
- 18 reference to reimbursement from the government was in
- 19 regards to operating funds, meaning, paying their
- 20 staff, keeping their doors open. However, solo
- 21 providers do receive reimbursement through government
- 22 programs like Medi-Cal and Medicaid.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Medi-Cal?
- 24 THE WITNESS: California. California
- 25 Medicaid.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 BY MS. GOFF:
- Q. You define "independent private practice
- 3 dentists" as solo dental practitioners?
- 4 A. Generally.
- 5 Q. Okay. So using that definition, community
- 6 health center groups are not comprised of members who
- 7 are private practice dentists?
- 8 A. Incorrect.
- 9 Q. Is Washington a community health center that
- 10 you worked with?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 O. What about Council Connection [sic]? Is that a
- 13 community health center that you are familiar with?
- 14 A. I'm familiar with Council Connections;
- 15 Council Connections is not a community health center.
- Q. Is it a community health center buying group?
- 17 A. It is.
- Q. Using your definition -- the definition that we
- 19 just established for "solo dental practitioners," the
- 20 Council Connection group is not comprised of solo
- 21 practitioners that you referred to; correct?
- 22 A. Council Connections serves the nonprofit
- 23 dental clinic populations, specifically federally
- 24 qualified healthcare centers; however, private
- 25 practice dentists are employed within those community

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 health centers.
- Q. Earlier you spoke with Ms. Fincher about the
- 3 Colorado Community Health Network, and I just wanted to
- 4 clarify that is a community health center group?
- 5 A. It's a community health center gatekeeper or
- 6 association.
- 7 Q. Okay. I'd like to take a look at RX 2385.
- 8 And I apologize. I'm not sure that this one is
- 9 in the binder, but I -- we will put it up on the
- 10 screen.
- 11 You spoke about some of the groups that are
- 12 listed on this e-mail chain with Ms. Fincher.
- The e-mail is dated May 8, 2014, and it's from
- 14 you to Mr. Joe Cavaretta.
- Do you see that?
- 16 A. I do.
- 17 Q. And Mr. Cavaretta was your boss at this time?
- 18 A. He was.
- 19 O. And you were writing to him about a list of hot
- 20 topics for Monday, for the Monday meeting?
- 21 A. That's correct.
- Q. And you wrote: Breakaway, Dental Co-Op,
- 23 Smile Source and Steadfast?
- 24 A. That's right.
- Q. Fair to say that you wanted to talk about these

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 hot topics with Mr. Cavaretta?
- 2 A. I did.
- Q. And is it fair to say that these topics were
- 4 taking up a good chunk of your time at the time that
- 5 you wrote this e-mail?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Okay. And then going a little bit below that
- 8 if we could -- thank you, Ms. Glover -- you wrote, "We
- 9 need to develop our policy on these Dental Management
- 10 Companies that have a GPO component."
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- 0. You wanted to -- you put these four companies
- 14 on your list to talk with Mr. Cavaretta because they
- 15 had a GPO component?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 O. Okay. And then let's talk about some of these
- 18 companies that you mentioned in your e-mail and that
- 19 you also talked with Ms. Fincher about.
- 20 So you spoke with Ms. Fincher about the
- 21 Steadfast group. I want to -- we'll start with that
- 22 one.
- 23 And Ms. Glover, you can take this document down.
- 24 So shortly after you were moved from
- 25 Special Markets to HSD you started doing some discovery

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- on the Steadfast Dental group?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 Q. And you were doing discovery on
- 4 Steadfast Dental as part of your job for
- 5 Henry Schein Dental?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 Q. And then after you did some research, you
- 8 determined that there was no question that
- 9 Steadfast Dental was a buying group?
- 10 A. I knew they were before I started doing
- 11 research.
- 12 Q. And then eventually you sought permission from
- 13 your superiors to shut down Steadfast Dental?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- Q. And you got permission from your superiors to
- 16 shut down Steadfast Dental?
- 17 A. I did not personally terminate the relationship
- 18 with Steadfast Dental; however, I did deliver the
- 19 message.
- Q. You got permission from your superiors to shut
- 21 down Steadfast Dental?
- 22 MS. FINCHER: Objection. Asked and answered.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: No, it wasn't. Overruled.
- 24 BY MS. GOFF:
- 25 O. I can --

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Please.
- 2 Q. -- state the question again.
- 3 You got permission from your superiors to shut
- 4 down Steadfast Dental?
- 5 A. I received permission from my superiors to
- 6 deliver the message to the CEO of Steadfast Dental that
- 7 we were terminating the relationship.
- 8 Q. And you testified earlier that the reason that
- 9 you shut down Steadfast was that business was down year
- 10 over year; is that right?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. After learning that the business was down year
- over year, you followed up with Steadfast?
- 14 A. I did.
- 15 Q. And then at that point Steadfast informed you
- 16 that business was going to -- well, strike that.
- 17 Steadfast -- I just want to understand how the
- 18 relationship worked.
- 19 So Steadfast informed you that it would look at
- 20 an order and it would break up the order and send items
- 21 that were cheaper with company A or company B to those
- 22 companies, and then Henry Schein would be left with the
- ones that Schein had the best price at.
- 24 Do I have that right?
- 25 A. Not quite.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. What portion is inaccurate?
- 2 A. Steadfast was receiving a Henry Schein order.
- 3 These were generated by the actual member and sent to
- 4 Steadfast, who was acting as their procurement agent,
- 5 essentially taking that task off of the staff at the
- 6 individual member office. Then Steadfast would look at
- 7 the Henry Schein order and reallocate it to the lowest
- 8 bidder.
- 9 O. I see.
- 10 So if a customer placed an order, Schein would
- 11 get the sales for the products on which it offered the
- 12 best price.
- 13 A. Could you repeat the question.
- 14 O. Sure.
- 15 Under this relationship with Steadfast, when a
- 16 customer placed an order, Schein would get the sales
- 17 for the products on which it offered the best price.
- 18 A. The Schein order would be evaluated by
- 19 Steadfast, and then we would get the balance of the
- 20 order that we had the cheapest price on.
- 21 Q. Thank you.
- Now, this relationship -- I think I understand
- 23 how the relationship worked.
- 24 That system was in place for the entirety of
- 25 Henry Schein's relationship with Steadfast; correct?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 Q. Even though Schein -- even though you
- 3 testified that Schein was not selling as much to
- 4 Steadfast as it did the year before, it was still
- 5 selling \$150,000 worth of supplies to Steadfast
- 6 members?
- 7 A. I don't know.
- 8 Q. You don't recall?
- 9 A. I don't recall.
- 10 Q. Okay. Let's take a look at a document. This
- 11 one is in the binder. I believe it's CX 0171.
- 12 This is an e-mail. The latest in time is from
- 13 you to Joe Cavaretta, and it's dated in March 2014.
- 14 Do you see that?
- 15 A. I do.
- 16 Q. Okay. And Mr. Cavaretta was your boss at the
- 17 time that you wrote this e-mail?
- 18 A. That's correct.
- 19 Q. And just for the record, Mr. McLemore was the
- 20 regional manager for Texas, where this particular
- 21 organization, Steadfast, was located; is that right?
- 22 A. I believe so.
- Q. And you forwarded an e-mail from
- 24 Ms. Emily Kerr.
- We could show you that.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 And you see that Emily Kerr's e-mail to you had
- 2 the subject line "Support." And then when you
- 3 forwarded the e-mail to Mr. Cavaretta and Mr. McLemore,
- 4 you changed it to "Buying group STEADFAST DENTAL, do we
- 5 shut this down?"
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 A. I do.
- 8 Q. You specifically noted in the subject matter of
- 9 the e-mail that Steadfast Dental was a buying group.
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. And you specifically asked, "do we shut this
- 12 down?"
- 13 A. Those were the words I wrote.
- 14 Q. Okay. Then in your e-mail, you wrote, "I'm
- 15 still in discovery on their DNA (we think it's a DSO
- 16 called OMSP), but there is no question this is a buying
- 17 group."
- 18 Do you see that?
- 19 A. I do.
- Q. You then write, "They did 150K last year."
- 21 You're referencing there in this e-mail
- 22 \$150,000 worth of business with Henry Schein?
- 23 A. I'm referencing -- yes. I'm referencing
- 24 \$150,000 in collective volume from our shared member
- 25 customer list.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. You considered that to be a large client for
- 2 Henry Schein?
- 3 A. Yes. In perspective.
- 4 Q. You do not write in this e-mail to
- 5 Mr. Cavaretta that sales were down year over year.
- 6 Right?
- 7 A. I did not write that. And as you can see in
- 8 the e-mail, I'm still in discovery on who they are.
- 9 Q. Even though Schein was not selling as much to
- 10 Steadfast members that it did the year before, it was
- 11 still selling \$150,000 worth of supplies as of the time
- 12 that you wrote this e-mail?
- 13 A. That's right.
- Q. And then after Schein stopped doing business
- 15 with Steadfast, it could have lost this -- all of
- 16 this -- the Steadfast customers altogether; correct?
- 17 A. Potential existed, yes.
- 18 Q. And that was a concern of yours at the time.
- 19 A. It was a concern.
- 20 Q. Okay. Let's look at CX 2216.
- Okay. This is an e-mail. The latest in time
- 22 is from Joe Cavaretta to you and others, dated June 10,
- 23 2014, with the subject Steadfast Medical GPO.
- Do you see that?
- 25 A. I do.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. This is the same Steadfast that we've been
- 2 talking about?
- 3 A. It is.
- 4 Q. And Mr. Cavaretta wrote, "Thanks for leading
- 5 the charge on this KT."
- 6 "KT" is a reference to you?
- 7 A. That's right.
- 8 Q. "GPO's are popping up like crazy so it is nice
- 9 when we can shut one down and still keep the business
- 10 from the individual customers."
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- Q. Mr. Cavaretta was praising you for your work on
- 14 Steadfast.
- 15 A. I'm sorry. I didn't hear the question.
- Q. Mr. Cavaretta was praising you for your work on
- 17 Steadfast.
- 18 A. He was praising me for my collective work. The
- 19 use of the words "shut down," I don't think he was
- 20 praising me for shutting them down. He was -- he was
- 21 praising me for identifying the fact that we had no
- 22 field sales consultants on any of the accounts and we
- 23 were down 50 percent year over year.
- Q. And just for the record, Mr. Cavaretta was your
- 25 boss at the time of this e-mail?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Yes, he was.
- Q. Okay. You also spoke about -- with Ms. Fincher
- 3 about the Dental Co-Op of Utah.
- 4 And in 2014, after you transferred to the
- 5 Mid Market group within Henry Schein Dental, you did
- 6 some discovery on the Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 7 A. I did.
- 8 Q. And that was shortly after you were transferred
- 9 from Special Markets to HSD?
- 10 A. That's correct.
- 11 Q. And the Dental Co-Op of Utah was a buying
- 12 group.
- 13 A. They were.
- 14 Q. And then again, at some point you elevated the
- 15 issue of whether to shut down the dental co-op to your
- 16 superiors.
- 17 A. Yes, I did, because there was a very serious
- 18 issue.
- 19 Q. And then after that, at some point Schein
- 20 stopped doing business with the Dental Co-Op of Utah?
- 21 A. That is correct.
- Q. The Dental Co-Op of Utah had been a customer of
- 23 Henry Schein since 2008; is that right?
- 24 A. I don't know what the original date. I knew it
- 25 was a long-term customer.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. And Henry Schein was doing a million dollars
- 2 worth of business with the Dental Co-Op of Utah in this
- 3 2014 time period?
- 4 A. I think it was twice that.
- 5 Q. Okay. And then let's look at CX 2227.
- 6 So the top e-mail is dated February 10, 2014,
- 7 and it's from Mr. Muller to you and Mr. Foley. But
- 8 let's look at an earlier e-mail in the chain,
- 9 specifically at page 004.
- There's an e-mail from you to Francis Keefe?
- 11 A. Yes. Correct.
- 12 O. And then you write, "The decision" -- I'll wait
- 13 for it to pop up on the screen. Okay. There it is --
- 14 "The decision of HSD to treat them as a GPO is a
- 15 legacy decision that I do not believe, if presented
- 16 with the same circumstances today, HSD would have
- 17 embraced."
- Do you see that?
- 19 A. That's correct.
- 20 Q. That's what you wrote to Ms. -- or Mr., rather,
- 21 Keefe of Colgate in 2014?
- 22 A. I did.
- 23 Q. You wrote that you didn't think HSD would have
- 24 embraced the dental co-op.
- 25 A. Not as it existed when I engaged with them.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. And the decision to treat the dental co-op as a
- 2 GPO was a legacy decision.
- 3 A. The context of my statement was that that's how
- 4 they were set up in our system, as a GPO.
- 5 Q. And then you went on to say, "This is not good
- 6 news for us (Colgate and Schein) or the industry. As I
- 7 see it, this portends the empowerment of the GPO
- 8 infiltration in the dental space and as this scenario
- 9 illustrates, the dilution of the influence of
- 10 Distribution."
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. Yes, I see I wrote that.
- Q. And when you wrote "Distribution" here, you
- 14 meant the companies like Henry Schein?
- 15 A. Yes.
- In context to what I was saying there, the
- 17 conversation I was having with our exclusive provider
- 18 from Colgate was in reference to customers that were
- 19 actively enrolled in Colgate plans that were getting
- 20 billed through Henry Schein and those Colgate plans
- 21 being canceled and Dental Co-Op switching them over to
- 22 a direct seller.
- Q. Okay. And then you wrote, "This needs to get
- 24 on the radar of HSD leadership, (Joe Cavaretta and
- 25 Dave Steck) and Hal Muller ASAP."

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Do you see that?
- 2 A. I do.
- Q. And then in the last sentence you wrote,
- 4 "Perhaps there is something we can do to derail this
- 5 gaining momentum."
- 6 Do you see that?
- 7 A. I do. And this is in direct reference to P&G,
- 8 who we also did business with, but were taking business
- 9 that Henry Schein had already established and
- 10 cannibalizing it.
- 11 O. So you've testified that both Steadfast and
- 12 the dental co-op were shut down within the first few
- 13 months of you moving from Special Markets to HSD.
- 14 You did not seek to stop doing business with
- 15 any other group practices at any point when you were in
- 16 the group practice group at HSD.
- 17 A. Can you rephrase that or ask it again.
- Q. You didn't seek to stop doing business with any
- 19 other groups at any point when you were group practice
- 20 director for HSD.
- 21 A. That's incorrect.
- Q. Do you recall I asked you that question at your
- 23 deposition?
- A. No, I don't, one way or the other.
- Q. Do you recall giving a different answer?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. No. I'm sorry. I don't one way or the other.
- Q. Okay. Let's look at your deposition at
- 3 page 69.
- 4 Line 13:
- 5 "Did you seek to stop doing business with any
- 6 other groups at any point when you were group practice
- 7 director for HSD?
- 8 "ANSWER: No."
- 9 That was your testimony.
- 10 A. That was my testimony. However, I believe I
- 11 misspoke.
- 12 Q. And then when you worked in Special Markets,
- 13 prior to moving over to HSD, you never terminated a
- 14 relationship with any groups, did you?
- 15 A. I did.
- 16 Q. Do you recall that I asked you that question at
- 17 your deposition?
- 18 A. Are you asking me the same question that you
- 19 just asked me prior?
- Q. No. I can ask again. I'm asking when you were
- 21 in Special Markets.
- 22 A. Oh, when I was in Special Markets.
- Yes.
- Q. When you were in Special Markets, you never
- 25 terminated a relationship with any groups.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I did.
- Q. Okay. Do you recall that I asked you that
- 3 question at your deposition?
- 4 A. I'm sorry. I don't remember one way or the
- 5 other.
- 6 Q. Let's look at your deposition at page 80
- 7 line 9.
- I asked, "Did you ever, prior to moving over to
- 9 Henry Schein Dental, when -- back when you're in
- 10 special markets, did you ever terminate a relationship
- 11 with any groups?
- 12 "ANSWER: No."
- 13 That was your testimony?
- 14 A. I see that that was my testimony. However,
- 15 again, in context to our conversation about group --
- 16 buying groups, I believe I misspoke.
- 17 O. Steadfast was one of the higher-volume
- 18 customers that you were assigned when you transferred
- 19 to Mid Markets; right?
- 20 A. I'm not sure one way or the other.
- 21 Q. Do you recall testifying at your deposition
- 22 that you believe Steadfast was one of the higher-volume
- 23 customers?
- A. I don't recall one way or the other, but to be
- 25 clear, if we're talking about buying groups being one

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 of the higher rather than our collective customer base,
- 2 then yes.
- Q. Okay. Now going -- okay. Let's turn to PGMS,
- 4 another group that you spoke about with Ms. Fincher.
- 5 A. Okay.
- 6 Q. You're familiar with a group called PGMS?
- 7 A. I am.
- 8 Q. And that was another group that you dealt with
- 9 within those first few months of being transferred
- 10 within Special Markets to HSD?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. And you negotiated with a Dr. Juan Luque
- 13 regarding working with PGMS?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. Let's look at CX 2235. This is an e-mail that
- 16 you looked at with Ms. Fincher.
- 17 This is an e-mail dated July 17, 2014. It's to
- 18 Glenn Showgren and Kevin Upchurch.
- 19 Do you see that?
- 20 A. I do.
- 21 Q. They were your colleagues at Henry Schein
- 22 Dental?
- 23 A. They were.
- Q. And you wrote in this e-mail, "We had a GPO
- 25 prospect called PGMS. Very intriguing, willing to be

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 exclusive."
- 2 And in this e-mail you referred to PGMS as a
- 3 GPO prospect; right?
- 4 A. I did.
- 5 Q. And in this e-mail you were informing
- 6 Mr. Showgren and Mr. Upchurch that PGMS was willing to
- 7 be exclusive.
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. And you viewed exclusivity as positive, as a
- 10 positive for Schein.
- 11 A. I viewed -- yes. I viewed exclusivity as one
- 12 of the many requirements in order to establish a
- 13 healthy relationship. Yes.
- 14 O. And you wrote, "I created this and sent to Joe
- 15 for review." And you attached an agreement.
- 16 And when you said "Joe," that's a reference to
- 17 Mr. Cavaretta?
- 18 A. That's right.
- 19 O. Your boss?
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 Q. And then in the next sentence you said, "It
- 22 went to Tim and he shot it down."
- You see that.
- 24 A. I do.
- Q. Just to be clear, that's a reference to

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Tim Sullivan.
- 2 A. It is.
- 3 Q. So you're saying in this e-mail that
- 4 Tim Sullivan shot down an agreement with PGMS.
- 5 A. As I testified earlier, I had no knowledge of
- 6 Tim personally shutting anything down. I think I was
- 7 getting some red flags or some concerns from my boss,
- 8 Joe Cavaretta, when it came to compliance and when it
- 9 came to the fact that the -- one of the principals
- 10 from PGMS was unwilling to actually adhere to a
- 11 primary supply agreement and was buying from our
- 12 competitor.
- 0. Regarding the statement "It went to Tim and he
- 14 shot it down" that you put in this e-mail, you would
- 15 not have purposefully misled Mr. Showgren and
- 16 Mr. Upchurch regarding Tim Sullivan, would you?
- 17 A. I would never mislead anybody purposefully.
- 18 However, for the context of this conversation, I
- 19 didn't give them minute details on the process. I
- 20 essentially spoke to my boss about it, and there were a
- 21 couple of serious red flags which I completely agreed
- 22 made for a poor business relationship, a poor business
- 23 decision.
- Q. As of the time that you wrote this e-mail, it
- 25 was your understanding that Tim Sullivan had shot down

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 a PGMS agreement.
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. Do you recall that I asked you that question at
- 4 your deposition?
- 5 A. I don't one way or the other.
- 6 Q. Okay. Let's look at your deposition at
- 7 page 141 -- sorry -- 151. Thank you.
- 8 Line 1 through 4:
- 9 "QUESTION: So as of the time that you wrote
- 10 this e-mail, it was your understanding that
- 11 Tim Sullivan had shot down a PGMS agreement?
- 12 "ANSWER: Yes."
- Do you see that?
- 14 A. I do.
- 15 Q. That was your testimony.
- 16 A. It was.
- Q. And then turning back to the exhibit, CX 2235,
- in the next sentence you wrote, "I think the meta msg
- is officially, GPO's are not good for Schein."
- "Msg," that refers to message?
- 21 A. It does.
- Q. So on the date that you wrote this e-mail, you
- 23 felt that the message from above was that GPOs are not
- 24 good for Schein.
- 25 A. That's incorrect.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Do you recall that I asked you that same
- 2 question at your deposition?
- 3 A. I don't recall one way or the other.
- 4 Q. Okay. Let's look at your deposition at
- 5 page 149.
- 6 Line 22:
- 7 "On the date you wrote this e-mail, you felt
- 8 that the message from above was that GPOs are not good
- 9 for Schein?"
- 10 You responded, "Yes, and that statement was
- 11 not -- I did not have intimate knowledge, it was what I
- 12 was thinking it meant."
- 13 Do you see that?
- 14 A. I see that.
- 15 Q. So it was what you were thinking it meant.
- 16 A. Only in context to PGMS and the concerns that
- 17 my boss and others expressed about this not being a
- 18 healthy business relationship.
- 19 O. You did not write in your e-mail that it was in
- 20 this context of -- that the meta message was in the
- 21 context of PGMS, did you?
- 22 A. I did not write that. However, in the context
- of this discussion that we were having, that's
- 24 precisely what I meant.
- 25 O. Okay. Let's look at CX 2219.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 So this is an e-mail from July 16, 2014, and
- 2 again here you're e-mailing Glenn Showgren and
- 3 Brian Brady, and you're cc'g Nicole Lena and
- 4 Joe Cavaretta.
- 5 You wrote, "I s/w Joe today about the
- 6 agreement."
- 7 You're referencing here the PGMS agreement?
- 8 A. Correct.
- 9 Q. And then you wrote -- when you wrote "s/w,"
- 10 that means spoke with?
- 11 A. It does.
- 12 Q. And then you wrote, "Tim was not in favor of
- 13 it."
- 14 Do you see that?
- 15 A. I do.
- 16 Q. And that's again a reference to Tim Sullivan?
- 17 A. It is.
- Q. So this is another place where you're informing
- 19 your colleagues that Tim Sullivan was not in favor of
- 20 the PGMS agreement?
- 21 A. Yes. And I -- in context, he was not telling
- 22 us not to proceed but that he had concerns, and that
- 23 was information that was coming from my boss,
- 24 Joe Cavaretta, and frankly, I shared his concerns.
- 25 O. You testified earlier that Mr. Sullivan never

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 gave you direction regarding PGMS.
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 Q. You never spoke with Mr. Sullivan personally
- 4 about PGMS.
- 5 A. I did not.
- 6 Q. Okay. Let's go to the next page, CX 2219 at
- 7 002.
- 8 Actually, I'm sorry. Let's look at a different
- 9 document.
- 10 I'm sorry. Let's look at CX 2809. This is
- 11 another e-mail that you looked at with Ms. Fincher
- 12 earlier.
- 13 Let's go to CX 2809-002.
- 14 You looked -- we looked at this part earlier,
- 15 starting with "Sigh," yes. This is a portion of the
- 16 e-mail that I don't think you reviewed with
- 17 Ms. Fincher.
- It says, "I sent them," you'll see in the
- 19 second sentence -- yes. Thank you -- "I sent them some
- 20 tough questions thinking it would scare them off, but
- 21 alas, they raised the stakes by moving to Dir of Ops."
- 22 Do you see that?
- 23 A. I do. But can I see who this is in reference
- 24 to?
- 25 O. Sure.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Can we -- it might be -- if you'd like to look
- 2 at it in your binder, it would be in the black binder.
- 3 A. That's okay. I can see enough of it now.
- Q. Okay. So here you're referring to those --
- 5 those ten questions that you talked with Ms. Fincher
- 6 about earlier?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- Q. And you sent them -- you wrote that you sent
- 9 them to PGMS thinking that it would scare them off;
- 10 right?
- 11 A. I wrote that. I can see that I wrote that.
- 12 However, it was a very poor choice of words.
- 13 Essentially what I was doing was crafting a
- 14 sort of evaluation that constituted our strategy for a
- 15 healthy relationship, of which that most people that
- 16 those questions would be sent to would tell us whether
- 17 or not we wanted to proceed.
- 18 Q. Okay. Thank you. We can take that one down.
- 19 Let's look at CX 2211. I believe this is
- another one that you looked at with Ms. Fincher.
- 21 This e-mail is discussing the Dental Co-Op of
- 22 Utah.
- Do you see that?
- 24 A. I do.
- Q. Specifically, it's discussing the end of the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 relationship between Schein and the Dental Co-Op of
- 2 Utah.
- 3 And I'd like to look at the e-mail from
- 4 Mr. Kevin Upchurch at 002.
- 5 Mr. Upchurch was the zone general manager
- 6 within Henry Schein Dental at the time of this e-mail?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 Q. Okay. And he wrote, "The Co-Op is turning into
- 9 a GPO (even if they don't think they are one now), from
- 10 what KT has observed in Texas, NM and from Tim S, HSD
- 11 does not want to enter the GPO world."
- 12 Do you see that?
- 13 A. I do.
- 14 Q. You disagreed with Mr. Upchurch's statement
- 15 that the co-op was turning into a GPO.
- 16 A. The co-op was a GPO, not turning into one.
- 17 Q. Okay. And "KT" is a reference again to you.
- 18 A. It is.
- 19 O. And then in the last clause of the sentence he
- 20 wrote "from Tim S, HSD does not want to enter the GPO
- 21 world."
- This statement from Mr. Kevin Upchurch, it's
- 23 consistent with your statement that the meta message
- 24 was that GPOs are not good for Schein.
- 25 A. I believe those two statements are completely

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 unrelated and referring to two completely different
- 2 buying groups.
- Q. Okay. Let's look at -- let's look at CX 0260.
- 4 Okay. This is an e-mail from Russ Baker.
- 5 Are you familiar with Mr. Russ Baker?
- 6 A. I am.
- 7 O. What was his role at Schein?
- 8 A. I believe at this time Russ Baker was a
- 9 regional manager for one of the southeastern states.
- 10 Q. Okay. Thank you.
- In 2014, you had a conversation with Mr. Baker
- 12 regarding the group Dental Gator?
- 13 Do you recall that?
- 14 We can -- we can look at a portion of the
- 15 document if that helps.
- 16 A. I don't think this document is referencing my
- 17 conversation.
- 18 O. Okay. Let's look at CX 0260-002.
- 19 And then -- yeah, it starts, "Scott, let me
- 20 bring Kathleen, Andrea" -- thank you.
- 21 I think we're going to have to go back to an
- 22 earlier e-mail so that she can -- or blow it up, more
- of the page, so that she can see this bottom e-mail,
- 24 the middle e-mail where it says "Dental Gator."
- 25 Okay. So here is an e-mail from Scott Janczak

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 to Russ Baker, and they're talking about Dental Gator.
- 2 Do you see that?
- 3 A. I do.
- 4 MS. FINCHER: Objection, Your Honor. This
- 5 witness is not on the e-mail.
- 6 MS. GOFF: She's not on that e-mail. I'm
- 7 trying to orient her. She's on the next e-mail chain.
- 8 BY MS. GOFF:
- 9 Q. Ms. Titus, you're welcome to look at it in your
- 10 binder.
- 11 A. If you can just show it to me on the screen,
- 12 that would be great.
- 13 O. Sure.
- 14 Ms. Glover, can we now look at the next e-mail
- 15 up, and I think it might be helpful if you show
- 16 Ms. Titus the whole screen. Yes. Perfect. Thank you.
- 17 Are you able to read that?
- 18 A. Yes, I am.
- 19 O. Okay. Thank you.
- It says, from Mr. Baker, "Scott, let me bring
- 21 Kathleen, Andrea and Jason into this conversation."
- 22 So Mr. Baker -- Mr. Baker is looping you in to
- 23 this conversation that he was having about
- 24 Dental Gator. He added you to the e-mail chain.
- Do you see that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do.
- Q. Okay. And he wrote, "I recently had a
- 3 conversation with Kathleen regarding this group and
- 4 they are nothing more than a GPO."
- 5 Do you see that?
- 6 A. I do.
- 7 Q. You had a conversation with Mr. Baker regarding
- 8 Dental Gator.
- 9 A. I don't recall that one way or the other.
- 10 Q. Okay. And then Mr. Baker says that
- 11 Dental Gator is nothing more than a GPO.
- 12 He continues, "It is my understanding that
- 13 this violates our policy as we do not engage with
- 14 GPO's."
- 15 Do you see that?
- 16 A. I do.
- 17 Q. That's what Mr. Baker wrote in this e-mail to
- 18 you.
- 19 Do you see that?
- 20 A. I do.
- 21 Was this -- I'm sorry, Karen. Was this e-mail
- 22 actually written to me?
- Q. Yes, it was.
- MS. FINCHER: Objection, Your Honor. It's very
- 25 difficult to tell from this e-mail and you can see the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 one above from Ms. --
- 2 JUDGE CHAPPELL: She was offered to look at the
- 3 binder and she rejected that. The witness can choose
- 4 to look at the binder or the witness can stay in the
- 5 gray area.
- 6 MS. FINCHER: Yes, Your Honor.
- 7 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Let her know the page numbers
- 8 or exhibit numbers or tab numbers in the binder.
- 9 MS. GOFF: Sure.
- 10 BY MS. GOFF:
- 11 Q. If you'd like to look at it, it's CX 0260.
- 12 And just for the record, could you please
- 13 confirm that you are at this e-mail chain.
- 14 A. Karen, I'm sorry, but the document in the
- 15 binder is identical --
- 16 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Who is this Karen you're
- 17 talking about?
- 18 THE WITNESS: Karen, is that your name?
- 19 MS. GOFF: Yes.
- 20 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Okay. Let's refrain from this
- 21 first-name basis here.
- 22 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: And you're not supposed to be
- 24 asking questions.
- THE WITNESS: Okay.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 JUDGE CHAPPELL: You need to figure out what's
- 2 going on with the witness or move on to another topic.
- 3 MS. GOFF: Thank you, Your Honor.
- 4 JUDGE CHAPPELL: We've wasted enough time on
- 5 this.
- 6 MS. GOFF: Thank you, Your Honor. I'll move
- 7 on.
- 8 BY MS. GOFF:
- 9 Q. Okay. Let's talk about a different group that
- 10 you spoke with Ms. Fincher about earlier, Klear Impakt,
- 11 and I'd like to look at a document, CX 2223.
- 12 This is an e-mail from you to Brian Brady with
- 13 a cc to Mr. Cavaretta.
- 14 Do you see that?
- 15 A. I do.
- 16 Q. It's from June of 2015.
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 Q. And as of the date of this e-mail, you had
- 20 not -- you had not yet entered into any kind of
- 21 agreement with Klear Impakt; fair to say?
- 22 A. That's correct.
- Q. And then you wrote, "If our policy is to shut
- 24 this down, I understand."
- Do you see that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do.
- 2 Q. So at this point you were not sure about
- 3 whether it was Schein's policy to shut down
- 4 Klear Impakt.
- 5 A. My comment was specific to the discussions I
- 6 was having with Klear Impakt and whether they met our
- 7 criteria, and a consensus from management agreed with
- 8 me.
- 9 Q. Schein first signed its agreement with
- 10 Klear Impakt in August of 2015; is that correct?
- I could show you a document to refresh your
- 12 recollection if that helps.
- 13 A. Yes, it would help.
- 14 O. Okay. Let's look at RX 2162.
- 15 I'm sorry. Yes, please don't put it up on the
- 16 screen because I'm just refreshing recollection.
- 17 So it is in your binder.
- 18 A. Okay.
- 19 Can you tell me the section it's in.
- 20 O. Do you see RX 2162?
- 21 A. Yes. I see it now.
- 22 Q. And then after you've had a chance to look at
- 23 it, does that refresh your recollection that Schein
- 24 first signed its agreement with Klear Impakt in August
- 25 of 2015?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 Q. Thank you.
- 3 Okay. Now let's look at CX 2520. This one
- 4 will be on the screen for you.
- 5 A. Okay.
- 6 O. And again, this is an e-mail chain between
- 7 Joe Cavaretta and Jake Meadows. You're not on this
- 8 chain, but you're referenced on it. I just want to ask
- 9 you a question about the reference.
- 10 Mr. Cavaretta wrote, "I just told KT we are
- 11 stopping this agreement until they can prove we can
- 12 control this."
- Do you see this?
- 14 A. I do.
- Q. Mr. Cavaretta told you to stop the agreement
- 16 with Klear Impakt?
- 17 A. I don't recall Joe Cavaretta telling me to
- 18 stop. However, I do recall he wanted to put more
- 19 scrutiny on the agreement.
- Q. Okay. Now let's look at CX 2226.
- 21 And so this is an e-mail from April 2016. The
- 22 top e-mail is from you, and it's to Brian Brady with a
- 23 cc to Joe Cavaretta. The subject is about
- 24 Klear Impakt's generic flyer language.
- 25 And then the last sentence in the second

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 paragraph, you wrote, "We hit the pause button in
- 2 January and they have been extremely patient with us
- 3 while we developed out" -- our -- "developed out BG
- 4 strategy."
- 5 Do you see that?
- 6 A. I do.
- 7 Q. And on January 2016 you hit the pause button
- 8 with Klear Impakt?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 Q. Let's talk about Breakaway.
- 11 A. Okay.
- 12 Q. Another group that you spoke with Ms. Fincher
- 13 about.
- 14 Let's look at a document, CX 0246.
- 15 A. Are you putting that on the screen?
- 16 Q. Yes. I'm sorry. It will be. Sorry.
- Okay. So the top e-mail is a chain between
- 18 Joe Cavaretta and Tim Sullivan and others, and again
- 19 you're referenced in this e-mail, and that's what I
- 20 want to ask you about. It's dated July of 2015.
- 21 Mr. Cavaretta was your boss at that time?
- 22 A. Correct.
- 23 Q. Okay. And then Mr. Cavaretta, at page 002, he
- 24 writes to Mr. Sullivan, and then please pull down all
- 25 the way to -- keep going a little bit more. Thank you.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 And he writes -- you'll see that there's
- 2 number 1 Dental Gator and then number 2 Breakaway.
- 3 Do you see that?
- 4 A. I do.
- 5 Q. Okay. And Mr. Cavaretta is writing to
- 6 Tim Sullivan, and he says (as read): We did discuss
- 7 shutting it down but once KT visited their facility it
- 8 was not a small group -- small buying group at all...
- 9 more of a MSO.
- 10 Do you see that?
- 11 A. I do.
- 12 Q. And you did discuss shutting down Breakaway?
- 13 A. I don't recall that one way or the other.
- 14 Q. And you visited Breakaway's facility; correct?
- 15 A. That is correct.
- 16 Q. And once you visited, you determined it was
- 17 more of an MSO?
- 18 A. Yes. That's what I'm reading here. In
- 19 reference and context to this, managed service
- 20 organizations provide a platform with a suite of
- 21 nonclinical business services that they offer to
- 22 private practice dentists, dentists which actually fit
- our profile for a healthy business relationship.
- Q. Okay. And then let's look at another
- 25 document, CX 2133. This one will also come up on the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 screen.
- 2 And again, Brian Brady writes an e-mail. You
- 3 are not on it, but you're referenced. And he says, to
- 4 Hal Muller and Randy Foley, "According to Kathleen" --
- 5 sorry, Ms. Glover. It's on page 002.
- 6 Okay. "According to Kathleen, who spent an
- 7 hour last Friday telling me why this is NOT a GPO, " do
- 8 you see that?
- 9 A. I do.
- 10 Q. And then it continues -- just for the purposes
- of the record I'll read the whole thing -- "they're
- 12 building 30 denovos in next 12 months where they will
- 13 have a MSO presence and what I gathered to be ownership
- 14 equity in all locations."
- 15 Do you see that?
- 16 "Kathleen" is a reference to you?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. You told Mr. Brady that Breakaway was not a
- 19 GPO.
- 20 A. I don't recall saying that one way or the
- 21 other.
- 22 Q. Okay. And then Hal responds to this e-mail,
- 23 Hal Muller, that is. And he wrote, "Last I heard about
- 24 Breakaway, KT was going to close them down as a buying
- 25 group."

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Do you see that?
- 2 A. I do.
- 3 Q. You were going to close Breakaway down as a
- 4 buying group?
- 5 A. I don't recall saying that to Hal.
- 6 Q. Okay. And you were involved in the Breakaway
- 7 PVA; is that right?
- 8 A. That's correct.
- 9 Q. And let's look at RX 2347.
- 10 JUDGE CHAPPELL: How much more time do you
- 11 think you need?
- MS. GOFF: I probably have five to ten
- 13 minutes.
- 14 JUDGE CHAPPELL: All right. Go ahead.
- 15 BY MS. GOFF:
- 16 Q. Okay. So in this document, this e-mail, you
- 17 are referred to as the master of ceremonies for the
- 18 Breakaway PVA.
- 19 Do you see that?
- 20 A. I can see that, yes.
- Q. Does that sound right to you?
- Does it sound right to you?
- 23 A. That I'm master of ceremonies or that somebody
- 24 called me that?
- Q. Never mind. I'll withdraw my question.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Okay. So let's look at the contract, which is
- 2 RX 2348.
- 3 MS. FINCHER: Objection, Your Honor. I think
- 4 this document might be an in camera document.
- 5 MS. GOFF: Oh, okay. Oh, it looks like we have
- 6 the public version. Could you take it down just real
- 7 quick, please, just to make sure.
- 8 May I just clarify with both counsel and the
- 9 person running our --
- 10 JUDGE CHAPPELL: Go ahead.
- 11 MS. GOFF: Okay. Thank you.
- 12 (Pause in the proceedings.)
- Thanks. We've confirmed that everything is
- 14 okay.
- 15 BY MS. GOFF:
- Q. So, Ms. Titus, let me just explain what's
- 17 happening here.
- In your binder is a complete version of this
- 19 document that you're able to look at, and what is on
- 20 the screen is what we're able to put in public. And
- 21 because we want to keep as much public as possible,
- 22 that's why I'm using this redacted version on the
- 23 screen, but you can look at the complete version in
- 24 your binder if you'd like.
- 25 A. May I have that number again.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 Q. Yes. It is RX 2348.
- 2 A. Okay.
- Q. And then I just wanted to reference you to a
- 4 specific portion of this agreement, and this is the
- 5 third paragraph down under number 1.
- 6 The agreement states, "This agreement may not
- 7 be used to grow any Group Purchasing Organization (GPO)
- 8 type relationship which is defined as a relationship
- 9 whose purpose is to generate revenue for the parent
- 10 company by allowing others to benefit without
- 11 commitment to the prime vendor relationship from the
- 12 terms of the prime vendor agreement."
- 13 Do you see that?
- 14 A. I do.
- 15 Q. This contract specifically states that the
- 16 agreement cannot be used to establish any group
- 17 purchasing organization; correct?
- 18 A. That's what it says. And that's the intention
- 19 of it. However, Breakaway Practice did have
- 20 individually owned practices where we had a pricing
- 21 agreement with them. We crafted a similar agreement
- 22 for their buying group, but a separate agreement.
- Q. Thank you.
- You spoke with Ms. Fincher about the group
- 25 Denali Group. Do you recall that?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. I do.
- Q. You viewed Denali Group as a consulting group;
- 3 right?
- 4 A. I did. However, my understanding of them was
- 5 immature, and I didn't have a lot of intimate knowledge
- 6 of them.
- 7 Q. In the 2014-2015 time period you viewed them as
- 8 a consulting group.
- 9 A. Based only on my assumption but not on any
- 10 direct knowledge. Yes.
- 11 Q. And then at the time of your deposition in
- 12 2018, you viewed them as a consulting group.
- 13 A. I believe that when I wrote that e-mail that I
- 14 made an assumption. That assumption was consequently
- 15 incorrect.
- 16 Q. At the time -- never mind. Strike that. Okay.
- Just a few more questions.
- The Mid Market Division, that was formed in
- 19 2014; is that right?
- 20 A. Correct.
- Q. It was formed to work with small DSOs?
- 22 A. There were a myriad -- yes. That was one part
- 23 of it.
- Q. And it was formed to work with community health
- 25 centers?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. It was not formed to work with buying groups.
- 3 A. That's incorrect.
- 4 O. Let's look at RX 2381.
- 5 Let's look at page 3.
- 6 You've seen this pyramid before?
- 7 A. I have. I don't know what the date is on the
- 8 creation or who the author was.
- 9 Q. But this pyramid is one that you recall seeing
- 10 before?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. There are several customer segments listed.
- Do you see that?
- 14 A. That's right.
- Q. And within Mid-Market it says "DSO, CHC's,
- 16 Hygiene & Assist Schools."
- 17 Do you see that?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 Q. It doesn't list buying groups or GPOs here,
- 20 does it?
- 21 A. It does not.
- 22 MS. GOFF: Your Honor, may I have a few seconds
- 23 to consult with co-counsel?
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Yes.
- MS. GOFF: Thank you.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 (Pause in the proceedings.)
- I don't have any other questions at this time.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Anything further?
- 4 MS. FINCHER: Yes, Your Honor. I'll be quick.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Go ahead.
- 6 - -
- 7 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 8 BY MS. FINCHER:
- 9 Q. Ms. Titus, I'd like to follow up on a couple of
- 10 documents and questions that complaint counsel just
- 11 asked you about.
- 12 Kurt, could you bring up RX 2381, please.
- 13 Sorry, Kurt. It's RX 2381.
- 14 And this is, Ms. Titus, the document that
- 15 complaint counsel was just showing you. Okay?
- 16 A. Thank you.
- 17 Q. And if you could please go to page 3 where you
- 18 were just looking at that pyramid.
- 19 Ms. Titus, anywhere on this pyramid do you see
- 20 GPOs or buying groups?
- 21 A. I do not.
- Q. But you would agree with me, Ms. Titus, that
- 23 GPOs and buying groups were in the dental market;
- 24 correct?
- 25 A. Absolutely.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. And who had responsibility for working with
- 2 GPOs and buying groups after Mid Market was formed?
- 3 A. Both Special Markets and Mid Market.
- 4 O. And did you personally work with GPOs and
- 5 buying groups after Mid Market was formed?
- 6 A. I absolutely did. It was a very important part
- 7 of my job.
- Q. Kurt, if you could bring up CX 0165, please.
- 9 If you can go to page 2, please.
- 10 Ms. Titus, this is an e-mail you were asked
- 11 about a moment ago relating to the
- 12 Business Intelligence Group. And you were asked about
- 13 the line in your e-mail that states, "I can tell you
- 14 that with authority that this is not something SM
- 15 would be interested in."
- 16 Do you see that?
- 17 A. I do.
- 18 Q. Can you tell me why you wrote that with respect
- 19 to the Business Intelligence Group.
- 20 A. I can.
- 21 The nature of Bret McCarroll's inquiry was
- 22 bringing it over to Special Markets. However, the
- 23 characteristics of the customer described was more
- 24 focused on interface with our field sales consultants
- 25 and our regional managers, as well it was highly

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 regionalized, so this would be a much better fit for
- 2 our HSD division where those things could be assured.
- Q. And Ms. Titus, as of the date you wrote this
- 4 e-mail, February 1, 2011, which division within Schein
- 5 had primary responsibility for working with buying
- 6 groups?
- 7 A. Special Markets.
- 8 Q. Okay. Kurt, if you could please pull up
- 9 CX 2227.
- 10 And just to be clear, Ms. Titus, did
- 11 Special Markets work with buying groups of private
- 12 practice dentists?
- 13 A. They did.
- Q. And if you could go to page 2, please, Kurt, on
- 15 CX 2227.
- 16 I'm sorry. Could you go back to the first
- 17 page, please, Kurt.
- I'm sorry. It's actually page 4.
- Now, Ms. Titus, you were read a line from this
- 20 e-mail about the dental co-op that stated, "The
- 21 decision of HSD to treat them as a GPO is a legacy
- 22 decision that I do not believe, if presented with the
- 23 same circumstances today, HSD would have embraced."
- Do you see that?
- 25 A. I do see that.

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- Q. Why did you write that at this time about the
- 2 Dental Cooperative of Utah?
- 3 A. Well, I don't have the precise particulars of
- 4 what Dental Co-Op looked like in 2008. From what I
- 5 have been given to understand from my peers and
- 6 colleagues, they were exclusive with Henry Schein.
- 7 They were supportive, and we had a very close working
- 8 relationship. In fact, we liked each other very much.
- 9 We worked very collaboratively with them.
- 10 When I was called in to try and bring the COO,
- 11 Andy Eberhardt, back from the direction that he was
- 12 quickly heading, they were a very different
- 13 organization. They had taken a different track. They
- 14 had a breach of trust with Henry Schein. They were
- 15 essentially acting like competitors cannibalizing
- 16 Henry Schein's existing business.
- 17 I don't think in retrospect that Henry Schein
- 18 would have done business with them under those
- 19 circumstances.
- Q. Kurt, could you pull up CX 2226, please.
- 21 And this is an e-mail you were asked about a
- 22 moment ago regarding the Klear Impakt buying group. Do
- 23 you recall that?
- 24 A. I do.
- Q. When you write, "We hit the pause button in

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 January," what did you mean by that?
- 2 A. Meaning that there were still several points
- 3 of the agreement that we needed to work out. If I
- 4 recall specifically, they were education, how
- 5 Klear Impakt was going to deliver education or push
- 6 through Henry Schein business solutions education to
- 7 their member base.
- 8 Q. Was Henry Schein actually doing business with
- 9 Klear Impakt as of January of that year?
- 10 A. I don't recall. I don't recall one way or the
- 11 other. I think we didn't finalize the agreement until
- 12 somewhat later. However, the principals were doing
- 13 business with Henry Schein.
- 14 Q. Now, Kurt, if you could please pull up CX 2235,
- 15 please.
- 16 And you recall being asked about this document
- 17 a moment ago, Ms. Titus?
- 18 A. I do.
- 19 Q. And can you please read to me what the subject
- 20 line of this document is.
- 21 A. Pacific Group Management Services Henry Schein
- 22 agreement, and it has the date and the file name.
- 23 Q. Ms. Titus, were you talking about anything
- 24 other than PGMS in this document?
- 25 A. I was talking specifically about PGMS, the

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 subject line of the e-mail.
- Q. Kurt, if you could please pull up CX 0260,
- 3 please.
- 4 If you could go to page 2.
- 5 And Ms. Titus, you were read a sentence from an
- 6 e-mail authored by Mr. Russ Baker in which he wrote,
- 7 "It is my understanding that this violates our policy
- 8 as we do not engage with GPO's."
- 9 Do you see that?
- 10 A. I do.
- 11 0. Is that an accurate statement?
- 12 A. It is not.
- Q. Did Henry Schein in fact engage with GPOs?
- 14 A. In fact, we did. For the entire time that I
- 15 worked for Henry Schein.
- Q. Was there any policy not to engage with GPOs?
- 17 A. There was not.
- 18 Q. Is Mr. Russ Baker just wrong?
- 19 A. Mr. Russ Baker was a regional manager. I don't
- 20 think he had knowledge or exposure to buying groups in
- 21 general.
- 22 Q. And Ms. Titus, this e-mail references the
- 23 Dental Gator buying group.
- 24 Did Schein actually continue to do business
- 25 with the Dental Gator buying group?

Benco Dental Supply, et al.

2/8/2019

- 1 A. We did.
- Q. And Kurt, if you could please pull up
- 3 CX 2133.
- If you can go to the second page, please.
- 5 And you were asked, Ms. Titus, about a sentence
- 6 in Mr. Brady's e-mail in which he said, "According to
- 7 Kathleen, who spent an hour last Friday telling me why
- 8 this is NOT a GPO (they're building 30 denovos in next
- 9 12 months where they will have a MSO presence and what
- 10 I gathered to be ownership equity in all locations)."
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. I do.
- Q. Did Breakaway actually have ownership equity in
- 14 all locations?
- 15 A. No, they did not.
- 16 Breakaway corporate had I think approximately
- 17 eight locations that they had either equity or fully
- 18 owned practices.
- 19 Q. And those practices were only owned by the
- 20 actual owner of Breakaway; right?
- 21 A. That's right. Dr. Scott Luene.
- 22 Q. And all the other members of Breakaway were not
- 23 owned offices; correct?
- 24 A. That is correct.
- Q. So this statement in Mr. Brady's e-mail never

Benco Dental	Supply	y, et al.
--------------	--------	-----------

2/8/2019

- 1 came to be; correct?
- 2 A. That is right.
- Q. To your knowledge, did Breakaway continue to
- 4 operate as a buying group?
- 5 A. They did.
- 6 Q. Did Breakaway -- did Henry Schein ever close
- 7 down doing business with Breakaway?
- 8 A. We did not.
- 9 MS. FINCHER: Thank you. No further
- 10 questions.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Anything further?
- MS. GOFF: Nothing. Thank you, Your Honor.
- JUDGE CHAPPELL: Thank you, ma'am. You may
- 14 stand down.
- We'll reconvene Wednesday at 0945.
- We're in recess.
- 17 (Whereupon, the foregoing hearing was adjourned
- 18 at 4:33 p.m.)

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER		
2			
3			
4	I, JOSETT F. WHALEN, do hereby certify that the		
5	foregoing proceedings were taken by me in stenotype and		
6	thereafter reduced to typewriting under my supervision;		
7	that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed		
8	by any of the parties to the action in which these		
9	proceedings were taken; and further, that I am not a		
10	relative or employee of any attorney or counsel		
11	employed by the parties hereto, nor financially or		
12	otherwise interested in the outcome of the action.		
13			
14	Jasett F. duhalon		
15	Joseph . Whaten		
16	JOSETT F. WHALEN		
17	Court Reporter		
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			